

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

NATIONAL COMMISSION ON
ACQUIRED IMMUNE DEFICIENCY SYNDROME

* * *

Pages 1 thru 229
Volume 1

San Francisco, California
May 16, 1991

MILLER REPORTING COMPANY, INC.
507 C Street, N.E.
Washington, D.C. 20002
546-6666

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NATIONAL COMMISSION ON AIDS

HEARINGS

VOLUME I

San Francisco Hilton Hotel
333 O'Farrell Street
San Francisco, California

Thursday, May 16, 1991

REPORTER: MICHAEL C. LYSAUGHT, II
Jim Higgins and Associates
San Francisco, California

MILLER REPORTING COMPANY
507 C Street, N. E.
Washington, D. C. 20002
(202) 546-6666

1 **NATIONAL COMMISSION ON AIDS**

2
3 **HEARINGS**

4
5 **THURSDAY, MAY 16, 1991**

6
7 **VOLUME I**

8 The hearing was convened, pursuant to
9 notice, at 8:30 a.m., in Plaza Room A, San Francisco
10 Hilton Hotel, 333 O'Farrell Street, San Francisco,
11 California, JUNE E. OSBORN, M. D., Chairman, presiding.

12 **MEMBERS PRESENT:**

13 DIANE AHRENS

14 SCOTT ALLEN

15 HONORABLE DICK CHENEY, by

16 MICHAEL R. PETERSEN, M.D.

17 HARLTON L. DALTON, ESQ.

18 HONORABLE EDWARD J. DERWINSKI by

19 CAMILLE BARRY, PH. D.

20 EUNICE DIAZ, M.S., M.P.H.

21 DONALD S. GOLDMAN, ESQ.

22 LARRY KESSLER

23 CHARLES KONIGSBERG, M.D., M.P.H.

24 BELINDA MASON

25 ooo

I N D E X

1		<u>PAGE</u>
2	<u>AGENDA:</u>	
3	Welcome - Honorable Art Agnos, Mayor City of San Francisco	4
4	Opening Remarks -- June E. Osborne, M. D., Chair	7
5	Remarks - Larry Kessler, Commissioner	8
6	<u>American Society and Sexuality</u>	9
7	Reginald Fennell, Ph. D.	
	David Lourea, Ed. D.	
8	Pepper Schwartz, Ph. D.	
9	<u>The Experience of "Sexually-Identified" Communities</u>	73
	Autumn Courtney	
10	Paul Davis	
	Marjorie Hill, Ph. D.	
11	Sue Hyde	
	Richard La Fortune	
12	Eric E. Rofes	
13	<u>The Response of "Sexually-Identified Communities to the HIV Epidemic</u>	117
14	David Barr	
	Paul Bonenberg	
15	Jerome Boyce	
	Valli Kanuha, M.S.W.	
16	Jose Perez	
	Maxine Wolfe	
17	<u>Sexuality, HIV and Government Policy</u>	171
18	Daniel Bross	
	Miguel Gomez	
19	Tim Mc Feeley	
	Tim Offutt	
20	Carmen Vasquez, M.S.Ed.	
21	<u>Public Comments</u>	216
22		
23		
24		
25		

P R O C E E D I N G S

8:30 a.m.

WELCOME

HONORABLE ART AGNOS, MAYOR

CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Madam Chair, Member of the Commission:

I would like to express our appreciation to you and the staff of the National Commission on AIDS for holding these hearings in San Francisco.

San Francisco, by necessity, has had to be a city and a citizenry that set the pace in responding to the HIV epidemic. We had no choice because the pace was set by the progress of this epidemic itself.

During your hearings, you will learn from the lesbian and gay community of the pioneering and courageous work they did to inform the public and care for those in need. Those efforts, begun ten years ago, continue to be pioneering in reaching a new generation and those who have been outside the community itself.

While our city is recognized for the respect accorded to each community in a diverse city, it is also true that we have worked hard to create a strong consensus for the frank educational materials and posters meant to underscore the seriousness of this epidemic. The new consensus data also informs us that Asians and Pacific

1 Islanders are the largest community of color in our city.
2 I believe the information that the Asian and Pacific
3 Islander community groups can provide the Commission will
4 be important to your mission and to our city.

5 In welcoming you today, I would like to
6 personally bring to the attention of the Commission two
7 steps now underway which I believe are important to your
8 work.

9 Shortly, I will sign a newly-approved health
10 insurance program for city employees. For the first time,
11 it will permit eligibility for domestic partners of our
12 city employees. As we took this step toward fairness, we
13 recognized that there are some who are uncertain about the
14 impact of HIV on insurance costs. We believe that our
15 work goes a long way toward answering those issues. In
16 fact, I might note to the Commission that Kaiser
17 Permanente, the largest provider of health care to our
18 city employees, proposed rates based on their belief that
19 HIV would add no additional costs -- but that new
20 pregnancy and infant health costs will be added because of
21 heterosexual domestic partners.

22 Among those who reviewed our cost estimates
23 is Dr. Robert Anderson, chair of the Economics Department
24 of the University of California at Berkeley, and I would
25 be pleased to forward his report to the Commission.

1 I want to underscore that one of the ongoing
2 issues that all cities face is the cost of providing care
3 for those without insurance. And step we can take to see
4 that more people have access to insurance and health care
5 ought to be welcomed, and in particular, ought to be part
6 of a comprehensive approach to meeting this epidemic.

7 The second step we have taken follows a
8 recommendation of the Mayor's Task Force on the HIV
9 Epidemic which I appointed. One recommendation was that
10 the city establish a Standards of Care Committee to
11 recommend standards of practice in therapy. The committee
12 was appointed and issued recommendations last winter.
13 Those recommendations were forwarded to physicians
14 throughout the city. They also became the basis for
15 discussion between our Health Department and the
16 California Department of Health Services as we urged them
17 to add more treatments to the Medi-Cal formulary.

18 I am pleased to report that the California
19 Department of Health Services is taking our
20 recommendations very seriously, and appointed its own
21 committee which includes many members of the San Francisco
22 Standards of Care Committee. I am hopeful that the
23 outcome will be the addition of new treatments,
24 particularly for preventing pneumocystis pneumonia, which
25 will be both cost-effective and less toxic for those who

1 use them.

2 This morning I am pleased to provide a copy
3 of the recommendations of the Standards of Care Committee
4 to you. This committee will continue to provide updated
5 recommendations as needed.

6 Again, I believe that it is important that
7 we keep as far forward as we can in seeing that the best
8 available treatments reach those in need, and become part
9 of standard medical practice with full reimbursements.

10 I appreciate very much the Commission's
11 interest in our efforts and your presence in the city for
12 these hearings.

13 Thank you.

14 DR. OSBORN: We are very pleased to be so
15 nicely welcomed, and we look forward to receiving the
16 materials that you mentioned. It could be an important
17 part of our program.

18 MAYOR AGNOS: You're welcome.

19 DR. OSBORN: I want to make my opening
20 remarks quite brief because we have an important set of
21 witnesses to hear from today. Indeed, I will simply
22 comment that I pass along the regrets of Dr. David Rogers,
23 the vice-chairman of the Commission, who is briefly
24 unwell, and I think is improving rapidly; but, on the
25 other hand, can't be with us during these hearings and

1 sends his regrets.

2 There are a couple of other commissioners
3 who have not been able to join us. I want to express
4 welcome to Dr. Camille Barry, who is sitting in,
5 representing the Department of Veterans Affairs. Erwin
6 Krinik (phonetic) will be back with us tomorrow, but Dr.
7 Barry is with us today.

8 We will be having a format in which we have,
9 I hope, free-ranging discussion. Before I say more about
10 that, let me ask Commissioner Kessler if he would like to
11 make some remarks in opening?

12 MR. KESSLER: Thank you, Dr. Osborn.

13 My task this morning, I think, is to invite
14 the commissioners to what I think is an historic hearing
15 for us. We are particularly blessed this day to have not
16 only few from San Francisco, but across the country, who
17 can be called justly experts and pioneers in this sort of
18 process of thinking, of exploring, of expanding not only
19 the community consciousness, but also the commissioners
20 and the country, so that we can get over one of the major
21 hurdles that has led to the expansion of the delays that
22 we may not be proud of.

23 So, I ask the commissioners, on behalf of
24 the community-based organizations around the country, and
25 with particular pride in the gay and lesbian community's

1 efforts, I welcome all of our testifiers, our guests, and
2 I welcome the full participation of the Commission, as
3 well.

4 DR. OSBORN: Thank you, Larry.

5 We are going to have a series of panels this
6 morning, and we want the panelists, as collective group,
7 to be participants. In order to provide degrees of focus,
8 we're going to have people, as we do in this first setting
9 already, join us at the table, that part of the table,
10 when their specific panel is involved. Other panelists
11 are sitting, however, along the side. I think the idea is
12 that we will all get the benefit of all of your thoughts
13 as we go, but with some focus.

14 The first panel talking to us will be in
15 this order: Dr. Pepper Schwartz; Dr. David Lourea; and
16 Dr. Reginald Fennell. Welcome, and we look forward to
17 your remarks.

18 AMERICAN SOCIETY AND SEXUALITY

19 Reginald Fennell, Ph. D. David Lourea, Ed. D.

20 Pepper Schwartz, Ph. D.

21 DR. SCHWARTZ: Thank you.

22 The mandate I was given was to sort of lay
23 some groundwork about sexuality in our society in five
24 minutes. So, given that we all understand the task, I
25 will say some remarks and hope that the things that

1 interest you most can be addressed and discussed in the
2 rest of your meetings, as well.

3 When we talk about sexuality, we generally
4 embarrass or threaten the vast majority of listeners. I'm
5 not going to go into why this legacy of our Judeo-
6 Christian past seems to have such tenacity. I won't,
7 unless you ask me directly about it. But sufficed to say,
8 right now, that it does. Not that you need a Judeo-
9 Christian tradition of guilt, sin, and fear of women to
10 suppress sex. Most totalitarian societies make sure they
11 control sex. Because sex is really the mark of
12 individualism. It is the thing that we do most
13 personally, most privately, most ungoverned. And, to
14 govern it is to govern human behavior.

15 In a society like ours, based on capitalism,
16 achievement and discipline, sex is upsetting. First, it's
17 a loss of discipline. It's proof of our animal natures;
18 proof of our propensity to act, rather than think. It's a
19 positive blot against our rationality. We have bodily
20 functions and we fear them. We fear acknowledging them,
21 we fear doing them. We fear doing them badly. We are
22 disappointed in our bodies, fear of our fantasies, and
23 usually without information or education to guide us.

24 Western culture has no sexual folk wisdom to
25 pass among generations, unlike some. For example: A

1 friend of mine, who is a Plains Indian, tells coyote
2 stories that are explicit sexual stories about what to do
3 and what not to do, handed through generations. Most of
4 the kind of conversations we have are abstract at best,
5 misleading at worst, and often have technical terms like
6 sort of "wash down there."

7 In particular, we hope to be adequate men
8 and women, which is involved with our sexuality, and most
9 men and women aren't sure that they reach adequacy. We
10 have no tolerance for ambiguity, which life absolutely
11 requires. This explains, I think, some of our most
12 vehement feelings. We're all afraid of the feelings that
13 disturb the social order. To love, we think is good;
14 mostly, we think of it as leading to marriage in a
15 heterosexual mind-set. But passion, which implies loss of
16 control, is threatening. Seduction, which fits into the
17 orderly evolution of society is good; but, sex, which may
18 have some other purposes, is troubling.

19 Now, we are all reintroduced to the historic
20 meaning of sex, which we wanted to forget: The linkage of
21 sex with sex. Hard to accept for a generation born
22 between 1945 and 1960. A generation in which syphilis was
23 tamed and remediable. A generation whom sex meant
24 freedom, adulthood, rule and role breaking. A generation
25 of heterosexual women who demanded and got the right to

1 have sex without reproduction.

2 Homosexuality, it is true, by and large is
3 not reproductive. That must refer the average person's
4 reaction to sex, which is troubling; and passion, which is
5 even more troubling. And now we're left with the specter
6 of death, which is terrifying.

7 Bisexuality occurs not only with involved
8 reaction; but, since it requires tolerance of ambiguity,
9 it's often upsetting to both heterosexuals and homosexuals
10 so that it's very existence has been denied. Longer,
11 concrete categories in this society. It's the one
12 homosexual act which heterosexuals need to classify for
13 homosexual. That one heterosexual act, which homosexuals
14 dismiss and describe themselves as bisexuals. It seems if
15 one dropped the homosexuality in our society, it would be
16 much more closer to correct to drop the heterosexuality.

17 All of this, of course, went to the few
18 rather interesting time to calculate how many gay people
19 are gay, and so on, in the midst of the other countries in
20 any given year. And, I'm not going to take up my time to
21 go on too much about the study. But, in fact, only random
22 samples you get to look at are not in this country. They
23 are in Great Britain, France, Scandinavia. And they
24 really range quite dramatically from about 3 to 4 percent
25 of the population to about 15 percent, everyone having

1 ever had a homosexual act.

2 This is just real fast, but just to remind
3 you. It goes from 1 to 6, with 1 being completely
4 heterosexual, with 6 being completely homosexual. But,
5 you are in the 5, let's say, on the scale of homosexual,
6 with slight heterosexual experience, the label you get is
7 not behavioral. It's a label of an identity. So that we
8 lose cognizance that there are people who are 5, or 2.
9 But, rather we polarize their identity and we no longer
10 keep track of their behavior. Moreover, those behaviors
11 operate outside the perimeter. Moreover, we tend to not
12 look at how people categorize themselves, and so we look
13 for the way people behave.

14 Spanish male farm workers, approximately 50
15 percent of them were having sex with men, and no one of
16 them was thought of as homosexual. Moreover, they
17 certainly did not -- they used condoms and personal items
18 with their wives, but certainly wouldn't produce it. That
19 was, of course, okay when there was barriers between high-
20 risk populations and low-risk populations. Those barriers
21 have diminished, but those people do not see themselves
22 at-risk because they are not being homosexual.

23 In a study I remember of Greek men, from a
24 Greek community, one of my favorite quotes there was a
25 Greek man who said, "We have three types of Greek men in

1 Greece: We have men -- I'm not going to use his actual
2 words --

3 (Laughter.)

4 You will excuse the sanitization. You want
5 to talk about this over coffee, we can do it differently.

6 He said, "We have men who penetrate men. We
7 have men who penetrate women, and then we have queers."

8 And I said, "What do you mean?"

9 He says, "Well, the queers are the men who
10 were penetrated." In his point of view, and in the view
11 of this community, there was no such thing as
12 homosexuality unless you were on the receiving end of
13 penetration.

14 So, how we -- our meanings and our
15 definitions and our behaviors and our identity, none of
16 these things really link up, and, yet, we try and
17 categorize nice, neat categories because they help us
18 count, they help us define, and, so some extent, they help
19 us put away the reality of human sexuality out of our ken.
20 Rather conveniently, however, we drop this idea of sexual
21 essences, that people are really only one thing only,
22 when we are figuring out legal and policy approaches to
23 dealing with our prejudices. Are homosexuals born and not
24 made? Then, let them live their lives in peace, since no
25 one is, quote, unquote, "at risk." But, if they are made

1 and not born, then, let's assume there is a continuum of
2 sexual preference out there, and we really have a great
3 many different kinds of desires and possibilities within
4 us. That scene is usually rejected and threatening; and,
5 yet, we base policy as if it were true.

6 What is the real continuum of behaviors?
7 I'm here to tell you what you probably know: We have an
8 inadequate data on almost all of those kinds of questions.
9 Anything I give you is tentative and in process. The best
10 statistics we have, the best studies we have, are on
11 teenage sexuality and fertility. Why? Because we are
12 interested in family. We're interested in reproduction.
13 We're interested in the control of fertility. When you
14 want to talk about sexual statistics that have nothing to
15 do with fertility, we get much less wonderful studies.
16 They are less national; they are less random; they are
17 less highly funded.

18 I actually had some statistics here about
19 age of intercourse for young people. I am going to skip
20 it. I think my colleague to the left is going to talk
21 some about that.

22 What I can give you and what I'm again going
23 to pull for a moment -- because I don't want to go on too
24 long -- are a little bit of the studies about what kinds
25 of people are having sex, how often and with whom, from

1 smaller studies, nonrandom studies. But, I will be glad
2 to answer questions about that, if this is something you'd
3 like to go into.

4 I think germane to the interest of this
5 committee, however, is to what extent homosexual and
6 heterosexual people cross over and have sex with each
7 other; to what extent sex goes outside of a closed loop of
8 monogamous relationships so that, to some extent, disease
9 dissemination is most likely. And, again, we have
10 untrustworthy data; but, in a nutshell, I will tell what I
11 think we know.

12 Most people, the general average
13 heterosexual in this society has maybe three or four
14 partners before marriage. That's the general. We always
15 have people who are doing more than their share. There
16 has been some very interesting epidemiological studies to
17 show that there are often sort of sociometric stars, that
18 is: people who have sex with a great many people so that,
19 on one person's category, who has three or four sex
20 partners in their life, this person is likely to show up.
21 And that person, however, is atypical and has had hundreds
22 of sexual partners. What that person's health status is,
23 of course, is extremely important. They do more than
24 their share in a number of ways.

25 The number of people who have sex out of

1 wedlock, among heterosexuals, is one of those statistics
2 that is extremely unreliable. We have a number of
3 studies. There is a study by Andy Greeley that was a
4 random study done through the aegis of a magazine, but it
5 was a random study, where he comes up with only about 10
6 percent nonmarital sexuality. On the other hand, most
7 studies have come up with something more like 25 to 30
8 percent. So, take it for what it's worth.

9 A recent Kinsey Institute, looking at gay
10 people, showed about two-thirds of homosexual men have had
11 sex with a woman; about one-third have been married
12 sometime in their life; three-fourths have had at least
13 one encounter with a married man; 20 percent of lesbians
14 have been previously married. And, in a study of over a
15 thousand lesbians in four major cities, 50 percent have
16 had at least one new male sex partner, since 1980. And
17 there is a more than average chance that sex partner will
18 be a gay male.

19 So, there is a lot of sex going on. We try
20 and recognize some of it. We don't like to look at other
21 parts of it, depending on how it fits our national norms.
22 And being naive in having watched the politics of birth
23 control nationally and internationally, sex education and
24 AIDS education, it therefore does not pay for me to be too
25 aggressive in my recommendations; nonetheless, consider

1 this:

2 Without sex education, there is haphazard
3 contraception, and there is no assurance of instruction in
4 health behaviors. With education, we have seen somewhat
5 more use of condoms, slower entrance into sex. With
6 recognizing sex, and address the consequences, and without
7 being clear about the diversity, continuum, and the
8 ability of sexual behavior, we can't hope to have a proper
9 study of people. And without acknowledging our passionate
10 and sometimes foolhardy nature, we cannot give a pragmatic
11 approach to sexuality. And the refusal to deal with
12 reality, we can't and often don't state an outcome,
13 especially now, especially because of AIDS.

14 DR. OSBORN: Thank you, Dr. Schwartz.

15 Our request for our panelists to be brief is
16 not because we don't think we could learn a great deal
17 more, if we could hear from them longer; but, rather, so
18 that we can get a chance to interact. We appreciate your
19 willingness to live with that constraint.

20 Dr. Lourea.

21 DR. LOUREA: Thank you.

22 In 1975, when I decided to pursue a
23 doctorate degree in sexology, I assured my family that one
24 of the benefits of being a doctor in the field of human
25 sexuality is that sex is never a life and death event, and

1 never an emergency; and no one is ever likely to call me
2 at 3:00 a.m. in the middle of a crisis situation.

3 Regrettably, today, the choices we make concerning our
4 sexual options often do involve life and death decisions.
5 And, on more than a few occasions, I have needed to
6 respond to anxiety calls in the middle of the night.

7 In order to understand the role sexuality
8 plays in American society, it is important to remember
9 that, until the 1930s, sexual information on human
10 sexuality was locked behind the closed doors of libraries
11 because it was deemed unfit reading for the general
12 public. Only medical doctors had access to the research
13 that was available.

14 It is generally conceded that modern sex
15 education began in the 1930s when a group of students at
16 the University of Indiana protested the moralistic
17 attitudes that kept knowledge unavailable to them and
18 demanded a course on the nature and understanding of human
19 sexual functioning. The powers that be at the University
20 of Indiana tried to figure out how they could give the
21 students what they wanted without giving them what they
22 wanted. They decided to offer several lectures on the
23 biological aspects of sex and marriage, but had a few
24 qualifications for the person who would give those
25 lectures. First of all, he had to be an empirical

1 scientist, whose methodology was impeccable. Second, his
2 personal behavior and moral standing in the community had
3 to be unblemished and beyond reproach. And last and most
4 important, he had to be a dull and uninteresting speaker,
5 so as not to in any way arouse the passions of the
6 students.

7 The professor they chose was a zoologist,
8 who had classified over 500 species of gold wasps. The
9 gold wasps are insects that reproduce asexually. He was
10 one of the first ten Eagle Scouts in the United States,
11 and we know that their moral fiber is upstanding and
12 beyond reproach. And he was not a very dynamic speaker.
13 His name, of course, was Alfred Kinsey.

14 Turning to the professional publications in
15 the field, he discovered that most of the information was
16 highly speculative and based on inadequate statistical
17 samples. The available literature could not answer some
18 of the simplest questions put to him by his students. No
19 one had ever actually sat down and asked people what it is
20 they do sexually. Kinsey, therefore, realized the need
21 for a major new study on human sexuality. The results of
22 that study, Sexual Behavior in the Human Male, published
23 in 1948, and Sexual Behavior in the Human Female,
24 published in 1953, marked the true beginnings of the
25 movement for sexual freedom. Although it created a great

1 deal of controversy, it showed people that their sexual
2 actions were not unique; that, what they did sexually, was
3 also being done by others.

4 One of the important movements to influence
5 the sex field was the humanistic psychological movement,
6 which suggested that people have as much right to feel as
7 they do to think. The Civil Rights Movement, the Feminist
8 Movement, The Gay Liberation Movement has profound effect
9 on the relationships between the same people, and had one
10 thing in common: a strong desire to see all persons
11 treated as equals, with the right to feel good about
12 themselves and to live lifestyles which best suit them
13 without societal interference.

14 Another push to the sex field came with
15 publication of Human Sexual Response in 1966, and Human
16 Sexual Inadequacy in 1970, by Dr. William Masters and
17 Virginia Johnson. This historic book, based on the
18 physiology of sexual response, did much to bring sex to
19 the attention of the medical community. While Kinsey
20 added to our knowledge of what people actually do
21 sexually, the Masters and Johnson showed us what actually
22 happens on a physiological level.

23 The National Sex Forum was created in 1968
24 to look at how people actually feel in relation to their
25 sexuality. What they discovered was that most of the sex

1 problems difficulties and disappointments in people's
2 lives are a result of a lack of accurate information,
3 accurate nonjudgmental sex-positive information, and
4 faulty attitudes and value structures. They developed a
5 sexual attitude restructuring process, designed for
6 educating adults about what people do sexually and how
7 they feel about it. Some of the assumptions they made
8 were: sex is managed today better than ever before in
9 history; that there is a growing belief that human
10 sexuality is potentially positive, joyous and an enriching
11 experience, as it relates to individuals making
12 commitments to their own sexuality, to their
13 sociosexuality, and to the sexuality as part of life.

14 With the concept of human sexuality, as
15 potentially good, comes the growing conviction that there
16 should be some programmatic forms of sex education. The
17 immediate problems of sex education are: (1) Who will
18 teach that?; (2) What will be taught?; and How will that
19 be taught?

20 Who will teach sexuality? The socially
21 accepted educators in the past have been parents, schools,
22 churches, and doctors. What was basically being taught
23 fell into two major categories: (1) reproductive biology,
24 via marriage manuals, doctors, schools, and school health
25 science courses; and, (2) the management of social

1 relationships, social etiquette, via marriage manuals,
2 school family life courses, church relationship
3 literature, and newspaper good advice columns.

4 Some of the problems of the present approach
5 was that reproductive biology represents something that
6 merely happens, rather than something that is experienced
7 or thought about; and, that it misrepresents the pleasures
8 and meanings sex. Most of the time, people do not have
9 sexual intercourse strictly for procreation. The problem
10 with management of social relationships have been that it
11 often becomes misinformed good advice, and often doesn't
12 take into account individual differences.

13 The most significant factor in sex education
14 is that sex can be talked about not clinically, but
15 casually and nonjudgmentally. If I am talking about
16 intervaginal containment, and you were using more explicit
17 language, we are not communicating. Individuals should be
18 allowed meaningful exposure to the realistic
19 objectification of the range of behavior into which their
20 own experiences, and those of other humans, fall.
21 Appropriate topics are: What humans actually do do, and
22 how they feel about it. People who teach, counsel, must
23 have a low version of sexual guilt feelings so as to be
24 of service to those whom they teach, counsel or give
25 advice, and not serving their own needs.

1 If there is mistrust from sexual minorities
2 towards the traditional sources of sexual information, it
3 is important to keep in mind that those of us whose
4 sexuality does not fall into the narrow moralistic
5 confines of that which is currently socially accepted, we
6 have a long history of being ashamed, abused and
7 persecuted (1), by the state, who has labeled our
8 sexuality criminal and illegal; by the church that has
9 condemned us as sinful and immoral; by the psychiatric
10 profession that has pronounced us mental ill, immature, or
11 insane; and by the medical profession that has related to
12 us, either verbally or nonverbally, as unhealthy and
13 diseased. To counteract this distrust, it is important
14 that safer sex instructors understand that sex plays a
15 very important in each person's life; that sexual
16 fantasies, desires, dreams, should be recognized as a
17 valuable and integral parts of each person's sexuality;
18 that sex can and should be discussed casually and
19 nonjudgmentally.

20 Individuals can enrich their own sex lives
21 by learning about the full range of sexual behavior.
22 Individuals have the right to all the facts. Everyone has
23 the right to a good sex life, including those persons who
24 have physical disabilities, such as paraplegics,
25 diabetics, amputees, heart patients, those of us with HIV

1 disease, or mental or emotional problems. Sexuality is
2 the most individualistic part of a person's life. It is
3 up to each individual to determine, and then to assume
4 responsibility, for her or his own sexuality. All the
5 varying modes of expression are available to everyone, as
6 long as most people know what they are doing and feel good
7 about it and don't harm others.

8 To experience a healthy and fulfilling sex
9 life, we need to learn about and appreciate our own
10 bodies, know our feelings and our own sexual responses,
11 become sensitive to the physical and emotional needs of
12 others, and to develop meaningful, intimate contacts in
13 our sexual relationships.

14 Thank you.

15 DR. OSBORN: Thank you, Dr. Lourea.

16 Dr. Fennell.

17 DR. FENNELL: Thank you.

18 When I think about knowledge and attitudes
19 and sexuality, I am going to specifically make my remarks
20 in reference to the college population, since I'm a
21 college professor. I am going to try to do them within
22 that context, although I will talk some about what's
23 happening with the American teenagers.

24 As a professor, if I had to assign a grade
25 for sexuality and knowledge, or knowledge of sexuality to

1 college students -- and this is looking at other studies
2 and also the work that I've been doing -- I would probably
3 give them a grade of a D-plus. That may be a minus. My
4 students tell me I'm not nice --

5 (Laughter.)

6 -- and I probably would just give them a
7 grade of an F, which is unfortunate. The president of
8 Planned Parenthood, in her writings, has said that
9 American teens are sexually active, but sexually
10 illiterate. I think that almost sums it up, and I would
11 end there; but, since I have this time, I won't do that.

12 (Laughter.)

13 In addition, there have been several studies
14 that have pointed out that college students are still
15 found failing to take precautions against HIV infection
16 because of their immortality complex, or the feeling that
17 it can't happen to me. In 1991, this is still going on,
18 despite all the efforts that many of us in this room have
19 undertaken.

20 What I want to do is to mention some of the
21 -- highlight some of the statistics that have been
22 compiled by the Center for Population Options, that talks
23 about sexuality in America.

24 It's been said, or it's been found that the
25 average young woman has engaged in sexual intercourse by

1 the age of 16.2. The average for a young men is 15.7.
2 Now, if we were to look at inner city youth, that average
3 is even much younger than that. For a Black or African-
4 American teen, being about 11.8 years in some inner
5 cities. In addition to that, usually the decision to have
6 sex is a spontaneous one for young Americans. It is not
7 something that is planned. About 17 percent of women and
8 25 percent of young men, in fact, don't even plan their
9 first act of sexual intercourse. About one in six -- and
10 my students always act so surprised when I say these kinds
11 of things. About one in six high school girls, according
12 to these studies that have been compiled from the Center
13 for Population Options, about one in six high school girls
14 have had at least four different encounters. That is high
15 school. In each year, about one in six teenagers
16 contracts a sexually-transmitted disease. Then, there are
17 other studies, too, that have shown that, in most --
18 although there is a small percentage of people that are
19 using contraception, in many of those cases, that choice
20 is not the use of condoms.

21 One of the things that I've been doing,
22 since 1987, on the college campus where I am working, is,
23 that, I've been teaching a credit course on HIV infection
24 and AIDS, mainly on the education and prevention. It is
25 still interesting that, since I've been doing that since

1 1987, and prior to that I taught human sexuality for a
2 couple of years, it is still interesting to walk into a
3 classroom at the beginning of the semester -- we could
4 even take this one -- and find that I still have to go
5 through a lot of the myths and misconceptions that
6 students have about HIV infection. I was explaining to my
7 colleagues right before we started that not as many, but I
8 still find myself having to try to look at the myths and
9 misconceptions that students have about, for example, the
10 fact that you cannot contract HIV infections from swimming
11 pools.

12 Some work has been done by the American
13 School Health Association, which stated that about --
14 these numbers, I think, change -- but only about 25 school
15 require health education for high school graduation; and
16 about the same number -- although I think it has increased
17 some -- require HIV education for graduation.

18 So, what I find on college campuses around
19 the country is, that, the majority of students, who are
20 matriculating to college campuses, still have not had an
21 HIV education. So, there is a great need for it at the
22 college campus.

23 Some work that was done by the American
24 College Health Association, with a cooperative agreement
25 from the Centers for Disease Control -- and perhaps many

1 of us have heard this -- they tested anonymous blood
2 samples from 19 different college campuses and found that
3 2 per 1,000 of these blood samples were HIV infected.
4 That study is being repeated now on other campuses. We
5 don't know if we can generalize that data or not. But, if
6 we could, what it would potentially mean is: 2 per 1,000
7 students, on any given college campus -- and it may be
8 higher in some areas than others -- could be HIV infected.

9 We have all heard other statistics, too,
10 about the number of teenage pregnancies that occur each
11 year, and the number of those that are unintended. With
12 that kind of information, my question is: How do we reach
13 people who say to me, and who say to us, that, well, this
14 isn't something that happens to me; it is something that
15 happens to people from lower-class neighborhoods, or it
16 happens to minority groups, or it happens to gays and
17 lesbians, or to gays? And unfortunately, those kinds of
18 comments are still being said. However, when we look at
19 the STD rate, we know that students are definitely at-risk
20 for HIV infection.

21 How do we reach these students? I mean,
22 that's a question that I think that many of us are
23 wrestling with. How do we get these students to
24 understand that they actually are at-risk when there have
25 been several -- although they are nonrandom studies; but

1 there have been several studies, some of which have been
2 mentioned here so far this morning.

3 Well, one that I always like to highlight to
4 my students is: one of the things that sometimes we give
5 out as educators, and I try not to do this unless I
6 qualify it anymore, is: We say to people to get to know
7 your partners better. Well, know, we're getting into
8 euphemisms. Because, for some college students, that may
9 mean, well, go out on two or three dates instead of having
10 sex after the first date. And, then, even after we told
11 them to get to know their partners better, what does that
12 really mean?

13 There is the work that came from Cochran and
14 Mays that looked at dishonesty in dating. And, in the
15 study that they had, it was 422 sexually-active college
16 students. And, 34 percent of the men and 10 percent of
17 the women admitted to telling a lie in order to have sex.
18 Those are the ones that admitted to telling a lie. And,
19 then, 68 percent of the men, and 59 percent of the women,
20 said that, even though they were involved with one person,
21 they didn't tell that person they were having sex with
22 that they were also, at the same time, having sex with
23 another person.

24 So, getting to know your partner better,
25 what does that really mean?

1 One other point from that study, and I
2 always highlight this with my students, too, is: 20
3 percent of the men, 20 percent, and 4 percent of the
4 women, say that they would lie about their HIV antibody
5 status, if they were asked.

6 And then, one other study that I want to
7 highlight -- I don't want to sound too academic -- is from
8 the Kinsey Institute. These would differ a little from
9 what other sources said in terms of number of partners.
10 They did a study, a nonrandom sample of over 800 students,
11 and they found that, on the average from this sample, the
12 average number of lifetime partners for college females
13 was six, with three one-night stands. The average number
14 of college lifetime partners for the college male was
15 eleven partners, with five one-night stands. One of the
16 things that also was highlighted in this, which is good
17 for me to stress, since I'm from what some would consider
18 the Midwest, being in Ohio, to quote from this study. I
19 always like to quote this, being from Ohio, when I'm
20 talking -- particularly if I am in the areas of the
21 country that are in the Midwest. The quote from this
22 study from the Kinsey Institute said: Heterosexual
23 college students, even in the Midwest, have unprotected
24 vaginal and anal intercourse with several partners. Even
25 in the Midwest, we do have sex in the Midwest.

1 (Laughter.)

2 In addition to this, this isn't -- and some
3 of the points that are being made here, I think will be
4 made throughout the next two days, is not looking at the
5 fact that, on college campuses, we do have diverse
6 populations in terms of sexual orientation. So, in terms
7 of what kinds of things I think perhaps need to come out
8 of this, or that needs to be done, are actually six or
9 seven things that I think should be looked at
10 specifically. I say these in terms of recommendations,
11 but these are certainly up for discussion, which is why we
12 are here this morning.

13 One of the first ones I would say is: Given
14 the fact that many of the students who matriculate onto
15 college campuses have not had health education or HIV
16 education before they graduated from high school, I think
17 something needs to be done to suggest strongly to
18 institutions of higher education that they have trained
19 individuals -- and I probably have a bias, since I'm a
20 health educator; and that has to be taken in that context
21 -- that they have trained health educators who can provide
22 sexual health information to students. There are
23 certainly some excellent examples around the country where
24 institutions have done this, such as Dr. Richard Keenan at
25 the University of Virginia, in their Student Health

1 Center, with peer educators and individuals who are hired
2 to do sexual health education. That would be one of
3 those: to have trained individuals on the campuses who
4 can provide sexual health information.

5 Another one, which still evokes a lot of
6 controversy -- and I even know this from my campus this
7 semester -- and that is: To recommend that colleges and
8 universities make condoms accessible in the least
9 restrictive and nonthreatening manner. They need to be
10 accessible in a least restrictive and nonthreatening
11 manner.

12 One of the studies from JAMA, that was just
13 out last year, said: some of the factors that were
14 associated with not using condoms included embarrassment
15 over discussing them with partners. Since this still is a
16 factor, there has to be something to create a standard or
17 norm among young people that, if you're going to have sex,
18 this becomes a norm or a standard, so that we can get rid
19 of some of that embarrassment.

20 Another one that I would suggest would be
21 that colleges and universities need to recognize that
22 campuses do have diverse students, and that not all of the
23 students on campuses are heterosexual, and that there are
24 gay, lesbian and bisexual students on the campus who do
25 have needs. There should be individuals who are trained

1 to provide counseling and other services to those
2 students. I think an excellent example of that is, that,
3 last year, Ohio State University actually established an
4 office of gay, lesbian and bisexual services. Although
5 they received a lot of flack from some individuals about
6 having established that office, they said they will remain
7 strongfast and maintain that office. It's much like a lot
8 of campuses have set up offices for African-American
9 students or for Hispanic or Latino students, and for women
10 services. So, I think they are one of the first campuses
11 in the country to actually establish an office for gay,
12 lesbian and bisexual students. I think there is need for
13 other campuses to consider doing services such as that.

14 I think one of the things that seems to be
15 the hardest thing to do that I think needs to be done is:
16 I think we have to recognize, the colleges and
17 universities need to recognize, that students do have
18 diverse values, and that we need to teach students to
19 respect themselves and others. I think that is starkly
20 different from teaching morals. Somehow, we need to make
21 sure that we make that that difference is known in terms
22 of not -- we aren't trying to teach people more, but we
23 are trying to teach them values and respect for each
24 other.

25 One of the things that I think needs to be

1 done more of, and that is: college and universities I
2 think need to come up with strategies, or innovative
3 strategies, to make the consequences of unprotected sex
4 real to college students. I think, for too long, in
5 higher education, also in secondary education, it's been
6 this passive learning process where someone sits, someone
7 stands before a group of students, lined up in rows, and
8 tells them different information that they want them to
9 have. The students are, then, supposed to memorize this
10 and spit it back on a test. Well, I think that has to
11 change when it comes to, when we're talking about health
12 behavior, and particularly about behavior change. I
13 always like to use the adage, at least in what I do, is:
14 What I hear, I forget; what I see, I remember; and what I
15 do, I learn. So, some of the studies that are coming out
16 are saying that, what seems to have the most effect in
17 terms of reaching of people is when we are using peer
18 education, when we are using theatre groups, when we are
19 using humor.

20 One of the things that I've been known for,
21 at least on my campus and in some of the presentations
22 that I've done when I've had a chance to go around the
23 country, is: I use a lot of humor when I do
24 presentations. I think some studies have actually shown
25 that these can be effective. Humor is used because

1 studies are saying that people are, college students are
2 embarrassed to discuss these issues and to even say the
3 word "sex." It usually comes out as the word "it."

4 So, when I do my presentations, I'm known
5 for using a lot of props, so even here, I had to bring
6 props. Some of the things I deal in involve giving my
7 students -- and I know this embarrasses some people and it
8 offends people; but I even say to them that, if your HIV
9 education program is not controversial and if it's not
10 offending anyone, then, it's probably no good. I mean, if
11 we can sit in a room and discuss sexuality and someone
12 isn't offended, then, I would question that program.
13 Maybe in the year 2000 or 3000 it might happen.

14 So, one of the things that I do is, is I
15 give out different kinds of condoms. I mean, this some of
16 the many students haven't heard of, and this is a mint-
17 flavored one. It always gets their curiosity up, wanting
18 to know why is it mint flavored? We talk about that
19 later. If people want to ask questions, I'll answer that
20 later.

21 (Laughter.)

22 Another thing that has happened, too, as a
23 result of some of the things I do is: controversy
24 certainly has surrounded me and the kind of work that I've
25 done. Fortunately, for me, and this won't be the case

1 for all educators, that's why I think recommendations are
2 important when they go to colleges and universities and
3 say these kinds of things need to be done, and these are
4 the kinds of things that colleges and universities should
5 be doing. Fortunately, for me, probably like my
6 colleagues, my work is being published. I get a chance to
7 go around the county and speak. But some professors, who
8 may be trying to do these kinds of things, won't have that
9 kind of support to affirm the kind of work that they're
10 doing. That's why I think, sometimes, mandates or
11 recommendations can be helpful. I think this education
12 really needs to go to being comprehensive health
13 education. Not just sexuality education. I mean, I think
14 it's a well-known fact that, quite often, when young
15 people are engaging in sexual behavior, or sexual
16 intercourse, alcohol has been present. Which means now we
17 have to talk about regretted sex. We have to discuss
18 acquaintance rape, and rape and other issues. Because all
19 of those are interconnected. So, it can't just be an HIV
20 education program. It has to be a comprehensive health
21 program.

22 The last two things that I think are
23 important, too, is: despite all of these things, even
24 with the things that I do that use humor, there has to be
25 some kind of evaluation mechanism in place that documents

1 the effectiveness of these programs that we are putting
2 money into so that, if they are effective, then they can
3 be replicated by other campuses and other placed in the
4 country. And these programs -- this seems like a real
5 simple point, but it seems to be one that gets missed all
6 the time, and that is: these programs need to be
7 developed with and by students, or with and by the target
8 population. Quite often, when I've been asked to go to
9 different campuses and consult, it always surprises me
10 that people are -- especially in a budget crisis --
11 someone wants to bring me to their campus and tell them
12 how they can reach their students, and we have a meeting
13 and there are no students there, these programs need to
14 involve their target group and the students need to be
15 involved in the planning of the program and in helping to
16 implement the program if they are going to be effective.
17 I think it is a crucial point, but it's one that's looked
18 over all the time.

19 Thank you.

20 DR. OSBORN: Thank you very much, Dr.
21 Fennell.

22 I would ask Larry if he would be willing to
23 facilitate the discussion. Larry, I will turn it over to
24 you.

25 MR. KESSLER: Since this is a time for the

1 commissioners to ask questions and be involved, and we
2 have approximately 40 minutes, I would yield first to the
3 commissioners; but, then, I would like to have our guests
4 involved in this discussion, as well.

5 Before going to the Commission, I would like
6 to invite of the three of you to comment on, if you have
7 any comments and reflections on the presentations by your
8 counterparts. If you felt there was something, a theme
9 here that struck you that you would like to elaborate on,
10 feel free.

11 DR. SCHWARTZ: Well, one comment, comparing
12 college students to everybody else, they are more sexually
13 active than some of the rest of the population because
14 they have such an easy pool of eligible, a lot of
15 sexuality opportunities, and college is a great place for
16 opportunity. But, what I would want to emphasize from my
17 colleagues remarks here is, that, most of the things he
18 said about college students can be said about most people,
19 vis-a-vis, their preparedness for sexual behavior, both
20 their level of knowledge, their level of ability to
21 protect themselves, their impulsivity, their spontaneity,
22 and their bad information. I'll just give you one
23 anecdote of a woman's group that was I was interviewing:

24 These women were all between 40 and 50.
25 Half were married, half were single; half were talking

1 about their sexual adventures of the week before. None of
2 these women were sexually active all the time. They had
3 recently, about four of them, had had the opportunity to
4 become sexually involved with someone. And all of them
5 had brought condoms to this situation. None of them had
6 ended up using them. All of the men had said: "What kind
7 of guy do you think I am?" All of the women had backed
8 down. None of the condoms were used.

9 I think we often concentrate on college
10 students. And, in fact, that is often a good indicator of
11 things that are and aren't happening elsewhere.

12 MR. KESSLER: Dr. Lourea?

13 DR. LOUREA: Picking up on that same point,
14 I was interviewed by a radio station, TV station, in
15 Sacramento. They wanted to know what women needed to know
16 about men and men's sexuality to determine whether the men
17 were bisexual or IV drug users so that they could make
18 decisions. One of the things I told them, and this just
19 not true for men, but one of the things I told them is:
20 What women need to know about men is that we are liars.
21 We have been lying to you for thousands of years, if we
22 thought there was the opportunity that we could be sexual
23 with you. We will tell you that we love you. We will
24 tell you that you are the only one. We will tell you that
25 we are not HIV-positive. We will tell that we have never

1 had sex with anyone else except you, and the check is in
2 the mail.

3 It is incumbent on all of us to develop the
4 attitude that we are each individually responsible for our
5 own sexuality. There is -- that we cannot base the life
6 and death decision, which we may make, on someone else's
7 honesty.

8 One of the points that Pepper made that is
9 extremely important is: We also can't judge by someone
10 else's label our safety. A number of lesbian women
11 assume, since their partners are lesbians and they are
12 very positive of that, that they are therefore at no risk.
13 Because they are so adamant that their partners are
14 lesbians, they do not give their partners the opportunity
15 to tell them that, in fact, a great number of lesbian
16 women do have, frequently or occasionally, and frequently
17 regularly, sex with men. A number of gay-identified men
18 have occasional and frequent sex with women. Someone's
19 label does not necessarily tell you what their sexual
20 behavior is like.

21 MR. KESSLER: Mr. Dalton.

22 MR. DALTON: First, first up on the point of
23 labeling. Obviously, one of the take-home messages is to
24 focus on what people do and how they feel about it.
25 Labels can often can strain the mind. It reminds me of a

1 story, I guess, that Havelock Ellis tells, about a
2 Victorian woman, a crusader, a leader in the sexual purity
3 movement; and, in particular, in the movement against
4 masturbation.

5 One day, as she was handing out pamphlets
6 against the solitary vice, as it was sometimes called, she
7 happened to glance down and read one of these pamphlets
8 and read what the behavior was, and realized that it was a
9 behavior that she frequently engaged in herself. She
10 basically freaked out, was unable to -- I mean, had a
11 breakdown because of the inability to conform her label
12 and her beliefs with, in fact, her own behavior and
13 desires. There is a lesson there for all of us.

14 I have a couple of questions. I'm going to
15 sort of go back to Dr. Schwartz, some of the stuff that
16 she said about sexual essences. A quite interesting
17 discussion about our tendency to want to put people into
18 one kind of sexual box, if I can use that, in spite of all
19 that we know. And, in fact, in your discussion of how a
20 little bit of homosexuality seems to somehow, from both
21 the straight side and the gay side, put one in that camp.
22 I was reminded of the one drop of blood rule, with respect
23 to race, makes you black. And I think there are some very
24 similar kind of social dynamics going on.

25 But, as you pointed out, one of the things

1 that keeps, that keeps knowledgeable people wanting to
2 line people up in -- that is, treating people as if
3 sexuality is essential, natural and unchanging is the law.
4 Because, what you sort of admit otherwise, that, in some
5 ways, you give policy makers license to try to change
6 people. That is, if we prohibit sodomy, then, that may
7 sort of force gay people to becoming straight. That is
8 one.

9 So, how do we sort of -- how do we talk
10 honestly about the variability and nonessentiality of sex;
11 and, at the same time, not give aid and comfort to people
12 who would try to constrain a sexual minority? That's one
13 question.

14 The other question -- question? -- has to do
15 with this notion of trying to develop norms of sexual
16 behavior, as Dr. Fennell said. One way to do it is
17 through, I suppose, sex education, sex educators. One way
18 that we do do it in our society is, again, through the
19 law, through the criminal law. Part of what is going on,
20 when we create laws that say, if you have -- if you are
21 HIV-positive and you have sex, that's a crime. Or, if
22 you have HIV-positive, you are HIV-positive and you don't
23 tell somebody and you have sex, it is a crime, or we let
24 somebody bring a cause of action.

25 Part of what we're trying to do is to

1 construct a code of conduct around sexuality. Trying to
2 decide what is the right way to behave to one another;
3 what is the wrong way. When can you lie? When can you
4 not lie? In the age of sex -- in the age of AIDS, rather,
5 what is the proper way for one person to relate to
6 another. I happen to think the criminal law is a pretty
7 poor way to go about doing this. What is a better way?
8 How is it that in the age of AIDS, when we can't even talk
9 about sex -- or, if you can, it's easier to talk about it
10 in public than in private -- how do we develop kind of a
11 set of norms about how people should relate to one
12 another?

13 DR. SCHWARTZ: Gee, those are good
14 questions.

15 (Laughter.)

16 I'll respond, little that I know. You will
17 probably want to respond, as well. Probably you will, as
18 well.

19 There has been, and you are probably aware
20 of it, both an intellectual and political controversy
21 about how to define sexuality in terms of the outcome
22 which would come in law and policy from it. There are a
23 number of researchers that do believe in sexual essences.
24 They try and use cross-cultural material to show that gay
25 is gay is gay across countries and across history, and why

1 not just accept that certain percentage of happenstance
2 and let people live their lives. I think there is some
3 evidence -- I am willing to believe that there is some
4 percentage of deterministic sexuality. You know, we don't
5 -- we haven't been able to find it yet in terms of
6 chromosomes or hormones, or whatever; but I'm not prepared
7 to say we know everything we need to know. There are some
8 continuities that say that, perhaps, there is a percentage
9 of people that this is in the genes somewhere.

10 But, what one can say is, regardless of
11 that, people don't sign up one day. However we become
12 homosexual or heterosexual, we are not always the masters
13 of our own universe. And we find ourselves responding to
14 stimuli not because we have made choices, but because
15 choices seem to be coming into our sphere and we notice
16 things in a way that we don't control. In the same way
17 the majority of us have had heterosexual socialization of
18 our own sort because of who we notice and what experiences
19 we had, we didn't predesign that and decide that would be
20 the easiest and best thing to be. So that, in a sense,
21 it's almost besides the point, how we become homosexual or
22 heterosexual -- and God knows! We don't understand how we
23 become heterosexual, much less the other; but we know it's
24 a complex and nonvoluntary volitional process.

25 So, therefore, we don't need to fall in the

1 trap of whether it is an essence or not. But rather that
2 people are what they are, and they become it in complex
3 ways we cannot control, nor will be ever finitely
4 understand. So, that, in order to make policy about
5 people, as if they did in fact design their own sexuality,
6 is against almost any theory out there that any one
7 accepts in any major way. It would be as if we
8 constrained.

9 If we told a heterosexual: Okay, now we're
10 going to decide what behaviors you will do and who you
11 will do it with, and who you will find attractive. We
12 simply couldn't. It wouldn't work. It would be punitive.
13 It would cruel and unusual punishment.

14 I think those arguments could be made more
15 fulsomely than I will here.

16 So, the issue then is: I think there is a
17 base for policy that is respectful of human difference,
18 the variety of sexual experience and sexual identity and
19 sexual behavior that will occur through the life cycle.
20 and, to account for it in terms of the kinds of sex
21 education and information and policy that we make. That,
22 of course, is in the best of all possible worlds. In
23 reality, it's a very strong lobby that is scared silly of
24 just that approach, and it interferes with all rational
25 reactions to not only AIDS, but all other kinds of

1 sexually-transmitted diseases and all kinds of fertility
2 and other kinds of instruction. And I believe it just has
3 to be met with intellectual and political force, to say,
4 "Here are the realities of this untrue opposing viewpoint
5 of trying to stricture human life and human behaviors into
6 a model that simply doesn't fit anybody's knowledge of
7 reality, or anybody's sense of popular beliefs are
8 changing. It is fooled, and wrong, and untimely. The
9 balance of the actions has just got to be -- that's
10 relevant. It has to be public education so we have the
11 public protected and have their own wishes and desired
12 promulgated.

13 I think that these arguments are very
14 powerful, and that we can do social policy based on
15 reality, as opposed to social problems on what I believe
16 is actually, ultimately a minority point of view, when you
17 finally get down to, you know, its core proponents. So,
18 that -- I could go on with that, but that's sort of what I
19 think. I don't think we have to be caught in that it's
20 either all natural and there's no possibility in our own
21 sexuality for flexibility, et cetera. The important thing
22 is that's it is something that is designed, ordered,
23 controlled and dictated, no. That's the important issue.

24 As far as values go, and I will defer to Dr.
25 Fennell on this. Because I've talked for awhile on this,

1 but also because I think he's been working in the trenches
2 on this day by day by day. Just my own general feeling
3 is, again -- you are talking about these small, piddling,
4 ineffectual educational information that we've been
5 doing, this band aid stuff that makes us feel good and
6 does nothing society-wide, but a much larger discussion of
7 our responsibilities to each other as human beings. This
8 is, I think, you know, has to permeate society and male
9 and female relationships. I think we are actually on the
10 right road in the sense that I think men and women, while
11 in a real world, of course we are not honest nor are we
12 just in the ways we should; nonetheless, there are norms
13 of behavior. We do, in fact, construct norms of behavior.
14 We have certain civilized conducts which, at least when we
15 violate them, we know we have. Now it is not entirely
16 clear what are violations of civilized behavior, vis-a-
17 vis, sexuality. We don't even know the outlines of what
18 our conduct should be.

19 So, I think the idea is right, but it's
20 nothing that will happen unless we are talking about a
21 whole different emphasis, economically funded differently,
22 and placed differently so that my colleague, here, isn't
23 one of a few valiant souls doing model programs in
24 isolated places.

25 DR. FENNELL: I think this comment about

1 having laws that says it is against the law to have sex if
2 you know you are HIV infected and not telling your partner
3 is just that: it is a law. But it doesn't speak to the
4 issue that -- I mean, many students are engaging in what
5 we call serial monogamy, where this semester I might date
6 Dr. Osborn, only have sex with her, break up; next
7 semester, I date Mr. Allen and only have sex with him.
8 So, even that, I mean, how would you even go back and
9 determine how I contracted that, given the number of
10 partners that not only students, but society at-large
11 might be having?

12 Trying to create norms I think is the way to
13 go, to try to get us just to be able to talk, I mean, as a
14 society about these issues. That is why I think a
15 commission, such as yourself, is important because it is a
16 national commission, it is established by Congress and the
17 President, that could say: these are the kinds of things
18 that need to be going on on college campuses or in
19 society, which would give universities some place they
20 could look up to and say: Okay, these are the standards,
21 these are the kinds of things that we should be doing, as
22 opposed to an educator, like myself, or others, who have
23 to be concerned about their job security and who is
24 willing to take those risks. I'm willing to take those
25 risks.

1 As I said before, my work -- I'm in a good
2 position, that I can take those risks. I've taken several
3 this semester in that, on my campus, unfortunately, we are
4 having the debate about how to make condoms accessible.
5 I'm from a university that is known as a "public ivy." It
6 is where the good students go to school, and our students
7 don't engage in certain behaviors, from the
8 administration's point of view. But, in fact, we are
9 dealing with the same kinds of issues where, I mean, I've
10 been under fire. But I also do volunteer work with people
11 living with AIDS, and I know what that's like. I do what
12 I do because I don't want to see my students going through
13 what I see those people going through, as they are living
14 with this infection. So, I'm willing to put my own job on
15 the line to that. Fortunately, I have things that have
16 protected me from having to risk my own job.

17 But I think we do have to create a norm. I
18 think the Commission is in a position where they can say:
19 these are the standards that a university should be
20 working towards.

21 MR. KESSLER: Other commissioners? Ahrens?

22 MS. AHRENS: I have been real intrigued by
23 Dr. Schwartz's address in the use of the terms ---

24 MR. KESSLER: Can you speak into the mic,
25 please?

1 DR. OSBORN: I think it is on, you just have
2 to lean into it.

3 MS. AHRENS: In terms of the phrase,
4 "responsibilities to each other," it seems to me that,
5 when we get into this conversation of sexual intimacy, it
6 always seems to be directed toward or with or between the
7 two people involved. It does seem to me that this is such
8 a complex and enormous cultural issue, that, just to talk
9 about the two people involved is to really miss the big
10 picture.

11 It seems to me that it is not just an
12 individualistic sort of decision because what is involved
13 does effect, or can effect, certainly, other people. Even
14 thought much of this activity, at least perhaps the
15 frequency of it, is engaged in by very young people that
16 do not have family kinds of responsibilities. That's the
17 time when the teaching goes on, and you talk about the
18 effects of this mental health, emotional, with not just
19 with each other, but with those that are in a family
20 situation. You can define "family" anyway that you want
21 to. So, you're afraid your responsibilities to each other
22 seems to me to be -- to put this whole issue in a much
23 broader context.

24 As we look at how we address, as a
25 Commission, this issue, and particularly the prevention

1 side of it, I think we have to be very specific in terms
2 of the issue of HIV infection and it's transmission, and
3 so forth. But, it seems to me to be important that we
4 also be very broad in terms of the nature of the dynamic
5 here that we are talking about, with respect to, quote,
6 the entire family focus of the issue of sexual intimacy
7 and it's function in society and it's relationship.
8 Otherwise, it strikes me that we somehow sort of miss the
9 big picture. I think the churches have been in for a lot
10 of criticism here, much of it justified; but the emphasis
11 that the religious community has always placed on a
12 faithfulness has a dimension that is very important to the
13 stability of society and the family, as it grows, and
14 however you define family in society.

15 I was just intrigued by your phrase,
16 "responsibility to each other." Because, it seems to me,
17 that perhaps it is in that context that everything else
18 should take place.

19 I wonder if you would have a comment about
20 that?

21 DR. SCHWARTZ: Well, again, they are such
22 big issues, and one is always just -- I keep having the
23 same image, like people keep putting up mountains and say:
24 Okay. Could you please walk up this mountain? It's such
25 a large topic that each comment brings up.

1 I am social scientist, and I tend to deal
2 with what is, as opposed to what should be. People come
3 to their disciplines for different reasons. Mine is
4 because I like to find out what is, and say what I think
5 the possibilities are of what could be, within what I know
6 about human behavior and human potential and human
7 reality.

8 I think it is important for social
9 institutions to say what they think should be. I also
10 think that there are certain things about human behavior
11 that seems to have some continuity over many cultures and
12 many points in history. So that, while faithfulness would
13 be, indeed, an appropriate why. In many ways, the warning
14 point of view and weight of behavior at this point in
15 history, and many others. On the other hand, one has to
16 take into account that it is certainly not universal; it
17 will never be universal. We have to have a policy that
18 understands that.

19 In a study I did, for example, I looked at
20 the extramarital behavior of people who were religious and
21 nonreligious. By "religious, I meant -- it was defined as
22 going to church or synagogue at least once a week. There
23 was no difference between the highly religious and the
24 nonreligious. But the highly religious thought it was
25 worse. So they had more guilt, but they had similar

1 behaviors.

2 I believe that we need to tell people what
3 we think will be in their best interest. And there has,
4 in fact, way before AIDS in the gay community, been a
5 tendency to pair off, to try and be faithful, to have more
6 safe sex and less outside sex. The gay male community has
7 been well known for having a much different norm of sexual
8 behavior than the heterosexual community, both
9 intentionally and also as it evolved through certain
10 periods of history in this culture right now. Because
11 particularly as the whole society ages, as the baby boom
12 ages, it's less attractive to be single. It is less
13 attractive to be out in the market. This is true for the
14 heterosexual role, as well. There, the older society
15 gets, the more likely it is to be faithful; the more
16 likely it is to be somewhat monogamous; the more likely it
17 is to be conservative in attitudes.

18 So, I think there is some reaffirmation of
19 faithfulness of family, writ large of coupleness, of
20 marriage, writ large for all kinds of couples; but that
21 there will always be these other behaviors that are also
22 true about human passion and human appetites. I think we
23 need a policy that can both say: Here is what we think
24 would be best for you in terms of your emotional life and
25 physical health. But, given that not everyone will act

1 this way, the nature of people being thus, we also need
2 policy that takes that into account, rather than says:
3 No, and we hope you are deeply punished for your behavior.

4 MR. KESSLER: Commissioner Goldman.

5 MR. GOLDMAN: Thank you.

6 I am talking about problems with colleges
7 and universities, they can be interesting places. I can
8 remember lecturing at one recently; and, before doing so,
9 trying to find out what the local problem was. One of the
10 local problems that they were having at this college was
11 the health department, the health people and the health
12 education people at the college wanted to get rid of the
13 cigarette machines on campus and have condom machines
14 installed. The board of the university thought that
15 cigarette machines on campus were fine, but not condom
16 machines. It shows an interest in the concern of the
17 health of their students.

18 But that does lead to a question that I
19 have, and that is another point that you made, Dr.
20 Fennell, that you need to develop programs with and by the
21 targets of that education. I have suggested that we ought
22 to look at it also in terms of the advocacy that we do;
23 and, that, from a certain perspective, if we talk about
24 behavior change, we need to focus on the 99 state
25 legislative houses, the 50 governors, the members of the

1 Congress and the administration, and deal with behavior
2 change on their part, as well. In doing so, one has to,
3 it seems to me, understand and accept their values and
4 talk in their language, presenting one of the things that
5 we've talked about: if you try to talk to people in
6 language that they are not familiar with and bring to them
7 values that they are not willing to accept, then, you are
8 not likely to effectuate change in their behaviors or
9 attitudes.

10 My question to you is: How can you
11 translate some of the kinds of things that you have
12 advocated, and some of you have suggested here, in that
13 context of translating into language that people who,
14 perhaps, don't share those perspectives or have what maybe
15 some people might describe as more traditional views,
16 without being threatening to their values and without
17 attacking their values head on, and yet, nonetheless
18 accomplish the kinds of changes that they you are
19 referring to?

20 DR. FENNELL: I think that's a good
21 question. My colleagues might want to add also.

22 I think one of the things that I try to do
23 is: when I go to campuses and speak, particularly when
24 I'm speaking to administrators, is to go in with the
25 facts, I mean, from work that has been done, because,

1 quite often, those in the halls of academia will listen to
2 the research studies. So, if I can show them those
3 research studies and say this is what is happening with
4 college students, specifically if I can get information
5 from their own health center saying this is what is
6 happening with your students, we need to do something
7 about this; and you certainly care about the health of
8 your students. And that seems to be a buy-in. So, going
9 in with the facts -- your point about saying that they
10 will have different values, and quite often they do.
11 That's one reason why I tend to use that route.

12 The other one is -- and you can probably
13 speak to this better. I heard a speaker recently say
14 that, because some national body, such as your American
15 College Health Association, and other organizations, are
16 coming out saying, with guidelines, of what colleges
17 should be doing in terms of HIV education, that it may be
18 down the road that, if a student does get HIV infected and
19 can say it happened while they were a student, and then
20 can go to these guidelines and say, well, the university
21 didn't provide this education, and they didn't make
22 condoms, or whatever, accessible, then, perhaps, they will
23 have a strong case to sue the university and say they are
24 liable because they didn't provide appropriate education.

25 DR. SCHWARTZ: There is a certain --

1 MR. KESSLER: Dr. Schwartz --

2 DR. SCHWARTZ: I thought he wanted --

3 MR. KESSLER: What I want to do, if you can
4 respond and keep it to about a minute, so that we can
5 continue the dialogue, it would be helpful.

6 DR. SCHWARTZ: Just that there are limits to
7 facts and what people will accept. I mean, I think
8 education shows that it is related to less sexual
9 behavior, delayed sexual behavior, and more cautious
10 sexual behavior. But, you can put that out. People who
11 are opposed to sex education will say: "No, I don't
12 believe it. I don't think I've got it."

13 So, what we have to do, in my opinion, is go
14 after a constituency who might be influenced, who will
15 look at the statistics, and build a constituency and bring
16 it to the governors and legislators so that they will
17 believe they have people that they are presenting, that
18 the proportion -- you will never get consensus on these
19 items. It simply does not, will not, exist. But you
20 could get majorities. And that's what you have to bring
21 to people who think that those -- that that will guide
22 their acts.

23 DR. LOUREA: I think a presentation of the
24 problems that are going on and the involvement of the
25 target groups is extremely important. If you are working

1 -- if, as opposed to setting up a dichotomy between "we"
2 and "them," we can talk about the fact that we are all in
3 a problem together, and ask them how they would solve
4 those issues, presenting the facts, it seems to me that
5 education is the only defense that we do have. Being
6 punitive, isolating and disenfranchising people, only
7 creates a situation where we are likely to lie and likely
8 to be dishonest. So, I would involve, as Dr. Fennell
9 does, target groups.

10 One of the things we do here in terms of
11 designing sex education programs, AIDS education programs,
12 for transsexuals and transvestites, prostitutes, people
13 within the SM community, people within the gay and lesbian
14 community, is to make -- and bisexual community -- is to
15 make them part of the solution, to involve them in the
16 educational process to figure out how they would design a
17 program that is appropriate for their community.

18 MR. KESSLER: David Barr.

19 MR. BARR: The word, "faithful," struck a
20 cord to me. And I don't know how appropriate this is, but
21 I'll give it a shot.

22 I'm a gay man. I'm 35. I've been involved
23 in a relationship. I've lived with my lover, Paul, for 15
24 years. I love Paul very much. He is certainly a very
25 integral part of every aspect of my life, and he is very

1 much a part of my family. And, if my mom was sitting
2 here, she would say that, you know, louder than me -- and
3 so would his mom.

4 The faithfulness that runs between Paul and
5 I in dealing with our life crises, you know, our careers,
6 our emotional, you know, just trying to get through the
7 day; him being there for the death of my father, me being
8 there for the death of his grandmother; Thanksgiving, the
9 shared holidays, you know. My family and his family get
10 together for -- it's as much a family as any other family
11 in America. And maybe because of the obstacles that are
12 presented to us, it may be even just more so, you know,
13 because we got to go over a lot of barriers to create a
14 family and to be accepted. So, the faithfulness that is
15 there between us is incredibly strong.

16 But, to tie that to what our sexual life is,
17 is not necessarily helpful for us. When Paul -- and it's
18 not an easy issue, you know. Fifteen -- we've been
19 battling over the issue of monogamy for 15 years, and it
20 just, you know, it's not easy. I think that we have found
21 that, when we got pressure on us to feel that our sexual
22 life has to just be between the two of us, it puts a
23 pressure on us that we -- that makes it very difficult for
24 us to be faithful, you know, for us -- all the things that
25 we share together, if that pressure upon us to live that

1 way sexually is enforced, and we enforce it on each other,
2 it creates a lot of anger, a lot of resentment. It
3 doesn't allow us to express ourselves sexually the way,
4 you know, the way that I need to, the way that makes me
5 happy. So, when that happens, it draws us apart. It
6 doesn't keep us faithful. We practice safe sex. I'm
7 positive; he's negative. And that has a whole set of
8 issues unto itself. That's another hearing.

9 So, you know, "faithful" is a big word. It
10 means a lot of different things to a lot of different
11 people. But the values that are inherent behind the word
12 are very much a part of our lives, no matter how we
13 practice our sexual life.

14 DR. LOUREA: So that, for many communities,
15 faithfulness is not a subject of sexual exclusivity. The
16 two are not necessarily synonymous. It is important to
17 understand that.

18 MR. KESSLER: Mr. Allen.

19 REV. ALLEN: I've listened, as we've
20 wandered various directions here. One of the things that
21 I would like for you all to address is the issue of
22 authenticity of life, and of the human being -- and the
23 honesty there. We've moved into more of the behavioral
24 aspects and sexuality of who the person really is, and how
25 does one live that out in that context, and what type of

1 environment it takes to be authenticate. And that's what
2 Harlon was basically talking about: the structural
3 system, that we seem to move from structural systems to,
4 okay, then, let's move to the authenticity of who that
5 person is. That actual real being there.

6 That's one thing that I struggle with, is --
7 and if there is help that you all can give, I'd appreciate
8 it -- is: How do we create in that environment the
9 ability for a human being to be real, authenticate, and be
10 nurtured within that personal structure? Diane was
11 talking about the individuals. Well, what is the
12 structure that is needed there? Can there be something
13 that we can do?

14 Public policy is pretty disconnected to
15 reality at times. I'm just struggling with that. Here we
16 are, as human beings, trying to be real in a very unreal
17 world and a very dangerous world. So, where is it that we
18 start that path? Where is it that it starts and it
19 continues on?

20 I get very frustrated with the legal system.
21 I am from Texas and I deal with the state legislator there
22 at times, and the insensitivity and the cruelty that
23 takes place in any structure. I was going to ask you
24 about how Ohio deals with your efforts, and so forth, on a
25 state level, but that's another -- a sense of touch, and

1 the sense of really -- the touch of that essence of a
2 human being and who that person is, we seem to leave out
3 of discussions over and over about this. It feels good to
4 be touched. It feels good to be known and to know
5 another. And, if that's what we are talking about here,
6 that yearning, and we always sterilize it and desensitize
7 it. I just want to get us back to putting that back in
8 the context of how do we deal with the HIV epidemic?

9 DR. SCHWARTZ: Well, I think gay people have
10 done the society a great service, by demanding to be seen
11 as people, by having issues that challenge mainline
12 assumptions about almost everything. They have made us
13 deal with sex in a way that we really never did before.
14 Even assumptions, such as David Barr just mentioned about
15 what is fidelity? I think government has never really
16 wanted to hear this stuff. It is inconvenient for policy
17 and goes against making large scale policy that is
18 conservative.

19 But, you know, coming back to an earlier
20 place, that I believe it was Mr. Goldman mentioned, how do
21 we deal with the variety of values out there?

22 Probably the only hope for any kind of
23 consensus, negotiation and conciliation is at the human
24 level. One of the things that has come out of this
25 horrific AIDS crisis is people telling of enormous human

1 suffering and loss and grief. Probably many of us, as
2 deeply as we hold our emotional and values, when we see
3 another human being in grave crisis treated cruelly and
4 unjustly, we modify our values. I do believe that the
5 United States is going through such a process. We hear
6 stories we have never heard before. We see people suffer.

7 For me, the AIDS plague has had very
8 personal meaning, besides my work. My partner, who I
9 worked for 19 years with and did my research that was
10 government-sponsored, NIMH-sponsored, on sexuality, died
11 March 15, from AIDS, suffered horribly for a long time.
12 His partner, with whom he had the most beautiful model
13 family relationship that I would put up to anybody, is
14 also now suffering.

15 It is a disease without mercy, and it brings
16 you person to person about the preciousness of life and
17 the preciousness of each individual regardless of their
18 differences from you. I think it is a great tool. There
19 is no silver lining here, but there are some utilities. I
20 think it is a great tool to create some policy that extols
21 compassion between people. It helps us understand this,
22 as individuals, and lets people live their lives without
23 punishing them for it in punitive, and -- using the work
24 largely -- in unchristian ways.

25 //

1 DR. LOUREA: The gay community and bisexual
2 community have had an incredible response to the AIDS
3 epidemic. If we take, if we examine it, take a look at
4 the ways in which we heard dealt with sex education, we've
5 dealt with each other with compassion, I think that you
6 are going to take -- people are going to be amazed at the
7 enormous amount of human compassion, the enormous amount
8 of touching that goes on. I'm aware because I work with
9 people with AIDS, because I am dealing with it in my own
10 life.

11 One of the things I do with people with AIDS
12 is help them set up support systems of people who can be
13 there to take out the trash, people who can be there and
14 help them on an emotional level, on a physical level. I
15 frequently come in contact with the mothers and the
16 relatives, who come to visit their gay or bisexual sons or
17 daughters, and are overwhelmed by the human response that
18 the community, that their community has given them.

19 One of the things that you need to know is
20 that, if you are a sexual minority in this culture,
21 frequently you have had to leave your family, your loved
22 ones, the people that you grew up with, not only because
23 they might be punitive, even if they are not in support of
24 -- they cannot give you the kind of support that you need
25 different from the people who are living the lifestyle

1 that you are going through. So, many of us have left our
2 families, moved many, many miles away, and reestablished
3 our families.

4 What the heterosexual families come into
5 contact with is amazement, that their friends are there
6 taking out their trash, their friends are there changing
7 their diapers, their friends have been -- as one mother
8 pointed out, done more for my son than any member of my
9 family would do for me, if I were in similar situations.
10 So that I think that the role models are already there.

11 The other thing that is important to
12 remember is, that, we must be able -- if we want people to
13 deal with their sexuality, we must provide a context where
14 we can talk explicitly about sexuality. If that is not
15 the language or vocabulary that you use, you need to know
16 that other people do use that language. And, if I am
17 going to be able to talk about how am I going to address
18 the fact that my basic sexual behavior has been rimming
19 someone, if I find your burns up if I say that, I know
20 that I cannot talk to you about that. If my doctor does
21 not feel comfortable with my sexual behavior, probably
22 what I will do is I will not tell him my sexual behavior.
23 If an instructor is up there giving me a moralistic value
24 about what it is I should be doing, and it is different
25 than my understanding of my behavior, I will shut down and

1 I will turn off and not hear any of the valuable
2 information that you have to give.

3 So, part of it is recognizing the diversity
4 of human sexual behavior that is out there, and getting
5 -- I feel that the best that we can do is help people to
6 make decisions from information, as opposed to ignorance.

7 MR. KESSLER: Because the sessions are
8 designed to somewhat overlap, I am going to ask Sue Hyde
9 to hold her comments until the next session. I think you
10 can probably weave that into your presentation.

11 Commissioner Diaz had a comment or a
12 question; and, then, we will have to take a break.

13 MS. DIAZ: I would like to come back to the
14 issue of faithfulness. When the first Surgeon General's
15 Report on AIDS was issued, a number of us that were doing
16 discussions with them, groups from minority communities,
17 to better understand or pretest that document, found just
18 what you said, Dr. Lourea, that faithfulness does not
19 equate with physical exclusivity.

20 MR. KESSLER: Eunice, can you speak louder.

21 MS. DIAZ: We ask that you revise and
22 explain exactly what that report is going to do with
23 faithfulness. Particularly, in the Latin community, a
24 large number of men, who consider themselves in faithful
25 relationships, but that did not equate with physical

1 exclusivity. Today, the panel has not focused on the
2 ability to reach individuals who are in positions of being
3 able to train others in our community about the kinds of
4 information you have given us. Other than Dr. Fennell,
5 being in an academic center, he did not talk about how his
6 work impacts other professionals within the college
7 setting, other than through the American College and CDC
8 works.

9 I really would like to hear from you where
10 you feel that efforts should be best directed societally
11 to get the kinds of facts and information about sexuality,
12 sexual differences, and the options for the populations so
13 they can begin to influence public policy in some way that
14 it is meaningful. Your knowing, us knowing it, perhaps
15 does not have the impact of the natural communicators in
16 our community, whether they be other college professors,
17 ministers and clergy, other physicians and people of the
18 front line of interacting with our community. Information
19 would be very, very helpful and beginning to mold public
20 attitude that, in turn, begins to translate into public
21 policy.

22 I just wondered if anyone of you can just
23 highlight that for me.

24 DR. SCHWARTZ: One quick response, and I bet
25 everybody does.

1 One thing the federal government could do is
2 put money into research on sexuality and into sex
3 education in various professional contexts. Let me be
4 very specific about two examples.

5 There is a declining amount of sex education
6 about sexuality concerns because of AIDS. I'm not even
7 talking about unrelated disciplines. I'm the only person
8 who does sex education often for our resident in
9 psychiatry or of insurance. If you go to a medical
10 school, one of the biggest medical school complexes in the
11 United States, highest federal funding, please, this is so
12 inadequate it is embarrassing to talk about.

13 Second place: How about at the centers for
14 dissemination of information? Let me take one like the
15 Centers for Disease Control. They are not getting the
16 kind of information about sexuality that often goes out in
17 highly related outcomes.

18 Let me give you a very specific example that
19 I've been involved in, and that is reviewing the screens
20 that went out between 1981 or 2, and 1985, to blood banks,
21 which were the screens to ask people whether or not they
22 should give blood, whether or not they were in a high-risk
23 groups. I've been taking a look at them because they are
24 so inadequate that they are now the basis of suits across
25 the country for inappropriate safeguards for people, for

1 the blood banks, and for people giving blood from the
2 blood banks. One of the things that has been shocking to
3 me were these screens, were they gone over by anybody who
4 has a social science background? No. Were they ever gone
5 over with somebody who had sex education experience, such
6 as what the language means to different people reading
7 these things? No.

8 So, there is such a complete problem that
9 you would really need -- I think it would be a terrific
10 thing to concentrate on all of the various levels of which
11 this could be an enormous governmental contribution.

12 DR. LOUREA: I think it is important -- we
13 have an arrogance about us, as educators. We feel that we
14 have the answers and you have the problems. The most
15 effective AIDS education programs that have been done in
16 this country have ones that have relied on community-based
17 programs.

18 While I have been frequently at odds with
19 the Public Health Department in San Francisco, one of the
20 genius things I felt that they did do here was a program
21 that was targeted for adolescents in the predominantly
22 black neighborhood of Hunter's Point. What they did was
23 they did -- they had a contest, a rap down about AIDS.
24 There were prizes that were offered for the students who
25 come up with the best rap about that. What they did is

1 they used the language of that community and the students
2 had to go find out information and show the connection
3 between drugs, sex and AIDS, and put it in a performance
4 that was exciting.

5 One of the things we did with the Gay Latino
6 Community, the transvestite Latino Community in San
7 Francisco, was let them put on a performance, a drag show
8 performance, talking about AIDS.

9 It is important -- one of the things that we
10 must see is that all of us are in this together, and that
11 we all have contributions to make.

12 MR. KESSLER: Dr. Fennell, you have the
13 final word.

14 DR. FENNELL: Thank you.

15 Just to quickly comment on some efforts that
16 are going on to try to train college professionals. There
17 are a couple of CDC agreements with the American School
18 Health Association and the American College Health
19 Association in which both of those organizations do either
20 one- or two-day in-service workshops that are either
21 regional or statewide workshops for HIV AIDS education.
22 It tries to bring in the school nurse or faculty members
23 on college campuses. However, I must admit it is for
24 those who choose to go to them. So, there is still a lot
25 of people who aren't getting the information, and that

1 tends to be a problem. Because, my students have said to
2 me: Well, I sit in your class and I learn this; but,
3 then, when I go to my other professors' class, they will
4 say something that I know is incorrect, not because you
5 said it, but because of the work that I've read, that you
6 give us in the class. There is a need to try to reach
7 more people.

8 Also, in the state of Ohio, for the last
9 four years, we do, myself and another colleague do, a
10 statewide training workshop for college faculty and staff.
11 Here again, it is for those people who choose to come.
12 So, there are a lot of people who are still missing the
13 information.

14 MR. KESSLER: Well, thank you all for a very
15 stimulating start to this day.

16 We will continue in exactly 15 minutes. At
17 10:35, we will go on with the next session.

18 Thank you.

19 Off the record.

20 (Whereupon, a 15-minute recess was taken.)

21 MR. KESSLER: On the record.

22 Will the panelists please join us, and will
23 the commissioners please take their seats.

24 (Pause.)

25 Our panelists are before us, and the order

1 of presentations will be Eric Rofes, followed by Richard
2 La Fortune. I can't pronounce your Native American name.
3 Dr. Marjorie Hill will be next, Autumn Courtney, followed
4 by Paul Davis and Ms. Sue Hyde.

5 Why don't we start with you, Eric.

6 Welcome.

7 The Experience of "Sexually-Identified" Communities

8 Autumn Courtney Paul Davis

9 Marjorie Hill, Ph. D. Sue Hyde

10 Richard La Fortune Eric E. Rofes

11 MR. ROFES: The last time I testified in
12 front of the Commission in Washington, D. C., I was in a
13 suit and tie. I'm not wearing this leather to shock you,
14 but to make, reality, the ultimate point of my testimony
15 before you: that there is not just one gay community; but
16 many gay communities, each with our own customs, our own
17 traditions, and our own history. And I think you will get
18 a sense of that from this panel.

19 The leather I wear may seem unusual,
20 especially to those of you that don't live in San
21 Francisco. But this is the clothing of a specific
22 community and a specific culture of which I am proud to
23 identify, the gay male leather community. I certainly
24 encourage your questions, but let me explain a bit, first.

25 I grew up in New York City, in Long Island,

1 the son of Jewish parents, who were the children of
2 Russian immigrants. And growing up, our family struggles
3 with two very different American realities, which I think
4 many of you are familiar with. The concept of the melting
5 pot that said you should assimilate and fit in, and mix
6 into American culture and all end up looking alike; and
7 the experience of Jew hating and xenophobia in America,
8 which led the Jewish community to learn to take care of
9 our own and protect our own. I was brought up with an
10 inherently American concept of community that said I
11 should live in a world with others of different cultures.
12 I should preserve my Jewish identity, my religion, and my
13 traditions. Because of anti-Semitism, I had to remain
14 rooted to the Jewish community. When push came to shove,
15 only my people would be there for me.

16 So, with this mixed message --

17 00000000000000MR. KESSLER: Let me hold you so that we --
18 I don't want your message to go out --

19 00000000000000DR. OSBORN: Excuse me for interrupting you
20 Eric, but we are so happy to see Belinda. Some of us
21 haven't seen her for quite sometime, and we are just
22 thrilled that she is able to join us. So, pardon the
23 interruption.

24 Welcome, Belinda, we've missed you a lot.
25 We are delighted that you are here.

1 MS. MASON: I'm sorry I'm late.

2 (Applause.)

3 MR. KESSLER: You may continue.

4 MR. ROFES: The messages I got about what
5 community was like in America came from different sources.
6 They came from my family, they came from a synagogue, they
7 came from the newspapers I read. They gave this mixed
8 message of assimilation and separatism. That gave
9 messages that said you should fit in, and they gave a
10 message that said you should stay apart.

11 So, it was around the time of my Bar Mitzvah
12 -- hello, Belinda -- that I realized I had attractions for
13 other guys. I realized I was homosexual, and I knew what
14 that meant in America. And this concept of community,
15 American style, came home for me. Because, I thought I
16 had -- my initial sense was that I had to live a life of
17 total denial. This was in the late 1960s. I thought it
18 meant I could never tell anyone about this. I could never
19 love myself or like myself. I thought I could never kiss
20 another man. I thought I could never be public or open
21 with the people closest to me about it. This was the
22 message I got from family, from my synagogue, from the
23 newspapers I read.

24 It was interesting that, at the same time I
25 was getting mixed messages about being Jewish, I started

1 learning that these mixed messages applied beyond Judaism,
2 and applied to many communities. I was all of a sudden in
3 another community that I didn't know there was a community
4 about. But, soon I learned and heard people talking about
5 the gay community. I had no idea what they meant, as a
6 young homo in America. I couldn't understand how people
7 would form a community around sexual desire. It didn't
8 make sense to my understanding of community, which was
9 rooted in traditional Judaism. The concept of community
10 formed around a sex act or sexual desire just didn't fit.

11 Although, as I learned more and more about
12 what the gay community was, as I went to college and
13 started exploring it, I realized that gay communities are
14 a lot more than about one's sexual identity -- although
15 they certainly include one's sexual identity. That they
16 are as much out of love for a culture and history and
17 traditions as out of the need to take care of our own.
18 And that reminded me of my Jewish community background.
19 Instead of anti-Semitism, we were dealing with homophobia,
20 or hatred of queers. The gay community, for me, was as
21 much about loving men as making the world safe for men who
22 love men. I learned that a gay and lesbian community and
23 a gay, lesbian and bisexual community existed that
24 included other people, as well.

25 What I want to impress upon you is what the

1 gay communities I have been a part of have offered me,
2 have been very important to making my life wonderful, and
3 to protecting me and keeping me healthy. They have been a
4 safe place for a part of my identity that is not safe
5 anyplace else. It isn't safe in the Jewish community,
6 isn't safe in the American concept of the melting pot.
7 The gay communities I have been a part of have offered me
8 political values. Some political values that I shared as
9 a Jew, some new to me. They have given me an exploration
10 and a daring around sexuality. Not the sexual orientation
11 of my partners, but the sexuality I had, what my sexual
12 desires were, that I don't think I would have had
13 otherwise.

14 So, I sit before you as a gay man who is a
15 part of the gay male leather community. A community that
16 isn't talked about much in federal hearings, doesn't
17 receive government funding to prevent HIV infection; and,
18 frankly, isn't real popular in the larger gay community
19 even in this city. Yet, we are a community that has much
20 to teach about sexual identity, much to teach about the
21 experience of persecution, and who has learned a whole lot
22 about community building on the fringe of an already
23 identified sexual minority. I could be a transvestite or
24 a drag queen sitting here and saying very similar things.
25 I could be a youth hustler. I could be a radical fairy.

1 These are all sexually identified communities within what
2 people usually call the singular gay community.

3 Ultimately, the point I think people from
4 all these communities bring is the same. It is the
5 concept that, as much as we are a part of a broader group
6 called the gay community, we are different.

7 I certainly am open to questions you have
8 about sadomasochism, bondage, fetishism. I believe that
9 wearing leather pushes people's buttons in a deep and
10 personal way because it raised issues of explicit
11 sexuality, of power, of control, of roles, and I am happy
12 to talk about it, if you would like to. But, what I want
13 to make sure you know is that, we are not one sexually
14 identified community; but many communities, all are
15 impacted by HIV, all are rising to the challenge of the
16 second decade of HIV, and all, in my opinion, have had
17 impressive integrity and vision over the first decade.

18 ~~OOOOOOOOOOOOOOOO~~MR. KESSLER: Thank you, Eric.

19 Richard.

20 (The next speaker, Mr. LaFortune, initially
21 spoke in a Native American language and was not
22 translated into English.)

23 MR. LA FORTUNE: My name is Anuk Suk
24 (phonetic) in the our language. That means little man or
25 little woman. I come from the band of (Native American

1 word) nation. (Native American) means people who dwell by
2 the great river.

3 Madam Chair, members of the Commission, I
4 realize that we are talking about emerging and development
5 of sexually-identified communities. In the context of
6 American society, it is -- I'm trying to figure out how to
7 approach it. Because, as you may or may not know, we've
8 been here for about 50,000 years in these ancient
9 motherlands, and the majority of our non-North American
10 neighbors have been here for about 12 generations. We've
11 been here for about 12,000 generations, and we do have
12 traditions that all very closely interrelated: spiritual,
13 social, sexual, however you want to look at them.

14 Specifically, what we're looking at today,
15 as I said, in the American social context, it's a little
16 bit difficult to talk about. Because, what we are talking
17 about is the emergence of a sexually-identified community.
18 We never used to have gay and lesbian. In the Upik
19 (phonetic) language, we don't have two genders. We have
20 four genders. We have unlun (phonetic), it means man.
21 Uhanuk (phonetic) means woman. Uhanohuk (phonetic) means
22 similar to a woman. Unmuk (phonetic) means similar to a
23 man. (Native American phrase, not translated) means
24 different kind of people. And for us, the different
25 people, we had ever since we can remember been assigned

1 special spiritual roles. I guess what you could say in
2 the context of postmodern society, we are trying to figure
3 out how to make these roles fit into the context of our
4 lives in contemporary American society.

5 One of the things that I point out, when I
6 speak frequently, is: When we look at the Judeo-Christian
7 roots of federal, state and local city governments, the
8 laws, we recognize -- I mean, I recognize it's frequently
9 lost in the dust. The laws that we experience and are
10 expected to abide by, from day to day and hour to hour,
11 derive from social and religious mores and assumptions,
12 which the European and Caucasian American cultures
13 inherited from Semitic and the Arabic people, 6 or 8
14 thousand years ago, and about 12 or 15,000 miles on the
15 other side of the earth. I realize that these laws are
16 not appropriate for my people.

17 The word "sodomy," as you all know, comes
18 from the name of big, old settlement, old community in the
19 desert, Sodom. And, as I said, it's a long time ago and a
20 long ways from here. It has never been a part of our
21 cultures.

22 In the native communities in this continent,
23 there are a lot risk considerations that we have to
24 contend with that a lot of other people, including
25 minority communities, don't have to think about. There

1 are many multiple risk, including sexual behavior of young
2 persons; high rates of teen pregnancy; chemical use,
3 including very high rates of IV drug use. All these
4 things place us at great risk.

5 I'm just trying to put this in a little bit
6 of context for you. It's really hard to do in five
7 minutes.

8 What I do want to say to you, though, is, in
9 general, what has been noted by at least one western
10 scholar, who studied our cultures, sexuality hasn't ever
11 been seen as something evil, or taboo, or a disagreeable
12 task that really does have to be done in order to continue
13 the species. It has most often been understood and you
14 can see this in our what would be possibly seen in the
15 Christian community as high church. In our most sacred
16 ceremonies, sex is always made fun of not in a denigrating
17 way, but in a very happy, healthy way. Because, when you
18 stop and think about all the things that we as human
19 beings go through, our own sexuality, it is kind of
20 humorous. And this is the way we've always understood it.

21 We do have, in all of our languages, of the
22 350 remaining nations existing in North America, we have
23 our own words that describe the roles of what are known as
24 gay and lesbian people, bisexual people. In the
25 traditional way, though, and these traditional ways are

1 still being exercised, we have a lot of responsibilities
2 which have always ranged from diplomatic and ambassadorial
3 to artistic, to social and ceremonial roles. We strive to
4 preserve these and rehearse them in the context of our
5 communities. It has always been considered a privilege to
6 have a gay or lesbian person as a member of your family,
7 or to be able to marry one. This gives you a little bit
8 of an idea of some of the things that have guided our ways
9 at looking at humanity.

10 The idea of polarities, in terms of
11 sexuality and gender, doesn't make a lot of sense in the
12 context of our cosmos and our social constructs.
13 Sexuality and especially a person's high roles, somewhere
14 between the gender, the masculine and the feminine, those
15 people who occupy gender roles between the masculine and
16 feminine are seem as being gifted. And, sexuality, in
17 general, is seen as a gift from (Native American term),
18 the creator, or the creators of the universe.

19 We have been, and we continue to be in
20 modern day United States, we continue to be called
21 savages. Every time a cowboy and Indian movie is aired
22 over the airways, here and in other parts of the world
23 where they happen to be very popular, we are savages and
24 less than human all over again. It perpetuates very wrong
25 ideas about our humanness. Yet, we savages, for millennia

1 upon millennia, have understood and affirmed the role of
2 women, of our children, our elders, and of our gay and
3 lesbian people. Where the differences collide, there is a
4 lot of confusion and we do have to deal with that as part
5 of our oppression.

6 1992, we are at the 11th hour of a 500th
7 anniversary of a holocaust, and it hasn't stopped.
8 However, we have not stopped being here. We have always
9 been here, according to our tradition. And, as long as
10 there is life on earth, we will be here. And this
11 understanding of sexuality is part of our sacred
12 tradition.

13 Thank you.

14 MR. KESSLER: Thank you.

15 Dr. Hill.

16 DR. HILL: Good morning. My name is
17 Marjorie Hill. I'm director of the Mayor's Office for
18 Lesbian and Gay Community in New York City.

19 From that vantage point, I'd like to share
20 with the Commission some of the observations I have made,
21 as it is my responsibility to know very well what the
22 concerns are of lesbians and gay men; how they access city
23 services, AIDS services being inclusive in that, and some
24 of the dilemmas that confront those communities in New
25 York City and across the country.

1 The Mayor said, a couple of months ago, "I'd
2 rather be booed in a parade than bow down to the forces of
3 exclusion, fear and intolerance," shortly after marching
4 in the St. Patrick's Day Parade, where he marched with the
5 Irish Lesbian and Gay Organization. This was clearly a
6 victory that received both national and international
7 attention. You may ask why, other than that's my boss,
8 would I mention it today.

9 (Laughter.)

10 I think that it points out in a very clear
11 way what three of the issues that face the community at
12 large, and lesbian and gay and bisexual individuals across
13 our country. And those three issues are invisibility,
14 intolerance and inequality.

15 Too frequently, sexually-identified communi-
16 ties are ignored or dismissed as not that same as other
17 minority disenfranchised groups. To be denied civil lib-
18 erties based on bias and prejudice, regardless of whether
19 it's because of your gender, religious affiliation, eth-
20 nicity or sexual orientation, is to be denied. There are
21 two key differences, however.

22 One, is that which has to do with how one is
23 publicly identified. It is rather obvious that I'm
24 African-American. Equally, it is obvious that I'm female.
25 It is not obvious that, however, that I'm a lesbian. In

1 fact, after being sort of identified as a public lesbian,
2 being on numerous talk shows and being involved in gay and
3 lesbian organizing for over 12 years, periodically someone
4 asks me -- I'm a psychologist by profession -- did I get
5 this job because working with lesbians and gay men with my
6 clinical specialty? Or being asked how does it feel to
7 promote lesbian and gay rights? How does it feel to look
8 out for their rights? And the whole issue of being
9 visible, and the whole issue of even as, again, a publicly
10 acknowledged lesbian, that individuals can so easily deny
11 that, I think speaks to the issues and concerns of our
12 community.

13 The media, public institutions of learning,
14 whether they be a grade school, high school -- and we've
15 already heard about how poorly colleges are doing around
16 sexuality -- legislators continue to ignore the lesbian
17 and gay community. Even in situations where there is some
18 recognition, it is often white, gay male, or questionable
19 in terms of true inclusion.

20 Recently, I participated, conducted a
21 personnel training for Department of Personnel's EEO
22 officers, and dealt with the issue of inclusion, sexual
23 harassment, how lesbians and gay men might be encouraged
24 to report if they felt there were issues of violations.
25 And, after doing what I thought was a thorough job, I had

1 an individual ask me, who commented that it was a thorough
2 presentation, and why do you have to tell anyone? Which
3 speaks to the question of tolerance. That although we in
4 our society, those of us who think of ourselves as
5 progressive and inclusive, can say it's okay to have a
6 panel, it's okay to speak of these issues, that to have
7 true inclusion is not blatantly heterosexist in its
8 orientation too often occurs.

9 The example that I sometimes give is: If
10 we, for one moment, thought of a world where everyone
11 looked female, but there were 10 percent of those
12 individuals of that, or our society, of this society, who
13 looked female who were actually male, but had to make a
14 decision about whether they would tell anyone or not, what
15 that would mean if this in this all presumably looking-
16 female society, that the church said that being male was
17 wrong, that it was sinful, that it was a psychiatric
18 disorder. If in this society that the individuals who
19 decided to come out as male were subject to criminal
20 penalties, were subject to having their children taken
21 away from them, and were subject to also being bashed,
22 then, you get a picture of what's it's like for gay and
23 lesbian organizing, and the whole concern around the
24 safety and prevailing heterosexism.

25 The state of -- the final thing I would like

1 to say in terms of inequality, is that the state of gay
2 and lesbian liberties across our nation poignantly reveal
3 significant inequality. Only a handful of municipalities
4 have domestic partnership legislation. Even few of those
5 municipalities have civil rights legislation that protects
6 lesbian and gay people. Sodomy, in many states, still
7 includes sex acts between same sex individuals. Lesbian
8 and gay relationships, and the definition of family
9 continues to be an issue of controversy. The Sharon
10 Kowalski Case being an example, where a -- for those of
11 you who may not know -- a lesbian couple is being denied,
12 that the woman who is now incapacitated is being denied
13 the care and affection of her life partner regardless of
14 what she says, regardless of what medical experts say.
15 And again, this is the question of family and, perhaps,
16 faithfulness that David talked about earlier. In spite of
17 this, the gay and lesbian community is gaining in its
18 visibility, in its unity.

19 I have attended, in the past six months,
20 three national conventions, one being the National Black
21 Gay and Lesbian Leadership Forum; the second being the
22 National Lesbian Conference, which is historical in
23 Atlanta, just about three weeks ago; and the National Gay
24 and Lesbian Task Force Conference in Minneapolis. The
25 issues around dealing with our rights, the issues around

1 gaining custody and maintaining custody of our children,
2 and having our families and our relationships respected;
3 the issues around bias violence and how, in the United
4 States, it is projected that, last year, bias violence
5 against lesbian and gay men rose 200 percent. In New York
6 City, bias violence, according to the New York City Police
7 Department, against lesbians and gay men rose 109 percent.
8 If all of us who know anything about crime statistics will
9 easily recognize that all crimes are underreported. So
10 the issue of safety and visibility are issues that impact
11 AIDS services, other social services, education and,
12 again, visibility. But, in spite of this, the amount of
13 organizing that's going on, both nationally and, as a
14 matter of fact, internationally and locally, is really
15 quite amazing.

16 One of my responsibilities is to meet with
17 lesbian and gay organizations and here what their concerns
18 are. And I have the opportunity to meet with S&M groups,
19 the opportunity to meet with parenting groups, the
20 opportunity to meet with lesbian and gay people of color
21 organizations and, interestingly enough, lesbian and gay
22 clergy, interestingly enough the concerns are pretty
23 universal: lesbian and gay men are organizing for
24 increased visibility to have the right, the right to be
25 and exist in a society that respects individuals for who

1 they are, not based on whom they choose to love.

2 The struggle will continue and there are a
3 lot of nuances within the community that are relative to
4 AIDS, but exclusive to the issue of AIDS.

5 I will be more than happy to address any of
6 your questions, but I thank the Commission for pulling
7 together and organizing this panel to provide individuals
8 with some grassroots experience an opportunity to share
9 with you our concerns.

10 Thank you.

11 MR. KESSLER: Thank you, Dr. Hill.

12 Autumn Courtney.

13 MS. COURTNEY: Hi! My name is Autumn
14 Courtney. I am a bisexual woman.

15 What I do in my day-to-day life is organize
16 within the bisexual community. I work with individuals
17 and groups across the United States in a coming together
18 and a coming out around the bisexual identity. It's an
19 identity that has been very difficult for us to come to
20 grips with because of the homophobia and heterosexism that
21 exists in this county. Our concerns are of homophobia
22 and, as my fellow panelists have said, we share the same
23 concerns as lesbian and gay people; but we also have our
24 own community, and we struggle with our own identity. And
25 that's what I would like to address.

1 Early in the epidemic, we were very involved
2 here in San Francisco with education around the AIDS
3 epidemic. We were some of the first people -- because we
4 are so used to talking about our sexual identity and what
5 we do sexually, because people seem so fixed on that
6 specific aspect of us, we were able to talk in very
7 explicit terms about the AIDS epidemic and what we could
8 do to make our sexuality more safe to stop the spread of
9 AIDS among us. We were hit very hard in the early days.

10 Because it was seen as a gay plague, a lot
11 of people, who were coming to terms with their own
12 bisexuality, did not want to come to grips with their gay
13 side. From that, the lesbian and gay population has grown
14 a community that is more powerful.

15 Also, bisexual people have been
16 discriminated against or have been left out. As the term
17 gay and lesbian is used over and over again, the word
18 bisexual is not addressed. Now, the word is being tagged
19 on, but we want it to be more than a tag. We want it to
20 be a real -- have a real meaning behind it, that we're
21 talking about real people who have same sex and opposite
22 sex relationships on a pretty much day-to-day basis, or
23 month-to-month basis, or year-to-year basis. The bisexual
24 people are very diverse in their sexuality and of who they
25 are.

1 Frequently, in reaching, in becoming
2 involved in the health care community, I would just like
3 to give an example of bringing it kind of closer to home.

4 In 1986, I was living with a man. I had a
5 male lover at the time. Up until then, I did not think
6 that the AIDS epidemic had much to do with me. Up until
7 that time, there was very little that was being put out
8 about women and AIDS. That hasn't changed all that much,
9 except for in major cities. Most people think that it is
10 still a gay men's disease. We know this is just not true.

11 In 1986, my male partner was diagnosed with
12 AIDS. It wasn't really until that time that I realized
13 that I might be at risk, or that I might be infected.
14 When I went to go get tested, I was very lucky to find a
15 compassionate women's center to do the testing for me and
16 to give me some advice, but they had no support group.
17 When I went to a gay male support group, where people who
18 were waiting to get their test results back, I wasn't
19 accepted. They couldn't deal with the fact that a woman
20 might have the same issues that a gay male might have in
21 dealing with the AIDS crisis. Fortunately for me, I
22 tested negative and have continued testing negative, even
23 though I'm intimate with my bisexual male partner.

24 My experience was just horrifying, the way
25 that I was treated and discriminated against, in terms of

1 not having access to community group support groups.
2 Slowly, that has changed. But, even now, at the San
3 Francisco AIDS Foundation, there is only one bisexual
4 counselor, and he is overloaded, dealing with heterosexual
5 and bisexual men who are married. The needs and education
6 of bisexual women has failed to be addressed.

7 In looking over the literature at the AIDS
8 Foundation, you will see the word bisexual at the top of
9 gay men, gay and bisexual men dealing with AIDS. But,
10 later, the word "bisexual" is dropped throughout. There
11 is also no pamphlets directed towards bisexual women.
12 There is just these kind of vague terms of "same sex,"
13 and "opposite sex" behaviors.

14 What we ask of the Commission, the lesbian
15 and gay community, and the general public at large, is
16 validation of our sexual identity, that we are bisexuals,
17 that we are not confused, we are not fence sitters; that
18 we are generally attracted, both sexually, emotionally,
19 erotically, sensually, intellectually, psychically, to
20 both genders. That that may not be a 50-50 split. That we
21 may fluctuate, that our sexuality may ebb and flow as we
22 change. What we ask is acknowledgement of this identity;
23 that the word, "bisexual," be included with the terms
24 "lesbian and gay" when appropriate' to be included with
25 the terms "heterosexuality and homosexuality" when

1 appropriate, because we are unique and different in our
2 sexuality; that we are not automatically stigmatized as
3 being nonmonogamous. That is the testimony here earlier
4 that some people are serially monogamous, whether it be,
5 you know, relationships of a couple of days, or several
6 years.

7 We would like to be included in the
8 education material. There is a lot of people who don't
9 identify with the gay community and are not receiving this
10 education that could be given to them. And, as we know,
11 education really works in stopping the AIDS epidemic. We
12 ask that the terms "bisexual and bisexually active" be
13 included in AIDS education materials. And with that,
14 targeted groups of bisexuals would be placed on your list
15 of people to be educated. There are whole pockets,
16 especially people who are not around the urban areas, that
17 are bisexually active and are not getting education
18 materials.

19 The last thing is our involvement. People
20 who do self-identify as bisexual should be included in the
21 development of education materials.

22 Thank you.

23 MR. KESSLER: Thank you, Autumn.

24 Paul Davis.

25 MR. DAVIS: My name is Paul Davis. I

1 represent the AIDS Program in Los Angeles.

2 In preparing for this, in terms of the
3 sexually-identified community and in terms of the --

4 MR. KESSLER: I'm not sure your mic is
5 working. Can you -- No, it's not. If you could --

6 MR. DAVIS: Okay?

7 DR. OSBORN: That's it.

8 MR. DAVIS: My name is Paul Davis, Director
9 of Education from the Minority AIDS Program in Los
10 Angeles.

11 When asked to serve on this panel, I looked
12 at the topic of sexual-identified community and began to
13 realize, since I would be talking in terms of black gay
14 males, that the topic really didn't refer to us in the
15 sense that we are somewhat, to a large degree, invisible.
16 I looked at how to approach this, and I said I would
17 approach basically from a personal standpoint. One of the
18 things that I do, in terms of doing education, is, we
19 began to get some of our PWAs to take risks in terms of
20 getting on posters, or talking to groups in the Black
21 Community about the whole thing of AIDS. But I decided to
22 use my person and take a few risks myself.

23 First of all, just to let you know who I am,
24 I am a black gay male, who is a father of two. I'm
25 basically from the Bible Belt of Lynchburg, Virginia,

1 headquarters of the Rev. Jerry Falwell, with a 23-year old
2 son who is HIV-positive. I'm one who has been very active
3 in the Civil Rights Movement of the early '60s, part of
4 the march on Washington in 1963, and one who struggled for
5 a long time in terms of his own sexuality; one who hid his
6 sexuality during his college years at Hampton, and later
7 working at Hampton Institute in Virginia as the assistant
8 dean of men, and later assistant dean of minority affairs
9 at New York University. Basically, one who was in the
10 closet. One of many blacks who simply moved to the large
11 urban areas, such as New York and later Los Angeles,
12 because one found that one could sort of melt into the
13 crowd and not stand out.

14 I'm a black gay male who has -- I was
15 sitting down the other night and put together sort of a
16 list -- who has been with over 250 persons sexually in my
17 lifetime, persons I can remember by name and face. Those
18 do not count those I cannot remember; and one who is still
19 HIV-negative. That becomes a dilemma in terms of working,
20 particularly in this field, in the sense that realizing
21 that it is not simply a question of how active one is
22 sexually, but how one presents or what caution one takes.

23 I grew up not knowing of an openly black gay
24 community, living somewhat in a close society and a secret
25 society: house parties, individual friends that one met.

1 Let me state from the outset, I do not
2 pretend to represent the black gay community, but maybe
3 only a segment of that community, which is a new and
4 emerging, politically black gay community, that is out of
5 the closet, and basically plans to stay out of the closet.
6 In that community, there is a very diversified community.
7 There are transvestites, there are transsexuals, there are
8 drag queens, there are various titles: sissies,
9 homosexuals, persons in S&M, persons who consider
10 themselves gay, persons who consider themselves bisexual.
11 Black men who have sex with men is a title that we use.
12 Black men who have sex with men, but who do not self-
13 identify. Black men who have sex for survival, such as
14 food and shelter. Or black men who have sex because of
15 their environment, such as in the large proportion of
16 Blacks who are in jails or in the prison system and later
17 coming out and go back into a heterosexual lifestyle. It
18 is a diversified community.

19 Looking at the community in LA, we sort of
20 speak a lot of times of what is called the community north
21 of Wilshire and south of Wilshire. North of Wilshire is
22 the Hollywood-West Hollywood community that sort of
23 intermingles with the white gay community. The community
24 south of Wilshire that includes Watts, Compton, Ingelwood,
25 and that's a totally different community. The two

1 communities sort of do not mesh. There is a young gay
2 community and there is an older gay community. There is
3 an affluent gay black community and a very poor,
4 impoverished gay black community. And there are black gay
5 males and black gay females that still also have various
6 issues. One of the things that was alluded to by an early
7 speaker was that a large number of my sisters in the black
8 lesbian community who still feel that they are immune to
9 this virus, but who still practice both male and female.

10 Looking at the development of this
11 community, as I indicated earlier, in the '60s, basically
12 this community was made up of private parties in one's
13 home; and, oddly enough, in the Black Church. In the
14 '70s, basically black gay bars began to open, or gay bars
15 began to open, so there was still the parties, there were
16 the bars, and there was a church.

17 I indicate the church because the black gay
18 community has always been in the black gay church. A
19 friend, a person at the National Black Gay and Lesbian
20 Conference, made the comment: his father was a minister,
21 and one of the deacons in the church came to him and said:
22 "You know, this person that plays the organ, do you know
23 he's gay? We need to get rid of him."

24 And the preacher turned to him and said, "Do
25 you know how to play the organ?"

1 He said, "No."

2 His response was: "Leave him alone."

3 That has been something that has been very,
4 very prevalent within the Black Church in the sense that
5 many Black Churches have been built with the singers and
6 organists who were gay.

7 In the '80s, again, there were basic
8 parties, bars, churches, and a few social clubs in LA.
9 There were such social clubs started, such as LA Card
10 Club, the Achievers Club, the Cosmopolitans, and Excalibur
11 Social Club that I was a founding member of in the early
12 '80s.

13 In about 1985 in the black gay community in
14 LA, new things began to happen, such as Unity Fellowship
15 Church that started out in '85 with about 12 members,
16 under the leadership of the Rev. Carl Dean, mainly a
17 primarily a black gay church. Today, that congregation
18 numbers over 500 and includes persons of very diversity,
19 racially and sexually; but primarily a gay organization.

20 Also, such organizations as the Minority
21 AIDS Project have made a large number of changes in that
22 community in the sense that, prior to '85, there was
23 nothing political within the black gay community. Since
24 then, in 1986, Black Gay Men's Coalition for Human Rights
25 was formed, an organization that was basically formed to

1 deal in the political area -- where we brought politicians
2 in to talk to members of the community in terms of who we
3 were going to support. The Black Gay Men's Rap started,
4 where we've had over a hundred and some black gay men, who
5 periodically attend that rap. The Black Gay Men's
6 Exchange, the Afro-American Cultural Alliance, the
7 National Gay and Lesbian Leadership Forum. Even in LA
8 now, we have a magazine called "Black."

9 Again, this being a minority community, it's
10 becoming much more visible now in 1991. One would think
11 that the AIDS virus would have driven further into the
12 closet persons in the black community. A number of them
13 are coming out in the political arena. A number of them
14 are challenging the Black Church. A number of them are
15 redefining the whole question of what a family is.

16 Yes, there are a number of problems that we
17 deal with in terms of this virus within the community;
18 but, some of the problems that we still have are drugs, we
19 still have gangs, we still have poverty, we still have job
20 discrimination, racism and other forms of discrimination.
21 We are a very diversified community.

22 Thank you.

23 MR. KESSLER: Thank you, Paul.

24 Sue Hyde.

25 MS. HYDE: If this doesn't reach, I've been

1 handed a bull horn.

2 (Laughter.)

3 MS. HYDE: Thanks Paul. Thanks Larry.

4 Good morning, Dr. Osborn, Ms. Mason, Ms.
5 Byrnes, Mr. Kessler, members of the Commission, witnesses,
6 guests. I see we are all here. Thanks to all of you for
7 coming out this morning.

8 I worked for four years at the National Gay
9 and Lesbian Task Force in Washington. And, while there, I
10 was the director of what we called the "Privacy Project,"
11 an organizing project to repeal sodomy laws, or repeal the
12 portions of sodomy laws that criminalize private adult
13 consensual sexual behavior.

14 So, I was very interested in the comments of
15 the first panel and had wanted to point out to the members
16 of the Commission that the resistance to knowing about
17 sexual behavior and sexual attitudes is quite great, and
18 was demonstrated two years ago -- I think it was two years
19 ago -- when the United States Congress refused to fund a
20 study that had been proposed by NIMH to comprehensively
21 investigate sexual behavior and sexual attitudes of people
22 in this country. And I think the Commission would do a
23 great service to all of us to recommend that such a study
24 be funded.

25 I also want to thank you for taking this day

1 to talk with us, to listen to us. I hope that Dr.
2 Fennell's education adage will not be operative today.
3 That you will remember what you hear and learn from what
4 you see, and go do whatever it is you do, that the day
5 will, in fact, be useful.

6 Some of my colleagues have spoken in a very
7 personal way about their experiences of growing up, as gay
8 and lesbian people and bisexual people, and finding their
9 places in the world. Now, coming out can only be, I
10 think, an individual process. It is excruciatingly
11 personal. Because, in coming out, most of us place
12 ourselves outside of something that's very important to
13 us. Now, of course, we place ourselves outside a closet,
14 which is sort of elemental to us, and that's good. But we
15 also very well may be placing ourselves outside our
16 families, outside our circle of friends, outside some
17 parameters of acceptability for our chosen careers or
18 occupations. But we, in fact, don't choose to locate
19 ourselves on the outside. We live in a culture that
20 insists on the dominance of heterosexuality. And it's the
21 culture that consigns us to the outside, to the margin, to
22 unacceptability.

23 The deepest contradiction of my life is that
24 I had to come out to come in. I had to move outside of my
25 family, outside of my friends, I had to move outside of

1 acceptability to become whole and to realize my own
2 competence and my own capability. I had to leave home to
3 get home. Now, it's a process that is repeated over and
4 over by lesbian and gay people. And it's a process that
5 is experienced individually and collectively.

6 No queer is an island. Who said that?
7 Nobody can be gay or lesbian alone. People can be
8 homosexual alone. In fact, many people have done it. Roy
9 Cohn and Liberace, perfect examples. They lived in
10 relative isolation from a gay and lesbian community. In
11 fact, were adamant in saying that they did not belong
12 there, and adamant in rejecting it. So, they weren't gay
13 and lesbian in the sense of joining with and participating
14 in a community.

15 Now, I've said that we are on the outside,
16 on the margin, so what can I possibly mean by community, a
17 word that connotes centrality and safety?

18 For the last four or five decades, in fact,
19 for the length of my lifetime, lesbian and gay people have
20 been involved in the project of creating and building
21 culture and community. I was thinking about this, this
22 morning. That, if anything, lesbian and gay people are
23 the renaissance people of this century, at least in so far
24 as, I think, as this country goes. We emerged from
25 secrecy, we emerged from shame, we emerged from

1 stigmatization to cultivate an incredible flowering of
2 culture. Out in these margins, we teem with activity.
3 There are gay and lesbian choruses and theatres and film.
4 There are gay and lesbian print and electronic means of
5 communicating. We have our journalism. There is gay and
6 lesbian athletic organizations. Yes, we do have the Gay
7 Olympics every four years. There are gay and lesbian
8 recreational clubs, political organizations of almost
9 every kind -- not every kind, thank you very much; but
10 almost every kind. There are gay and lesbian caucuses of
11 almost every major professional organization. There are
12 gay and lesbian churches and organizations for gay and
13 lesbian religious people of every denomination, every
14 religion. The proliferation of gay and lesbian culture is
15 seen and felt really in every part of this country. When
16 we say we're everywhere, we are not kidding around. But
17 we still are somewhere out on the margin. And the
18 evidence of that is all around us.

19 I grew up in Illinois, a great state.
20 Illinois, in 1962, when I was ten, became the first state
21 to reform its criminal code such that private adult
22 consensual sexuality would no longer be a felony. But,
23 prior to that, every state in the country had one of these
24 phenomenally unenforceable sodomy laws. From '62 to '83,
25 24 other states reformed their criminal codes similarly to

1 Illinois. But just in case we thought we were making
2 progress on this particular issue, in June 1986, the Your
3 Honor Supreme Court in a case called Bowers v. Hardwick or
4 Hardwick v. Bowers -- I forget the way it goes; I'm not a
5 lawyer -- but just in case we thought we were getting
6 somewhere, upheld the Georgia Sodomy Law and declared that
7 there is no fundamental right to engage in private
8 homosexual behavior. Oh, right back where we started.

9 Plenty of gay and lesbian people have served
10 in the United States Military, thousands, in fact. But
11 for 50 years, the Department of Defense has engaged in a
12 policy that has, I think, the force of law, a written
13 policy to exclude and discharge those gay and lesbian
14 soldiers and sailors who become identified to them. It is
15 called Policy Directive 1332.14. The Commission may be
16 interested in investigating that a little further,
17 particularly since Secretary of Defense Cheney sits at
18 least officially on this Commission.

19 The evidence is everywhere. Not more than
20 five days ago, I'm sitting drinking my coffee, reading the
21 newspaper, I open up the paper and the Massachusetts
22 Catholic Bishops have just wanted everybody to know that
23 they were going to redouble their lobbying efforts to make
24 sure that no governmental agency, no governmental
25 decision-making body in the state would recognize gay and

1 lesbian families. Oh, so what does that mean? That means
2 that my lover and myself and our children, when we have
3 them, will not be recognized as a family by the state. On
4 a daily basis, we experience our marginality no matter how
5 fully we feel apart of our communities.

6 The Reagan-Bush indifference to the AIDS
7 epidemic, in some terrible and tragic way, was just
8 business as usual insofar as our lives were concerned. It
9 was in a just awful, terrible way another nail in the
10 coffin. Just more shameful and vile business as usual.
11 And the handwriting that predicted that enactment of
12 federal policy concerning the AIDS epidemic had been on
13 the wall for centuries.

14 There is one really important feature of
15 coming out -- well, there are many important features.
16 But, as far as our communities goes, as far as our
17 political development goes, there is a very important
18 feature in coming out. It makes each of us deeply, deeply
19 invested in social change. The risks of coming out really
20 mold us, us gay people, into activists. Because, we know
21 that only by changing society's enforcement of the policy
22 of heterosexuality for all will we ever achieve any
23 measure of safety. Our survival depends on our
24 willingness to press for legal, cultural and political
25 change.

1 So, in 1991, the gay and lesbian political
2 movement is among the most vigorous in the country. We're
3 in cities, towns and villages, in rural areas all over the
4 country, organizing, working, cajoling, pleading,
5 lobbying, pressing for an end to discrimination and
6 violence and full citizenship, with full rights and full
7 responsibilities. In 1987, we marched, 650,000 strong, in
8 Washington, D. C. In April 1993, we will march again in
9 Washington, D. C.

10 I've heard it said that the National
11 Commission on AIDS is too good on the issues. Isn't that
12 odd? Too good on the issues! I've heard it said that the
13 positions that you take are too far from what the White
14 House and what the people who work daily on Capitol Hill
15 really want to hear, so that they can't hear you any
16 longer. You are too activist, you are too out of the
17 mainstream. And I just want to say, if this is true,
18 congratulations. Because you are probably doing the right
19 thing. And I urge you to tell those folks on Capitol
20 Hill, who feel like they can't hear you any longer, that
21 they are just going to have to listen. Because, like us,
22 you will have to tell them that you will not give up, you
23 will not shut up, and you will not go away.

24 I thank you very much.

25 MR. KESSLER: Well, thank you all very, very

1 much.

2 We have about ten minutes for some
3 discussion. I would ask that the questions or comments be
4 kept brief, and that the responses be brief, too, so that
5 we can hear from as many people as possible in that ten or
6 twelve minutes.

7 Mr. Goldman.

8 MR. GOLDMAN: Thank you.

9 I'd like to ask all of you a question, and
10 some of you have different capacities that you're here in,
11 then, maybe you can look at from that perspective.

12 Eric and Richard talked, and all of you have
13 talked about some of the many gay and lesbian communities
14 that you come from, and talking in terms of the
15 pluralistic sense of it. I know that we just spent a time
16 with the Native American Communities, and I found a
17 tremendous diversity even in the states of Minnesota and
18 South Dakota that I went to, much less the states of
19 Oklahoma and New Mexico and Arizona, that other members of
20 the Commission went to. So we are talking about many
21 diversities.

22 Is it possible, from an administrative or
23 political sense -- and, in that sense, perhaps I'm
24 addressing Marjorie Hill and Paul Davis in their positions
25 with the municipal government -- to deal with that kind

1 cacophony of different kinds of voices and different kinds
2 of communities? Can you -- I mean, can you deal with all
3 of those differences and effectively use the very limited
4 resources that are available? And, from a political
5 perspective, Sue Hyde, can you deal politically with all
6 of these different cacophonies without some kind of unity
7 between them, and does that unity deny the individuality
8 that Eric and others of you have spoken to?

9 DR. HILL: Good organizing, in my opinion,
10 takes into account diversity. The reality of our society
11 is that we have lived a lie, a lie that we are one
12 culture, primarily one religion, with primarily one family
13 type. It is not only possible, although very time
14 consuming and a difficult job to be inclusive, but it's
15 necessary in order to reflect what is, in fact, a
16 realistic picture of society. I'll give you one quick
17 example:

18 Education that is not multi-cultural will
19 not prepare our children to deal in a pluralistic society,
20 which is the problem, so that it will take a lot of time
21 to develop good multi-cultural education that is inclusive
22 of African-American, Native American, lesbian and gay
23 history, women's history that is truly something to be
24 proud of. I mean, it's going to take more work to do
25 that, but that is our task and that is our responsibility.

1 In terms of how I personally try to deal
2 with it, is, that, I try to find the common threads
3 between the communities, between the different
4 representatives from the communities, and promote those
5 things which we, as a community, or communities, plural,
6 can agree upon. Those things that we cannot reach some
7 type of consensus are not unimportant, but they are things
8 that in government we may not be able to address today.

9 MR. DAVIS: In response to your question,
10 even in terms as I explained the very diversity, if you
11 look at America, as a whole, there are various cultural
12 issues that one has to deal with to reach various
13 populations. Once you even look at the black community,
14 you are talking about a great diversity. Then, if you
15 subdivide the gay community -- in other words a poster
16 that shows a black person talking about AIDS, the drag
17 queen or the transvestite may not identify with that
18 person, and say: That's not me. Well, the person who
19 simply says, "I have sex with men, but do not call me
20 gay," they don't identify with that. So, you are talking
21 about a very diversified group of persons and that goes
22 the full gamut of the community, that somehow or other you
23 have to reach and begin to realize this does affect you.

24 I think is a mistake we made early along in
25 this whole thing, that we put groups together and said

1 this is the information. And people said, "That's not
2 me."

3 MS. HYDE: I think there are two processes
4 going on. One is an intercommunity process of cultural
5 development. I'll just call it that, for lack of a more
6 precise or economical phrase.

7 The other process that is going on is how
8 persons of a minority sexual orientation are understood
9 and then dealt with in law and policy. Just as the phrase
10 "race and national origin" includes people of many races
11 and national origins, the phrase "sexual orientation"
12 includes many manifestations and expressions of sexual
13 orientation -- including, by the way, heterosexuality.
14 It's just that heterosexual people are not generally
15 discriminated against on account of that.

16 So, I don't think that in creating law and
17 policy the point is necessarily to unify the cacophony;
18 but, rather, level the playing field.

19 MR. KESSLER: Belinda Mason.

20 MS. MASON: It is good to see you Eric.

21 I want to thank all of you. This has been
22 so good for me. I've been listening to a four-year old
23 for about eight months and it's just wonderful to hear
24 smart people talk about, you know, important things.

25 My question is, for Richard: Maybe you know

1 at the First National Commission on AIDS Hearing, we had
2 Willy Beetlevon (phonetic) from Arizona?

3 MR. LA FORTUNE: South Dakota.

4 MS. MASON: And he spoke about his
5 experience of being a young Indian man, who lived with
6 AIDS in a very small, close-knit, extended-family sort of
7 community. His experience was incredibly negative and
8 horrible, in that it almost brought everyone in the room
9 to tears. I think it's real important for us to keep
10 hearing stories like that. That's the only thing that's
11 ever going to personalize this thing. I mean, I could sit
12 up here today and rattle off to you the names of 21 people
13 that I've been close to in the last three years who are
14 gone now. I could probably take five extra minutes and
15 tell you who it is for me to live with it, and you would
16 know it in your heart.

17 But, I was really wondering about the -- his
18 family was very religious and they were Roman Catholic.
19 And you touched on this some, but I wish you would
20 elaborate a little bit on the influence of the Roman
21 Catholic Church on your traditional mores and values and
22 your cultural expressions, and particularly the impact
23 that it had on sexuality, and whether or not you found
24 that your culture was affected in affected in a different
25 way than other cultures.

1 MR. LA FORTUNE: Do you mean my particular
2 nation or native people in general?

3 MS. MASON: Just your nation.

4 MR. LA FORTUNE: Well, I looked at my watch,
5 when I finished my last couple sentences, and -- or my
6 colleagues -- and I really couldn't say anything more
7 because I had already gone over by about a minute and a
8 half, or so. And I didn't get to talk about homophobia in
9 the native communities.

10 It's very severe, especially in light of our
11 traditional history. It's not uncommon to hear stories
12 like Willy's. There are pockets of people, and sometimes
13 they are fairly large. What Paul was saying about the
14 black church, sometimes you will feel the vestiges, the
15 residual of the traditional beliefs, when you see and hear
16 people say: Well, can you play the organ? Can you do
17 what you're asking us, in stopping someone else from
18 living in the expression of their lives?

19 The effect of the Catholic Church, I can't
20 speak to that specifically because I wasn't raised with a
21 Catholic Church around me. I was raised with the
22 Protestant Church. As far as teachings about sexuality,
23 or the lack of teachings about sexuality, the feeling of
24 sexuality means something really quite bad, has been and
25 continues to be, especially in light of the rise of

1 charismatic and fundamentalistic expressions of
2 Christianity. It has a very, very damaging effect upon
3 many of our peoples across this continent, and in other
4 parts of the globe.

5 MS. MASON: Thank you.

6 MR. KESSLER: Any final comments?

7 DR. HILL: There was a question that
8 Commissioner Allen asked earlier relative to what can be
9 done, and I think that it's very important that a
10 multitude of voices are heard in terms of gay and lesbian
11 issues. Until we are able, as a society, to address the
12 issues of difference in a compassionate nonjudgmental --
13 which, you know, sounds a little fundamentalist, when I
14 started to say it. But I think it's really important that
15 that is part of the goal: to hear the voices and not make
16 the judgment.

17 The Commission, by virtue of having this
18 panel, I think is interested in the diversity in the
19 community. The decisions that are made unilaterally about
20 health care and housing, and how national spending is
21 made, you know, Congress and the Senate makes those
22 decisions. They make them for everyone. I think the
23 issue of how inclusive, or how representative our national
24 and sometimes our local bodies are, is a question that is
25 raised not only by the lesbian and gay community, but by

1 many people-of-color communities across our nation. So, I
2 think we make, those of us in many positions, make those
3 decisions. Sometimes, we make them with a lot of
4 information; and, sometimes, we make them with a little
5 bit. I think that the more information that we have, the
6 better the decisions will be.

7 MR. KESSLER: Harlon.

8 MR. DALTON: Actually, I've been thinking
9 about Don Goldman's question about whether, once you take
10 seriously diversity and the range of experiences that
11 people have and ways in which we lead our lives, whether
12 it is possible to have a kind of coherent policy. It
13 occurs to me that one thing that policy needs to do is
14 really reflect one of the things that Eric said at the
15 beginning, and try to define community, gay community,
16 bisexual community.

17 He said not only are we talking about
18 culture, not only are we talking about lifestyles, but we
19 are talking about creating a safer world for people who
20 fall within this definition of community. Because, in
21 fact, as Richard pointed out, gay, bisexual, these are
22 just sort of artificial kinds of divisions anyway, and
23 people have to work within them because they are thrust
24 upon people. Every individual's own situation is
25 infinitely more complex, and that's true for straights, as

1 well as gays, if we use those divisions. But, what's
2 important is to use public policy in a way that creates a
3 safe space for people of a whole range of sexualities and
4 life experiences. I mean, that the take-home message from
5 this panel, it seems to me.

6 OOOOOOOOOOOOOO MR. KESSLER: Eric.

7 OOOOOOOOOOOOOO MR. ROFES: In response to that, I think
8 it's really important to look at, in terms of AIDS
9 prevention and services, that until the government sees a
10 role supporting the creation of those diverse communities,
11 understanding that we will not halt the spread of HIV
12 among gay male youth until we've done something quite
13 separate from HIV prevention, to make this world safe,
14 this nation safe for gay male youth, that is the critical
15 message. I think that linkage had to be there. We have
16 kids in the schools, out of the schools right now, who
17 feel horrible about who they are. Even if they get
18 wonderful sex education courses, they hate themselves
19 because this country, and the policies of this country,
20 have not given them a place to feel safe and comfortable
21 being who they are.

22 So, I think part of your message, I would
23 counsel you, needs to be just as understanding the ethnic
24 minority community empowerment as essential in insuring
25 their health. This is where it gets real political and

1 that's your job: insuring the empowerment of lesbian,
2 gay, bisexual communities of all this diversity is
3 essential in protecting our health.

4 MR. KESSLER: Well, thank you all very, very
5 much. And, on that note, we will adjourn until 1:15 this
6 afternoon in this room.

7 (Whereupon, at 12:00 noon, the hearing in
8 the above-entitled matter was adjourned, to
9 reconvene at 1:15 p.m., the same day.)

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

A F T E R N O O N S E S S I O N1:15p.m.

1
2
3 MR. KESSLER: The next panel we are going to
4 be dealing with is The Response of "Sexually-Identified"
5 Communities to the HIV Epidemic. And the order of
6 presenters will be: Mr. David Barr; Paul Bonenberg;
7 Jerome Boyce; followed by Vali Kanuha; Mr. Jose Perez; and
8 Dr. Maxine Wolf.

9 So, why don't we start with David Barr. And
10 I believe you each have about five minutes. If you go
11 over that in a large way, or significant way, I will use
12 my prerogative to cut you off. So, we really want to
13 engage everyone as much as possible this afternoon in this
14 dialogue.

15 DR. OSBORN: As I said this morning, I
16 apologize for the five-minute constraint, except that it
17 does allow us to interact and get a chance to draw you out
18 on some issues of particular interest to the Commission.
19 So, we appreciate your putting up with that kind of really
20 tough time constraint.

21 //

22 //

23 //

24 //

25 //

1 The Response of "Sexually-Identified" Communities to .oc1
2 the HIV Epidemic

3 David Barr

Paul Bonenberg

4 Jerome Boyce

Valli Kanuha, M.S.W.

5 Jose Perez

Maxine Wolfe

6 MR. BARR: I'm really going to try to stick
7 to it so that we can -- I think the open discussions are
8 really helpful.

9 I am David Barr. I work at the Gay Men's
10 Health Crisis in New York City. Before that, I worked at
11 Lambda Legal Defense Fund, and I'm a long-term member of
12 ACT UP, the AIDS Coalition to Unleash Power in New York
13 City. I'm a gay man. I'm HIV-positive.

14 I'm the first person today who is
15 identifying as openly HIV-positive, the first speaker. I
16 just want to say at the outset that I think it's really
17 important that we are always here, that we are always out
18 front; and that, whenever possible, we publicly identify
19 as HIV-positive because our voice has got to be right at
20 the front of the line.

21 I'm supposed to talk about the response, and
22 I will talk from the response of a sexually-identified
23 community, and like what's -- I have to put some limits on
24 it. I can talk about the community that I come from,
25 which is middle class, white gay man in New York City,

1 which has very little to do with San Francisco or anywhere
2 else.

3 DR. OSBORN: We know that.

4 MR. BARR: Yes.

5 Paul and I just had an interesting
6 conversation about helping to organize a candlelight vigil
7 in New York. I said, "We don't do that in New York."
8 There are reasons for that. Our response is different
9 than it is in San Francisco. Not better, it's not worse,
10 it's different.

11 I think the most important thing to say
12 about our response is that we are ten years into the
13 epidemic. Eight, nine years ago, you know, we said we
14 have an understanding -- we are beginning to have an
15 understanding about what this disease is and how it is
16 transmitted, and how we can keep it from being
17 transmitted. Our community developed ways to prevent HIV
18 infection from being spread. And we said so, and we
19 discussed it, and we put it out there in the open, and we
20 said to the country: If you don't discuss this openly,
21 this infection will rage.

22 Now, you know, we are approaching 200,000
23 cases. It's ten years into it. We were absolutely right.
24 And so much of this disease could have been prevented
25 worldwide. The U. S.'s responses to this epidemic has had

1 an effect worldwide on spreading this disease. The
2 policies that we developed, or didn't develop, caused the
3 spread of HIV infection, caused it. And the reason why we
4 developed those policies was because of who was getting
5 sick at the outset.

6 Because of the homophobia, the policies
7 were: we can't talk about this. We can't talk about the
8 way these people have sex. We can't discuss this openly.
9 We can't talk about it to our kids. Well, those kids are
10 18 to 25 now, and they're dying. So, it's murder.
11 Because we knew what we could do; and because, because of
12 the prejudice and fear, we didn't do what we were supposed
13 to do. We said it would happen, and it happened, and it
14 makes me mad.

15 The community that I come from is more
16 middle class than many other AIDS-infected communities.
17 There is more money around. There is some more education.
18 So, we were able to respond.

19 You know, I was going through figures. The
20 New York Times in June/July 1981 put out the first
21 article: Rare cancer seen in 41 homosexuals. So those
22 were the first supposed AIDS deaths. They weren't the
23 first AIDS deaths, you know. They were the first AIDS
24 deaths among a middle class white population so they were
25 the ones that got noticed. But once we -- once it was

1 noticeable to us, we began to respond. Within two months,
2 within four weeks of that article coming out, Larry Kramer
3 pulled a group of people together in his apartment and
4 said, "What are we going to do about this?" And the
5 organization began.

6 Because we knew from the outset that the
7 government wasn't going to come in and say: What are we
8 going to do? We've got a potential epidemic on our hands.
9 We've got to figure out how it is transmitted. How can we
10 support the people who are sick? How are we going to
11 provide services? How are we going to create education
12 programs? Because we knew that wasn't going to happen.
13 Because the whole -- because our very beings were illegal
14 in most of the states in this country, and our families
15 disowned us -- not mine. You know, we knew that there
16 wasn't going to be a societal response that was going to
17 help us. So we had to respond on our own.

18 Immediately, we were able to create support
19 networks to help people deal with this emotionally.
20 Client service networks, to get people benefits and
21 access, you know, to help them with their insurance
22 problems, get them doctors who were going to be sensitive.
23 Immediately, you know, we began to try to develop some
24 education programs to get people information about this.
25 And we became the AIDS experts. The whole concept of

1 safer sex came out of our community. And the concept of
2 developing a community-based organization that could
3 provide services and support and education for people
4 about HIV infection, and people with HIV infection, came
5 out of the community.

6 You know, we were fortunate enough to have
7 the money available to have a private fund raising base to
8 create these organizations and to provide some services.
9 It wasn't enough. It's never been enough. It should
10 never have been up to us to do it by ourselves, but there
11 was no other choice. And we created those structures, and
12 I think we did a very good job of it.

13 If you look at, you know, those cities where
14 the structures were most successful, and the education
15 programs were most successful, at least among that group
16 of self-identified gay men, we saw the infection, new
17 infection rates decline. In this city, they declined
18 dramatically down to zero, to 1 percent.

19 So, we were right about how to prevent the
20 spread of HIV infection. It worked. But was it taken on?
21 No. Instead, instead, the government did everything that
22 it possibly could to prevent us from getting that message
23 out. And it wasn't just Senator Helms, though he was
24 certainly a good instigator. But every person in
25 Congress, and in the Senate, who voted in favor of the

1 Helms Amendment, you know, is responsible for all of the
2 HIV infection that spread throughout this country after
3 that amendment was passed.

4 Imagine having a disease that is transmitted
5 sexually and the government doesn't allow sexually-
6 explicit education materials to be put out. How can that
7 be? Now I sit back and I think: How can that be? How
8 can it be that I can't use government funds to teach
9 people to put on a condom? I can't show them a picture,
10 you know, if it's two men standing together, because I'm
11 promoting homosexuality. Instead, I should be not allowed
12 to do that and allow them to get sick and die. That's the
13 message. And the message -- like, how can that be that
14 it comes from this incredibly pervasive fear and hatred of
15 who I am? You know, who I choose to have sex with? And
16 not even who I choose to have sex with, it isn't even
17 that. It is the fact that I say it, all right?

18 Sue brought up the Army policy, the military
19 policy. What was amazing about the Perry Watkins Case,
20 the most amazing part about the Perry Watkins Case, was
21 that the Army was not -- the Army's policy, the military
22 policy, wasn't that he should be thrown out of the
23 military because he had sex with me, right? It had to do
24 with -- and the court case was around the fact that he
25 said he had sex with men, not whether he did it. And, in

1 fact, the policy said: Well, if you were caught having
2 sex with another man, and you were drunk, or you were -- I
3 swear this is in the policy; I swear it's there -- you
4 were drunk, you said, "Well, I was curious," or "He talked
5 me into it," then, it was okay; you can stay in the
6 military. But if you say, "I'm gay," and you don't have
7 sex, they can throw you out. So, it's just the fact that
8 you say it that has cost the lives, you know, of ten of
9 thousands, eventually millions, of people in this country,
10 and tens of millions of people worldwide.

11 Yet, in the fact of all of that, right in
12 the face -- and that's, you know, sort of like you look at
13 it on the federal level, how could they do it; you take it
14 to a state, to a local level, take it to every job site in
15 the country, you know, the pervasiveness of homophobia and
16 the effect that it had on people being able to just access
17 AIDS information, how can it be? You know, because of the
18 homophobia, you couldn't fit in your high school class,
19 your health care class, and say: I want to know about
20 AIDS, because that tagged you. If you were interested, if
21 wanted to know, then, you must have been doing something
22 wrong, you know. Then, you must -- Oh! You must be gay.
23 He's asking the question.

24 MR. KESSLER: We're going to have to come
25 back to you.

1 MR. BARR: All right. Well, give me two
2 more minutes, minute and a half.

3 (Laughter.)

4 MR. BARR: One more minute, okay? I was
5 going to keep it short.

6 Because there is an important piece that, in
7 addition to the response that we created in providing
8 services to our own, we also had to respond in a political
9 way. And that is what ACT UP is.

10 ACT UP said: I am an HIV-positive person.
11 I am not going to let you ignore me. You can try to
12 ignore me, but I'm going to lay down in the street, and
13 the agent of the government, the policeman, is going to
14 have drag my ass off and put me in jail; and the court is
15 going to have to deal with me. I will not be made
16 invisible. I will be dealt with. And, in doing that, we
17 have changed the way drugs are researched and approved in
18 this country. We have changed the AIDS agenda, and we
19 have changed the way -- we have helped to change the way
20 that the country deals with AIDS. So that political
21 response has been essential, and I think has been
22 successful; but, God! do we have a lot more to do.

23 Thank you.

24 MR. KESSLER: Thank you.

25 Paul Bonenberg.

1 MR. BONENBERG: I am Paul Bonenberg. I have
2 been a gay activist, since 1975. I am now currently
3 working in AIDS activism. I expect to resume gay activism
4 once we've dealt with the AIDS issue.

5 I think it is important to understand that
6 the activism of a lesbian and gay community dealing with
7 AIDS comes from prior activism around lesbian and gay
8 issues and civil rights issues. It needs to be viewed in
9 that context.

10 I am the executive director of Mobilization
11 Against AIDS, which is the oldest AIDS lobbying group,
12 political group, in California, and that has been involved
13 in all the major political battles around HIV and AIDS,
14 including the ballot initiatives in this state, since that
15 time.

16 I think it is important to understand a
17 couple of things about the lesbian and gay community when
18 AIDS first hit in 1981. The most important thing to
19 understand is that it was a political community. To be a
20 homosexual -- there have always been homosexuals -- that
21 is not in and of itself, a community. It is when you say,
22 as David said in the military, or at some other position,
23 I am homosexual, or I am gay, it is at that point you are
24 making a political statement. This is a community that is
25 defined of people who make a political statement. If they

1 don't make that statement, they do not identify themselves
2 within the gay community, necessarily. It is when you say
3 I am gay, and take out all the political ramifications of
4 losing your job, of being attacked, of having
5 judicial/legislative things done to you, that is when the
6 gay community comes into existence.

7 It is important to understand that in the
8 context of AIDS. Because that community, when AIDS hit,
9 knew two things, basically: One was that we were
10 oppressed, and there were great civil rights dangers.
11 There was a collective memory, institutional memory, that
12 went back to when people were given lobotomies, when
13 people were given electroshock treatment, when lists were
14 kept of people because they were gay. There was also an
15 institutional memory that said: We can do something about
16 that, but we have organize politically. So AIDS struck a
17 political community in the United States, which, of
18 course, was the worse thing for the lesbian and gay
19 community. I also admit it was one of the best things
20 that could have happened for the planet, as a whole, to
21 try to respond to defeating this virus.

22 The response in the community in '81, I
23 think, and in most communities, first was denial. Part of
24 that was because that gay people died, or were allowed to
25 die, or were killed in 1981, and it was not a surprising

1 thing. I mean, Harvey Milk, for example, who had been
2 assassinated only a year or two earlier in this city, and
3 the killer had been basically set free. Gay men were
4 being killed often throughout the United States. It was
5 not an unusual phenomena.

6 So, the idea that gay people would be
7 allowed to die was not surprising in 1981. What was
8 inconceivable was that hundreds of thousands of gay people
9 would be allowed to die. That 50 percent of the whole
10 population out of the gay communities, out of the gay men,
11 would be allowed to die. That was inconceivable. It
12 couldn't be comprehended for a few years. We were in a
13 state of political denial about what the statistics meant.

14 Then, when the whole issue of grief --
15 grieving is normally the first thing that occurs, once you
16 get past the denial. Often, that manifests itself in
17 candlelight memorials, which often is the first organizing
18 thing a community does, where they say we have something
19 to grieve about here in Altoona, or here in Manila, or
20 here in Warsaw; and that's the beginning of political
21 organizing, as it was in San Francisco, New York and Los
22 Angeles in 1983, when the first candlelight memorials
23 began there.

24 At a next stage, generally what occurs is
25 political organizing, and, with that, the attendant anger,

1 where people understand they really do mean allowing
2 hundreds of thousands of people to die. This enrages the
3 community, brings unity to the community, and allows
4 people to move forward. The assumption on the other side,
5 what we encountered on the other side, was the hate foe
6 the people who were being struck by this disease simply
7 for who they were. There was unequivocal hate from the
8 very moment organizing began. There was never any doubt
9 that there would be hate, but there was. You could not
10 walk into a legislative office in 1983, 1984 or 1985 and
11 not be immediately assumed to be a homosexual; and,
12 therefore, at least a political liability, if not outright
13 opposition to everything this legislator believed in.
14 That was an immediate assumption when you were trying to
15 organize around this disease.

16 The result of that was that there were
17 attacks, civil rights, attacks immediately, using AIDS to
18 attack the civil rights of lesbian and gay people. One of
19 the first issues was the bathhouses. We don't like gay
20 people, let's stop where they have sex. We will shut down
21 bathhouses. That debate divided the community.
22 Ultimately, in some cities, bathhouses were shut; other
23 cities, they were not.

24 An interesting footnote to that debate, I
25 think, is that there now should be statistical evidence as

1 to whether or not there was benefit to shutting the
2 bathhouses. In other words, if a city did shut, there
3 should be a drop in new infections; if they did shut
4 bathhouses, perhaps there would not be a drop in new
5 infections. Or, you can compare cities that did versus
6 cities that did not. But, in any case, we are now far
7 enough away from the first civil rights battle of 1984 to
8 ascertain what occurred around that. Was it a correct
9 health decision? Or, was it, in fact, civil rights
10 issues?

11 A number of the old-time activists, dealing
12 with the collective memory of the community said: They
13 are trying to gather lists of us. They are trying to
14 oppress us. We remember this from the '50s. Don't trust
15 them. Many people, new to the community, said: That's
16 not true. You are being hysterical. The doctors are our
17 friends. Don't worry about it.

18 Ultimately, the civil rights people, I
19 think, proved to be correct. There were ballot
20 initiatives in California to quarantine people. There
21 were two quarantine initiatives in California, one in '86
22 and one in '88. There was also a mandatory testing
23 provision put forward that was endorsed by the Republican
24 Party and the governor of the state of California. All of
25 those were ultimately defeated principally, in fact

1 overwhelmingly, by the lesbian and gay community that was
2 based in a whole civil rights framework.

3 I think that, had it not been for the
4 collective experience of the lesbian and gay community
5 around civil rights, you may well have had in the United
6 States mandatory testing, mandatory reporting, and
7 possibly even further punitive actions up to and including
8 isolation for people with HIV. I think that we do not
9 have that is, in part, because of the political experience
10 of the lesbian and gay community.

11 Just to conclude, the other side of the
12 organizing community was not civil rights. It was moving
13 forward. One thing the community had learned was: the
14 first thing elected officials tell you is: it can't be
15 done. Because, that's what they always say when you deal
16 with the issue of quality for lesbian and gay people. It
17 can't be done. The second is: Well, we'll deal with it
18 later. And the third issue is: Trust us, we'll take care
19 of it.

20 The response that the community had learned
21 was: There are no friends like us actually up there
22 pushing for it. That translated into the politics of
23 AIDS. It put people with HIV infection in positions of
24 power. They are the only people ultimately who are as
25 good a friend, as we are ourselves. It is a direct

1 translation from what the lesbian and gay community
2 learned in terms of elective lesbian and gay elected
3 officials who were putting openly lesbian and gay people
4 in power.

5 That issue of empowerment of a patient is
6 unique, I think, in the politics of medicine in the United
7 States. It comes directly from the experience of the
8 lesbian and gay community in terms of empowering its own
9 people.

10 I think the response of the lesbian and gay
11 community to AIDS is unique because of its political
12 nature, because of it's past history, and was extremely
13 beneficial to this country. The communities learned one
14 thing, I think, many things around this; but one thing in
15 particular: There is a greater need for coalition, that
16 isn't just the lesbian and gay community that is suffering
17 a great tragedy; but, obviously, AIDS is striking many
18 other people throughout this country and throughout the
19 world. That type of coalition needs to be strengthened.

20 I think, in 1979 and 1980, there was,
21 perhaps, not as great a recognition of the social
22 responsibilities that one community has to another; that
23 to achieve and increase biomedical research for AIDS, we
24 now need to increase biomedical research for all diseases.
25 To achieve health care, we need national health care. To

1 achieve equality, we need broad-based equality for all
2 groups of people. That was a theoretical construct, I
3 think, in the late '70s.

4 In the early 1990s, it's reality. It is
5 clearly understood by all AIDS activists, and I think most
6 of the lesbian and gay community, that the battle is
7 interlinked with these other struggles in the most
8 fundamental life and death sort of way. I hope that is
9 something that we will build on to defeat this virus as we
10 go into the '90s.

11 Thank you.

12 MR. KESSLER: Thank you, Paul.

13 Jerome Boyce.

14 MR. BOYCE: Thank you.

15 I am very happy to be here today to speak to
16 the Commission because I am concerned about policy. I
17 think the Commission's job is to influence policy, talking
18 directly with Congress and working with the president.

19 Our policy makers and decision makers and
20 funders usually view HIV infection in minority communities
21 as something that is new. It's not. Our community has
22 responded to this epidemic for a long time. Sexually-
23 identified communities are very diverse, especially in
24 communities of color. This diversity has been spoken to
25 earlier today, and I think it's something that we must

1 really understand, that we cannot deal with HIV in a
2 vacuum.

3 Issues linked to our daily living, issues
4 linked to who and what we are, are too important to look
5 at in a vacuum. The strategies that we must adapt to
6 reach communities of color, and especially the African-
7 American community, must no longer be based on models that
8 are not based within a cultural content and the cultural
9 norms of our community. So often as I do HIV work, I'm in
10 a dilemma. Because the strategies that are approved and
11 funded, and the priorities set, are not those of my
12 community.

13 I hope you are following me on this.
14 Because, it is very important that we understand that we
15 must change our priorities and deal with it from a
16 holistic approach. HIV affects the whole person and
17 impacts us everyday.

18 How have we responded? We responded with
19 denial. My community, African-American Community, black
20 gay men, HIV infected, living with AIDS for over seven
21 years, we have responded with denial, still. It has a lot
22 to do with my community and how they respond to a lot of
23 things. It's been very slow. The strategies that we have
24 come up with to deal with this epidemic have not been
25 funded. When they have been funded, it has been

1 minuscule.

2 I live in the state of Michigan and it's
3 very progressive on paper. And I must say that, on paper.
4 Forty-seven percent of the people living with HIV
5 infection are black and live in Southeastern Michigan, 47
6 percent. Yet, we do not get the state dollars. Yet, we
7 do not get the federal dollars. They are given to people
8 who cannot work with our community in a culturally
9 confident way. That boils down to racism.

10 People need to understand that the policies
11 that you make and suggest today, and the priorities that
12 you make and suggest today, are very important. Holistic
13 is the word. We cannot address AIDS if we don't deal with
14 unemployment, self-esteem issues, sexuality, human
15 sexuality, understanding the full ramifications of that.

16 So, these are things that I would like to
17 leave you with today. We deal with this, as a community,
18 despite our own internalized homophobia. That's been the
19 biggest barrier to AIDS education in the African-American
20 gay community. Our own internalized homophobia, the
21 homophobia that exists within our community, as a whole
22 and as in the African-American community, it very rampant.
23 So we must deal with that. But we still, in spite of all
24 that, have chose to respond.

25 What I would like to say is: We can only

1 combat this denial with real programs, with real programs
2 that ideally, from a culturally-sensitive, culturally-
3 competent base, deals with the whole person. Think about
4 changing our priorities. Think about funding people on
5 the base of need in our community. Think about reviewing
6 these policies in a context that these are communities
7 that have lots of problems, and we must address them all.
8 People who are fatalistic, by their life experience, find
9 it very difficult to understand education for HIV. It's
10 just one of many problems that they have in their lives.
11 So, I think we need to really look at priorities.
12 Priorities, I can't emphasize that enough.

13 Local governments do not respond on the same
14 level as our national, unless you mandate it. And that's
15 a job that you can do in policy. Let the dollars reflect
16 the epidemic. If 47 percent of the people in Michigan
17 have AIDS and they are African-American males, I can't see
18 why we can't receive at least 25 percent of the dollars in
19 that state so that we can address the issue. I think we
20 need to look at it in a different context.

21 I hope this is not viewed as divisive.
22 Because needs within all people- of-color communities are
23 high. We must look at them maybe with a different
24 criteria. Our model has been wrong. The concepts that we
25 put forth, as how we would judge something, the criteria,

1 is not always appropriate for our communities.

2 We still choose to respond. We need to be
3 developed. And I say that as a black gay man who is HIV
4 infected. Our community needs community support. We also
5 need community development to respond in a way that we can
6 be a lot more capable. This comes from within us, from
7 empowerment. But it also comes back to our government's
8 commitment to our community. I'm a taxpayer. I'm a state
9 resident. My community is in financial trouble. I think
10 I am entitled to my state dollars and my federal dollars
11 for health care. It doesn't happen. That's policy.

12 Thank you.

13 00000000000000MR. KESSLER: Thank you, Jerome.

14 Valli Kanuha.

15 MS. KANUHA: I guess I'd like to start by
16 publicly acknowledging the gratitude that will be from
17 everyone in this room, and around the world, to the gay
18 male community for their efforts around stemming the HIV
19 and AIDS epidemic in this country and internationally. As
20 we talk today and spend this day talking sexual identities
21 and sexual orientation, and talking about how it
22 interfaces with issued of HIV and AIDS, we cannot at any
23 time we talk about this epidemic forget to owe a
24 tremendous debt of gratitude to the gay male community.
25 Whenever we talk about HIV and AIDS and mobilization and

1 community organization, and changing the policies and
2 thoughts, and hearts and minds of this country, and
3 internationally, we must owe that debt to the gay male
4 community.

5 I want to start by saying a couple things in
6 response to the speakers from this morning. You know,
7 what we've heard throughout the morning is a lot about the
8 complexity of human sexual behavior, and also about the
9 language by which we communicate about it. And many of
10 the speakers, as well as those of you on the Commission,
11 have asked some questions around this issue of labeling.
12 And there are a couple of things I want to say about that.

13 The labels of gay, bisexual, lesbian and
14 heterosexual -- I hope you all know, from this morning,
15 and at the end of this day -- refer not only to sexual
16 acts, but also to the thoughts, the fantasies, and all the
17 parts lifestyle that really define what a cultural and a
18 community really is. These labels, gay, bisexual,
19 lesbian, heterosexual, in terms of the AIDS crisis, have
20 been responsible for our finest and most creative programs
21 and policies, and those same labels have been responsible
22 for the greatest drawbacks in terms of doing something
23 about the epidemic.

24 With regard to HIV, as a sexually-
25 transmitted disease, we have been stymied in developing

1 effective strategies to stem and to curb HIV due, in my
2 opinion, to two major reasons: The first one is the
3 repressive and oppressive and phobic beliefs and
4 subsequent policies about sexuality in general. I think
5 that was articulated very well this morning. Secondly,
6 the assumption of heterosexism and the implicit assumption
7 in heterosexism of male and female sexuality as the
8 primary or only means of sexual expression. In other
9 words, if it was totally okay and right and good that you
10 could be all that you are or desire to be as a sexual
11 person, the labels that we've created to include all who
12 are not primarily or only heterosexual in their fantasies,
13 thoughts of behavior, would become merely descriptive, if
14 not hopefully celebratory. And the values that we
15 attribute therefore to sexual behavior, and to those
16 communities of people who so identify with that behavior,
17 would also be part and parcel of a diverse and rich
18 society.

19 Regarding HIV and AIDS, we would not then be
20 so concerned about special programs or policies for a
21 Hawaiian man, who is heterosexual, but has occasional
22 sexual intercourse with a bisexually-identified man, who
23 himself is sexual with a lesbian. We wouldn't care about
24 those kinds of terminologies. We would instead remember
25 what we have learned over the last few years about HIV and

1 AIDS, and that is: Anyone can contract HIV by engaging in
2 unsafe sex; and that we would target all of our strategies
3 equally and creatively to lesbians, to occasional
4 heterosexuals, to men who have sex with men, to everyone,
5 to all of us in this room, who consider ourselves people
6 who are sexual beings. We would not be afraid of
7 transsexuals. We would not be afraid of cross-dressers.
8 We would not be afraid of lesbian youth, who must sell sex
9 to heterosexual men. And we would not be afraid of the
10 gay leather community. We would not be afraid.

11 So, in spite of all of those political and
12 social obstacles, what have sexually-identified
13 communities done to respond? I'd like to focus on two
14 communities: the gay men of color and lesbians.

15 Gay men of color, or men of color who
16 continue to contract HIV through homosexual contact, are
17 still disproportionately represented in HIV and AIDS
18 statistics. Unfortunately, due to racism, the white gay
19 male community has been remiss, has been slow, has been
20 not accountable to their gay male brothers in providing
21 the correct kind of attention, money, support and comfort
22 to gay men of color who are dying of HIV and AIDS all over
23 this country and internationally. And, in spite of that,
24 gay men of color all over the United States have been
25 organizing in their communities, among their friends and

1 loved ones, to develop innovative policies and programs to
2 address issues for gay men of color. But that's very
3 slow, and slow in coming. I hold the gay white male
4 community on notice to be responsive to your gay male
5 brothers of color. To communities of color who are
6 primarily heterosexual men and women, or heterosexually-
7 identified men and women, who are doing wonderful AIDS
8 work, I hold you on notice to include gay men of color in
9 your programming, in the leadership of your organizations;
10 to look at homosexuality, to look at homophobia in your
11 institutions, and to remember that the same way the white
12 gay male community is not exempt from the racism that is
13 endemic in the rest of society, communities of color are
14 not also immune from homophobia, and we are responsible
15 for addressing those things.

16 Lesbian have been involved with events
17 through our history: the labor movement, civil rights
18 movement, and the anti-war movement have included lesbians
19 in leadership throughout. And, in this crisis, lesbians
20 have been very active again in policy making, in nursing
21 our gay male brothers through the crisis, in developing
22 programs to deal with this issue. However, one of the
23 things that happens is: in the lesbian community and
24 among lesbians, there is a sense that we are immune from
25 HIV infection. This is something, I think, is again due

1 to the invisibility of lesbians as women in this society,
2 and lesbians as second-class citizens in the gay male
3 community. It's only been recently that the gay community
4 has used the collective term "gay and lesbian community."
5 And because that is so, lesbians often find themselves in
6 a position of not taking this epidemic very seriously in
7 terms of their own risk. So, lesbians are involved in the
8 work and lesbians need to be more attentive to their own
9 issues, their own protection.

10 In closing, what has been the impact on
11 American society in terms of what sexually-identified
12 communities have done over the last ten years? There are
13 three things: I think we are responsible, gay men,
14 lesbians, bisexuals, all of us who have pushed up against
15 heterosexual norms and the heterosexual imperative in
16 doing three things: the questioning the assumption of the
17 heterosexual imperative, which is that heterosexuality is
18 the norm and the best and the right and the only.

19 The second thing I think we've done is: we
20 have celebrated a diversity of sexual expression, which I
21 think you've heard all morning today, and, hopefully, this
22 afternoon.

23 The third one, which has been an unfortunate
24 result, I think of this epidemic, is: We have built
25 wonderful coalitions across very diverse lines of

1 communities and institutions, from church groups to
2 women's clubs, gay men and lesbians, and we have brought
3 activism -- thanks to ACT UP -- back into the streets
4 again. It took HIV and AIDS for this to happen. It took
5 a mobilization among the gay and lesbian community for
6 this to happen, and society is now changed. It will never
7 be the same again.

8 My charge to all of us is: Let no more of
9 us die because of who and why we love.

10 Thank you.

11 MR. KESSLER: Thank you.

12 Dr. Perez.

13 MR. PEREZ: I'm not a doctor, but I'd like
14 to thank the Commission for letting us, you know,
15 participate here and share our concerns. This is
16 something that is of great importance to me, and is a
17 great part of my life. I'd especially like to thank
18 Eunice Diaz and her efforts in our community to make AIDS
19 something to talk about. That was a very important
20 effort.

21 I'm a gay Latino person with AIDS. I am
22 cofounder of the National Latino Lesbian and Gay
23 Organization. Currently, I work at AIDS Project, Los
24 Angeles as a public policy specialist.

25 What I'm going to do is, is I am going to

1 try to describe where the Gay Latino Community emerged
2 from and how it was impacted by AIDS; and, then, how we
3 impacted the Latino community in general.

4 Throughout the '60s and '70s, openly gay
5 Latinos migrated from rural areas in Puerto Rico and the
6 Southwest, and sometimes Latin America, to large urban
7 centers throughout the U. S. Half of them, half of the U.
8 S. Latinos had dropped out of high school. The thing --
9 when we got to the cities, the thing that kept us together
10 and apart from the other gay and lesbian community were
11 our culture, our language, and our socioeconomic
12 background. Those were the foundations for our community
13 to stick together and strengthen itself.

14 When we found ourselves in the city, we
15 created extended families, based on our social, cultural
16 and socioeconomic backgrounds. Later, we created
17 organizations around those extended families, with names
18 like The Gay Chicano Caucus in Houston, Gay Hispanic,
19 United Gays and Lesbians in New York, the Colectivo Gay in
20 Puerto Rico, and Gay and Lesbian Latino in LA, just to
21 name a few.

22 These organizations were soon challenged by
23 AIDS, and they had no one to turn to. Gay and lesbian
24 white organizers considered us separatists; and,
25 therefore, we had no help from them. The Latino community

1 was very homophobic and couldn't see what our existence
2 was about. The way -- the first thing that happened to
3 our community, when we confronted with AIDS, was that we
4 were very afraid and we had a tremendous amount of denial
5 and a lot of us turned to substance abuse -- a large
6 proportion, just from my own circle of friends, and from
7 stories and people that I've heard, because we have no
8 data on that. We continue to deny "it," and hoped that it
9 would go away.

10 Finally, our friends started getting sick,
11 and it was overwhelming. It was overwhelming that
12 extended family members, and there was hardly any help. We
13 started taking care of them, but we had a fantastic
14 fatalistic attitude that said that we could just help them
15 die. And that's what we did.

16 Finally, our organizations started to react.
17 We reacted in many ways. The gay and lesbian, the
18 political groups, they started education campaigns; and,
19 then, other gay Latinos broke away and started AIDS
20 service organizations, particularly in the Southwest. Gay
21 Latino AIDS service organization, with roots in the Gay
22 Latino Community sprang up in Houston, Austin, Tucson, Los
23 Angeles, San Francisco, and they did it all through
24 volunteers and fund raisers. We did prevention programs,
25 safe sex workshops, with not a cent from any governmental

1 agency, from no foundation, from just fund raisers,
2 selling tamales, selling drag shows, et cetera. That's
3 what we had to do because there was no response from the
4 government or the existing AIDS service organizations.

5 This exhausted our community. And it
6 continues to exhaust us. We continue to not get any help.
7 And we continue to be there polarized because of our
8 culture, because of our language, because of our
9 socioeconomic background, a part from the gay community,
10 and part from the Latino Community. Finally, we carried
11 that message to the national level through the National
12 Latino Lesbian and Gay Organization, which also has
13 received little support from any institution or
14 governmental agency.

15 The impact of our community, Gay Latinos in
16 the U. S., responding to AIDS on the Latino Community has
17 been that we broke this myth that Latinos would not talk
18 about sexuality when it came to a life-threatening
19 disease. Through various methods, we discovered that it
20 was the clergy, it was the elected and nonelected
21 leadership, and others, business leaders, who kept that
22 message from reaching our community. I don't say that as
23 an indictment, but I say that as a fact: there needed to
24 be more response early on.

25 We continue to struggle to keep the doors of

1 the Gay Latino AIDS Service Organization open. Some
2 people will say that it's too specialized. But, in cities
3 like New York, where there is 10,000 Latinos with AIDS,
4 it's another story.

5 Finally, there is dozens of Gay Latino bars
6 throughout the U. S., dozens of Gay Latino restaurants,
7 and newsletters, publications, small as they are; but this
8 is still not enough proof for even the gay community that
9 we exist and that we're centered around our culture,
10 language and socioeconomic background. As long as that
11 happens, as long as that exists, we're going to be denied
12 the attention that we need to our needs from both
13 communities, the Latino, as well as the gay community. We
14 are stuck in that Catch-22: Who do we belong to?
15 Unfortunately, our sexuality that we adopted from the
16 dominant gay culture doesn't mix well with our Latino
17 culture, and that creates an issue.

18 Thank you.

19 MR. KESSLER: Thank you, Jose.

20 Maxine Wolfe.

21 MS. WOLFE: Hello.

22 I want to speak as someone who has been an
23 activist the last 30 years, working in different types of
24 social change movements, as a lesbian, part of the time
25 having to be in the closet in those movements. I want to

1 start with a little story.

2 You know, as fascism took hold in Germany in
3 the late '30s, and laws against Jews were being written
4 legally in Germany as the basis for the eventual plan of
5 extermination, Jewish-Americans got together and they
6 tried to petition Congress to change the immigration laws
7 in this country, which had been passed in 1921 and 1924,
8 on the basis of research that proved conclusively and
9 beyond the shadow of a doubt that Eastern Europeans, who
10 were primarily Jews, were feebleminded, sick, and should
11 not be let into this country. As a result, when Jews
12 wanted to get out of Europe, those laws were the barrier
13 in saving their lives. And in speaking to people in other
14 political groups, they told the Jewish-Americans that they
15 had better get Christians to speak for them. Because,
16 otherwise, people would think that we were too selfish
17 and had a self-interest.

18 I have always been a person who has disliked
19 the use of holocaust imagery and its application to the
20 AIDS crisis, especially as a Jew. But I feel that some
21 parts of that are extremely apropos, and that's one of
22 them.

23 Basically, lesbian and gay men have been
24 active in every political movement that has ever existed.
25 And in all of those movements, they have been told to stay

1 in the closet, and they have been told to let other people
2 speak for them. Because, if they did come forward,
3 everyone would think that we were selfish. And the AIDS
4 crisis has been exactly the same. I think it is very
5 important to remember that.

6 Our response politically has been quite
7 diverse. In fact, it started with actions against the
8 closing of the bathhouses in New York -- and I speak to
9 someone from New York. It continued to demonstrations
10 around the Supreme Court supporting the sodomy laws.
11 Eventually, then, ACT UP, which is what was just said,
12 what Joe just said, as those people said: We are tired
13 helping people to die; we want to help people to live.
14 And that is not a put-down on the service organizations,
15 it's just meant that people had discovered that, unless we
16 acted politically, all we could do was to help people to
17 die because no one was doing anything else.

18 In the wake of that, groups like ACT UP, and
19 other groups, started doing a lot of political work. And
20 every single bit of political work we have had to do, we
21 have to confront the twisting of the results of that in
22 terms of the concept of our special interests, and the
23 homophobia that was connected to that. So, as David said,
24 when we made comic books, they took the money away and
25 said we were promoting homosexuality. That

1 heterosexual is promoted every day and in every way in
2 this country is something that no one ever seems to get
3 hold of. But it is something I want to say clearly: we
4 could not possibly promote homosexuality to the extent
5 that heterosexuality is promoted.

6 We went and did our own research and we
7 started getting underground drugs in here to save people's
8 lives, and people started passing laws to prevent us from
9 bringing drugs in. Every single step of the way, we have
10 been told in everything that we have done, we have had a
11 barrier put up in front of it. So, it's very hard to
12 believe that someone does not want all of us dead. And I
13 am not a conspiracy theorist, but it really gets hard to
14 keep my eye on where I'm going when that keeps happening.

15 I want to talk also about the issue of
16 lesbians. Not only have we been active in every service
17 organization, but in every activist organization. And
18 every time we have raised the issues of the possibility
19 that lesbians could transmit HIV or be people with HIV,
20 people laugh at us; they laugh at us. James Karnes, head
21 of the CDC HIV Surveillance said: "Do lesbians have sex?"
22 This is the man who is responsible for doing the
23 epidemiology in this country in which no one has ever
24 asked a question about woman-to-woman transmission. And
25 that is partly because we cannot talk about sex. The CDC

1 epidemiology is still about risk groups and not about
2 behavior; and, therefore, cunnilingual behavior, for
3 example, does not get recorded and has not been recorded.
4 And any work that we have had to do in the lesbian
5 community to tell women that they may, in fact, be
6 engaging in behavior that is risky, and it may be sexual
7 behavior with a woman and not with a man that is sex that
8 is risky, we have gotten no research done on this, no
9 response to it at all. So, I hold the government, and
10 anyone who does not speak out about it, personally
11 responsible for the death of any lesbian who contracts HIV
12 through woman-to-woman sexual transmission.

13 I also want to say that the things that have
14 been discussed today, that we are a diverse community, but
15 we have to compromise that. We are intravenous drug
16 users. Lesbians, the majority of original cases of
17 lesbians with HIV have been intravenous drug users. And,
18 like any other oppressed community, any kind of substance
19 abuse is higher in those communities partly because people
20 are oppressed and it's stressful and they look for ways
21 out, and partly because the people who benefit from that
22 hang around the places that we are forced to go because we
23 cannot be out. They hang around bars, for example, and
24 give people what looks like an easy out to the stress. So
25 we are intravenous drug users. We are Black, Latin,

1 Native American, Latino. We are a diverse community.

2 When people talk about outreach, it is
3 always as if everyone in the gay community is white and
4 the outreach is out there. Instead of, that we are that
5 diversity, and because people frame things that way, it is
6 very easy for people to pit one community against one
7 another by acting as if we have no overlap. So I think
8 that's another thing that's clear.

9 I want to say, also, that every time we have
10 had to fight for our lives, people tell us that we're not
11 fighting for the lives of others. So, I want to tell you
12 just in a very quick list some of the things that ACT UP
13 -- which is always perceived as a gay white male
14 organization, middle class to boot, when, in fact, it is
15 not -- are doing.

16 We have a Latino bilingual forum that we do
17 on the lower east side for people in the community about
18 HIV. We are just finishing a women's treatment agenda,
19 and I've been working on women's issues for a long time.
20 We have a needle exchange program. We are doing work on
21 national health care. We are doing work on insurance
22 issues. We are doing work on condoms in schools. We have
23 produced a housing organization for housing for homeless
24 people. We've produced an AIDS treatment registry to list
25 clinical trials for everybody. That has been mailed out

1 all over the country.

2 This is not just work that has been done for
3 the gay community. It has been work that has been done
4 for everyone. And, in fact, one of our own problems that
5 comes from self-oppression is, that, a lot of gay men came
6 into ACT UP to hide behind AIDS, since it was easier to be
7 out there doing work about AIDS than to be doing work as
8 gay people, because of the homophobia in this country.
9 And one of the things that was very good about the
10 response of the gay community through activist groups like
11 ACT UP, and it's not the only one, has been to give people
12 a place where they can be both gay and people working on
13 the AIDS crisis, and to be proud of both of those things.

14 I want to end, also, with another anecdote.

15 When the Quilt came to New York, I was one
16 of the volunteers that opened up the Quilt in their
17 panels. And one of the people who did that with me was my
18 friend, Oliver, who died this year. And the end of
19 opening the Quilt, when you get to the last panel, there
20 is a blank panel and you can write whatever you want.
21 Oliver wrote: I will survive. And, I'm not even -- I'll
22 finish this. And the next day, I said to the pin --
23 that's a pin that used to be prevalent in the lesbian
24 community; it's a double ax that's a lesbian symbol.
25 Underneath it says: We will survive. And Oliver didn't

1 make it.

2 I would prefer that the policies you pass
3 make it possible for us to survive. We will survive,
4 anyway. Somebody will be here to bear witness.

5 (Applause.)

6 MR. KESSLER: Thank you very much.

7 Commissioners, do you have questions,
8 comments? Belinda?

9 MS. MASON: I want to thank all of you. It's
10 good to hear you. It's good to hear that some people are
11 doing the Lord's work in spite of everything. David, I'm
12 glad to meet you and see you here. I heard a lot about
13 you. You certainly have lived up to your reputation.

14 (Laughter.)

15 I have a few questions, in particular, for
16 as many of you all that would like to take it on, about
17 how it has been for organizations which were primarily
18 funded and organized, who has black, male, middle class
19 community. I was pleased to see on the bio sheet here
20 that Valli is working at GMHC and doing a lot of work with
21 children and women and prevention, and things. I'd like
22 to hear you tell me, first, David, about the difficulties
23 that you all experienced when you tried to transfer GMHC's
24 programs to children, women of color, heterosexuals, and
25 IVD users. I mean, as many as you will would like to talk

1 about your experience in that way, I'd like to hear it.

2 MR. BARR: The difficulties have been many.
3 GMHC, as the community-based organization that was founded
4 by a particular community, was best suited to work with
5 people from that community. As the epidemic grew -- but
6 because that community had this, had some money, our
7 responsibility had to be broader. And, as the epidemic
8 grew, or our knowledge of the epidemic grew, it was
9 necessary for the mission of GMHC, and the people that we
10 serve, to be broader. And that has been very difficult.

11 Right now, our client base -- we have about
12 4,500 active clients right now; and we provide education
13 for thousands more people -- our client base fairly
14 accurately reflects the demographics of AIDS in New York
15 City, which is a fact that is not well known, unfortunately,
16 in terms of our racial and gender breakdown. What I don't
17 have are statistics on the socioeconomic status of those
18 people.

19 We had to make certain decisions. We
20 decided that we were not going to be able to serve active
21 drug users as clients because we weren't equipped to deal
22 with, you know, a much broader array of issues and
23 services that that group of people needed, that we weren't
24 a drug treatment center. We didn't know how to do that,
25 and that wasn't the area we were going to move in.

1 We acknowledged that the way that we hired
2 people and trained people was going to have to change
3 drastically as the demographics of our client population
4 changed. Sometimes, we are more successful at that than
5 others. We realized that our educational programs had to
6 be -- we had to develop different kinds of educational
7 programs targeted and created by different groups of
8 people; that an education program that was for the
9 African-American Community had to be created by African-
10 American people, and was going to look different than the
11 ones the white gay men got. Some of that has worked
12 better than others.

13 I think there is another piece, which was an
14 acknowledgement that we were not going to be able to serve
15 everybody. That it was inappropriate for us to think
16 that we could. Not just because of the size that we would
17 have to become to do that; but, because culturally, it
18 doesn't really make sense. So, what we've done is help
19 other community-based organizations in other areas of New
20 York get started by providing training, technical support,
21 money, and by using like our resources -- you know, we got
22 a policy department of eight people. Now there's
23 community-based organizations in New York that have eight
24 people. So, one of the major roles of our policy
25 department is: as we work on issues, to always work on

1 those issues, in coalition. Now, it's a part of my job is
2 to always to make a lot of phone calls and bring people in
3 so that we can use those resources to make sure that there
4 are a lots of voices sitting at the table when we are
5 talking to the mayor or the governor, or you all.

6 So, that's sort of how we try to do it. It
7 is really -- it's just really hard, you know; nobody's
8 ever happy with it on any end.

9 MS. WOLFE: Can I say something about it?

10 I would say, you know, that part of the
11 problem there is their should be, given this epidemic,
12 there should be 10 to 12 organizations like GMHC in New
13 York, in all the different communities, of that scope, and
14 maybe we'd be somewhere. Now, part of that issue that, in
15 some ways, any organization that managed to get formed
16 early on ends up being given the primary responsibility.
17 Because, instead of the resources growing, you know, as
18 the epidemic has become apparent to everybody else, and
19 that's being spread out so you could have large
20 organizations. You know, it doesn't happen; it doesn't
21 happen, and it's so necessary.

22 I mean, there's an organization in New York,
23 which is called WARN, which is Women AIDS Resource
24 Network, that struggles to survive, struggles, struggles,
25 struggles with the enormous number of women infected. And

1 this not being any resources, given -- it's not a matter
2 of taking away and giving it. It's a matter that they
3 should be as big.

4 MS. MASON: Valli, I'd like to hear you talk
5 a little bit more about the work that you do at GMHC, and
6 what kind of barriers you encountered, you know, in trying
7 to develop program that were geared towards, you know,
8 different kinds of people with AIDS, in particular people
9 of color, poor people, women, kids.

10 MS. KANUHA: I'm no longer associated with
11 GMHC. I'm working at the Hettrick Martin Institute for
12 Gay and Lesbian Youth.

13 You know, I don't know that I have anything
14 more to add from what David has said. I think that
15 there's a very difficult tension in terms of the
16 established AIDS organizations around this country, in
17 terms of, again, their original mission and the
18 communities that really are the foundation of their work.
19 And for many of them, of course, it's the gay male
20 community. I think that what we want is what Maxine said,
21 she said: distribution of resources so that many
22 different communities can develop programs that are
23 appropriate to their, to their culture and their lives.

24 MR. KESSLER: Thank you.

25 Harlon, and then Don.

1 MR. DALTON: Well, I'm sort of torn about
2 pursuing this, in part, because the issue for the day is to
3 try to bring to visibility sexually-identified communities
4 and AIDS. And, also, as I was saying to Belinda in a
5 little note, I think I probably have a reputation at GMHC
6 bashing, which is not real well deserved; but I do want to
7 pursue this for just a moment.

8 David, I was struck very much by this sort
9 of candor and thoughtfulness of your answer to Belinda's
10 question. Something you said, though, stuck in my mind
11 when you said: We made a decision not to serve active
12 drug users because we didn't have, among other reasons, we
13 didn't have the expertise. I was struck because, when
14 this Commission first site visit, we visited Whitman
15 Walker in Washington, D. C., and we were told much the
16 same thing: We don't have monies for people who are drug
17 users because we don't know anything about those problems.
18 And, one answer would be: Well, then, you get people who
19 know something about those problems, or you develop some
20 expertise. That wouldn't be an answer for some other
21 homosexuals, and say: We don't know anything about gay
22 problems; and, therefore -- so that's the sticking point.

23 On the other hand, half of people, half of
24 African-Americans with AIDS, half of the Latinos with
25 AIDS, are men who have sex with other men, and they tend

1 to be very much sort of forgotten and hidden. It could be
2 that the decision is just flatout: Listen, we're going to
3 focus on sexual transmission of this disease, or gay --
4 not that's not a respectable decision. The problem is,
5 though, with saying what the problem is, is that there
6 needs to be greater allocation to other organizations.
7 The problem is: that's not happening, hasn't happened,
8 isn't likely to happen.

9 So, I guess the way to frame the question
10 is: What do you see as sort of the obligation, if any,
11 of those who were first through the door, who partly --
12 largely funded on their own, that is, by their own
13 community. It's not necessarily that that the federal
14 government of the state or the cities are going to lavish
15 money on you; but, nevertheless, who are in a position of
16 having, as you say, eight people in your policy
17 department. This is a conversation that we have all the
18 time with Larry because of AIDS action, and he may want to
19 weigh in on it. But, I guess -- and the answer, it is a
20 respectable answer to say, well, you know, we have a moral
21 obligation, but we have enough to do just dealing with our
22 initial mission. But that's at least the question I'd
23 like to hear.

24 MR. BARR: One piece of the answer is -- I
25 don't think that the answer is -- I've been there since

1 August.

2 (Laughter.)

3 It's not enough to me. I mean, that answer
4 just isn't enough. I think -- one of the ways that we are
5 attempting to deal with it -- I don't think we can become
6 a drug treatment service organization. It's too big, it's
7 taking on a whole other piece of work that we really are
8 not well equipped to do.

9 But what we are equipped to do, and we've
10 just -- actually, we're bringing somebody on staff in the
11 policy department in the next week who is going to look at
12 substance use and harm-reduction issues. And what he is
13 going to focus on is looking at all of the ways the drug
14 treatment is provided in New York City, help to advocate
15 for more drug treatment, and look at the HIV-related
16 issues that come up there, and provide those drug centers
17 with HIV expertise, which is what we have; and, in
18 reverse, bring to us some of the substance use issues that
19 will affect, you know, our clients.

20 We have a lot of clients in recovery, gay,
21 straight, you know. So that's one way that we're trying
22 to like make an inroad with this. Because, it's like to
23 take the expertise, it's to learn as much as we can about
24 the issues and see how it affects what we do, and to also
25 bring our expertise outside and help them, and to work on

1 creating more services. Again, it's still not enough, but
2 it's one piece.

3 We also have come out publicly in favor of
4 needle exchange programs and other harm reduction
5 activities, and have actually helped to fund the needle
6 exchange program in New York City.

7 MR. DALTON: Don, did you want to say
8 something about this before I ask the question?

9 MR. KESSLER: No, I don't think I can add
10 much to that. Except that it is an ongoing dilemma and
11 it's because, in my case, we may possibly do serve people
12 who are active addicts. I may mean, however, that we will
13 have to cap clients sooner than later, and then that will
14 become a problem across all communities. Because no one
15 else in the city wanted to serve active addicts. We did
16 do it, but it will probably, within the next year, that
17 active addicts, gay men, people of color, will have to go
18 on a waiting list because we can only do so much for so
19 many at one time. GMHC also had to do that in spite of
20 limiting populations.

21 MR. GOLDMAN: I have a question.

22 In preparing for this hearing and reviewing
23 some of the materials, it is clear that there is a long
24 historical, well, let anybody use the word, but let's say
25 not necessarily a good relationship between the gay and

1 lesbian community on the one hand, and the medical
2 community on the other hand.

3 My question to you is: How has that
4 impacted on -- how do you look at the future and how
5 things ought to be, given AIDS and what we now know about
6 AIDS and HIV infection, and has that less-than-happy
7 relationship been good or bad? Should it be improved?
8 How has the community responded? I was wondering if any
9 of you would want to comment on the issue in general,
10 particularly looking from the perspective of how things
11 ought to be down the road, in the future, rather than
12 focusing on the past?

13 MR. BONENBERG: If I could comment?

14 I think, actually, it's interesting. I
15 don't think that there has been, at least in California, I
16 don't think there was a traditional hostility between the
17 lesbian and gay community and the medical community. I
18 don't think there has been particularly a hostile
19 relationship. I think that, to some degree, the medical
20 community, at least medical people I work , are not used
21 to be criticized at all. Within in the lesbian and gay
22 community, there is such intense criticism within the
23 community just to connect the contact between the two
24 groups led the medical community to believe that they were
25 being severely criticized or attacked. I don't think that

1 was so.

2 Remember, at least within California, there
3 was already openly identified gay physicians, who
4 immediately took on patients, who were immediately
5 regarded as heroes very early in the epidemic. Then,
6 there were the researchers who were the allies to the
7 activists, going in lobbying elected officials, whom were
8 funding. I think, by and large -- and, of course, with
9 LaRouche and Dannemeyer initiatives, it was the medical
10 community that moved forward, almost alone, in support of
11 the lesbian and gay community to defeat the civil rights
12 attacks. I think, in this state, there is a very high
13 regard for the medical community, and certainly for
14 specific medical practitioners who were regarded as heroes
15 within the community.

16 It is interesting to often have a discussion
17 where people are responding to what they consider to be
18 general attacks, or great concerns. I think the medical
19 community, however, has had a sense of political naivete
20 that, if they could just be left alone to run the
21 epidemic, there wouldn't be these problems, and why were
22 gay activists interfering. I think it was clearly shown
23 that they, the medical community, was underestimating the
24 threat coming from the far right. The gay and lesbian
25 community were correctly anticipating it. At some point,

1 the medical community said: Gee! There really is
2 quarantine on the ballot. I guess they weren't -- I guess
3 there were some civil rights concerns after all.

4 I would think that what will occur in the
5 future, what should occur in the future, is a
6 strengthening of that connection. One of the places that
7 connection will occur is lesbian and gay, openly lesbian
8 and gay physicians and researchers, and certainly openly
9 HIV-positive physicians and researchers, and those
10 people, I think, will again serve as the bridge between
11 the two different communities.

12 But, I must reiterate, I disagree with the
13 historical assumption that there's been animosity between
14 the two communities. At least in California, I don't
15 think that's been the case.

16 MR. BOYCE: Being from the Midwest, I have a
17 different perspective. Being an African-American, I have
18 a different perspective, and I must say this.

19 That for African-Americans to go to the
20 doctor, and, if they haven't been shot, they don't go.
21 So, having a good relationship with a doctor is something
22 new -- Okay?

23 (Laughter.)

24 I must say that, you know. African-American
25 gay men don't go to doctors. You know, it's just

1 something we don't do culturally. You have to be very
2 middle class and trained to go to doctors. It's the last
3 priority. You know, it's nothing that you wake up and
4 say, "I need to go to the doctor." Also, if you go to a
5 black doctor, he's liable to be homophobic.

6 So, what we have done, as a community, is to
7 respond to the epidemic, we have actually went out and
8 trained black nurses, who will be the first person you
9 see, who will give you an attitude and you won't want to
10 go back. We've learned to sensitize them about issues of
11 sexuality and AIDS. These are the sorts of projects that
12 were funded through Howard University.

13 There has been several things that we have
14 done as a community. When I say "denial," it is a real
15 factor in our community. We deny everything that we can't
16 cope with; and AIDS, we definitely can't cope with.

17 So, we are working. We want to respond and
18 we want to do a better job. We have some great ideas. I
19 think that, if we could be given the proper funding to
20 follow through on projects, we could make it. That has
21 nothing to do with GMHC and large group. That has to do
22 with our rights, as human beings, living in this society,
23 that pay taxes, don't get a fair share of our tax dollar.
24 And that's not to take from their group, but to advocate
25 for more of our rights.

1 Health care is not a given in this society.
2 I wouldn't be alive to day if I didn't have a
3 compassionate doctor, and learned how to hustle to get to
4 a doctor, too. I had to use my street skills to get
5 there. And it's very important that we realize that
6 health care is just not the same. Even if you have a job
7 in the country, health care is not the same. It requires
8 a lot of care to manage HIV. It requires a lot of
9 treatments to manager HIV. They're expensive for
10 everyone. And if you have money, eventually, you will be
11 broke.

12 So, it's something that we need to look at:
13 why we need this extra help and this extra support,
14 because our communities are not accustomed to facilitating
15 doctors, making decisions around health care. So, we are
16 running seminars to inform people -- this is a community
17 response; no federal dollars -- seminars to inform people
18 about clinical trials so that they would know how to
19 access clinical trials. A lot of one-on-one education
20 goes on in our community because that's the way we learn;
21 that's the way we learn best, one on one. When those
22 programs are not acknowledged, when those programs are
23 under funded, and those programs are left to fall to the
24 wayside because they might not have the management skills
25 necessary to run a project, instead of supporting that

1 project's management aspect, that project is usually
2 closed.

3 So, we have to realize that we do have some
4 deficiencies we need to work on, but we also need a lot
5 more support. Because, we come from a culture that is
6 different. We must acknowledge how diverse America is.

7 MR. DAVIS: I would like to focus on what
8 Jerome was saying, because I have to leave and miss your
9 next session on policy.

10 I think one of the big issues is the
11 question of funding service for the community of color.
12 That's where the numbers are greatly increased. I know in
13 LA County, where Black and Latino persons represented
14 something like 20-some percent of the cases five years
15 ago, they are now pretty close to 40-some of the cases.
16 In terms of women and babies in the black community, in
17 the Latino community, those numbers are increasing and the
18 largest numbers.

19 And it is some of the problem, hearing
20 agencies talk about nine people in policy, when I don't
21 have nine people I can put on the street to do health
22 education. That's how I educate the homeless people in
23 LA. It's not by TV, it's not by ads. They don't see
24 those things. Their priorities are immediate problems.
25 It's a matter, also, that they don't have money for

1 condoms. That's not in their budget.

2 The other problem is: a lot of community-
3 based organizations, like ours, the Minority AIDS Project,
4 right now, we can't even afford to accept more money, even
5 if you gave it to us, because most of your contracts
6 require us to pay the money upfront, and then get
7 reimbursed; and, a lot of times, we wait two and three
8 months to be reimbursed. And the monies that we raised,
9 in terms of fund raisers, like our Coming Home for Friends
10 last year, we spent \$65,000 of monies given to us through
11 donations and fund raisers to feed people, to house
12 people, because no other programs do that.

13 In the Latino community, they can't get
14 Social Security, general aid Social Security. Who is
15 going to pay their rent?

16 Those are the issues that we're dealing
17 with.

18 MR. KESSLER: Jose, I will give you the last
19 work, and then --

20 MR. PEREZ: I just wanted to voice a concern
21 that, I'm -- the fact that a lot of doctors, because of
22 homophobia and AIDS-phobia, don't shy away from AIDS.
23 This is especially important in the Latino community in
24 East Los Angeles, where we don't have, you know, doctors
25 who are knowledgeable about HIV, for detection, or

1 intervention, or anything. And programs, such as the USC
2 AIDS Training Center, have tried to train doctors, and
3 they have a hard time keeping them there, for many
4 reasons: economic and time, and also there is a lot of
5 homophobia and AIDS-phobia. And, in Los Angeles, 80
6 percent of all Latinos with AIDS are homosexual/bisexual,
7 and they know that, and they know that that's what they
8 are going to deal with.

9 So, I mean, AIDS Project Los Angeles, and,
10 ultimately, East Los Angeles Health Care Corporation, who
11 serves Latinos, we're working to find a way to bring in
12 third-party payments, and the USC Training Program, and
13 everybody, so that we can get some of these doctors to
14 stick to it and give them some sexuality training, and
15 stuff, and in the HIV training, and they will be ready to
16 respond to their community as it happens. But I have a
17 strong feeling that a lot of people that are getting AIDS
18 now, gay men of color, women, et cetera, aren't going to
19 be comfortable in traveling to West Los Angeles or the
20 Valley to see doctors in that area.

21 MR. KESSLER: Well, thank you very, very
22 much, all of you.

23 We will take a break and resume at 3:05.

24 (Whereupon, a brief recess was taken.)

25 MR. KESSLER: This afternoon's session will

1 be on the topic of "Sexuality, HIV and Government Policy."
2 The order of presentations will be: Tim McFeeley; Carmen
3 Vasquez; Dan Bross; Miguel Gomez; and Tim Offutt.

4 We will start with you Mr. McFeeley.

5 Sexuality, HIV and Government Policy

6 Daniel Bross

Miguel Gomez

7 Tim McFeeley

Tim Offutt

8 Carmen Vasquez, M. S. Ed.

9 MR. MC FEELEY: Thank you, Mr. Kessler.

10 DR. OSBORN: This is a high-class --

11 MR. MC FEELEY: Larry is a high-class kind
12 of guy.

13 Thank you all very much.

14 My name is Tim McFeeley. I am the executive
15 director of the Human Rights Campaign Fund. Through
16 lobbying, political activity and constituent education and
17 mobilization, the Human Rights Campaign Fund has a mission
18 to secure legislation and policies at the national level
19 that protect the health, safety and civil rights of
20 lesbian and gay Americans.

21 It's certainly a privilege to testify before
22 this commission, and I appreciate the opportunity to do
23 so. I'd like to take a moment just to commend the
24 Commission Staff for its fine preparations for these
25 hearings. I'm really impressed. Thank you.

1 We've heard, earlier, how American society
2 thinks about sex, sexuality and sexually-identified
3 communities. We've also had the benefit of testimony from
4 leaders of the lesbian, gay and bisexual communities, and
5 learned how these communities have responded to the HIV
6 epidemic. Let me also say it's a privilege for me to be a
7 member of that community.

8 At this time, at this place, the 1980s and
9 '90s, in the United States of America, I'm really proud to
10 be a member of the gay, lesbian and bisexual community in
11 terms of all they're doing, in terms of the safety, civil
12 rights and the health of our community.

13 Just as the American society denies the
14 natural existence of homosexuality and bisexuality, most
15 Americans continue to deny the existence of AIDS, the
16 threat of HIV, and the inadequate public health response
17 to the epidemic, a full decade after the first identified
18 and reported case. And although, today, the Commission is
19 focused on the nexus of society's views towards sexuality
20 and our national response to AIDS, I'm compelled to note
21 that a similar denial reflex operates, with respect to
22 racism and sexism in America, that also profoundly affects
23 our lack of response to AIDS.

24 This attitude of denial pervades the
25 government's response to both lesbian and gay civil rights

1 issues and to AIDS policy. Society's denial of the
2 natural existence of homosexuality and bisexuality results
3 in the view that an individual chooses a particular
4 lifestyle, rather than has a particular sexual status.
5 Flowing from that view is the notion that choices have
6 moral, religious and personal consequences that are the
7 responsibility of the person making the choice. And, as a
8 result, society, as a whole, and its government, take no
9 responsibility for the consequences of these choices.

10 In the civil rights arena, the combination
11 of denial and irresponsibility by our society means that
12 America benignly accepts discrimination, allowing
13 employers to fire people, for example, because they are
14 lesbians or gay men, and often promotes discrimination, as
15 in the case of the irrational Defense Department policy
16 that excludes gay and lesbian Americans from serving in
17 the Armed Forces.

18 In the arena of health care, the denial,
19 irresponsibility syndrome produces an acceptance of HIV
20 infection among gay men, while we hear our national
21 leaders make distinctions between "innocent victims of
22 AIDS," generally infants and those infected by blood
23 product, and the rest of the HIV universe. Because
24 Americans still see HIV disease as the consequence of
25 choice, they do not feel morally responsible for its

1 devastation. Unlike polio, tuberculosis, or influenza,
2 all infectious diseases that have been controlled by our
3 public health system, and which provoked a sense of
4 communal responsibility and empathy with those unfortunate
5 who have become infected, HIV disease provokes a hostile
6 reaction for those who have the disease and towards those
7 who are gay and are therefore more likely to contract the
8 virus.

9 Obviously, as Commissioners, generously
10 donating your time and energy toward the effort to improve
11 our national response to the HIV epidemic, you are all
12 individuals who have taken a large measure of
13 responsibility. The general problem, then, is to replace
14 denial with acceptance, and to substitute responsibility
15 for blame. Let me note a couple of specific examples that
16 we at the Human Rights Campaign Fund have experienced:

17 The most glaring is, perhaps, the censorship
18 of educational and preventive efforts directed at gay men.
19 By denying that men have sex with other men, and that the
20 use of condoms and other sage sex practices can slow down
21 the spread of HIV, Congress and the administration
22 condemned thousands to die. Similarly, the denial of
23 teenage sexuality, both gay and straight, prevents the
24 government from helping schools and other agencies to
25 provide condoms, and instructions in their use, to kids

1 who will die as a result. Also, every time an AIDS
2 authorization or appropriation bill is debated, we are
3 obliged to fight people who would deny clean needle
4 programs, or even simply the distribution of bleach to
5 disinfect needles, in order to maintain the fiction that
6 addiction involved choice, and that giving people clean
7 needles encourages drug abuse.

8 What kind of irresponsible, irrational
9 morality is operating in opposing simple public health
10 policies to contain viral infection? Often, the
11 opposition is led by the presumptive morale leaders of our
12 society, such as the archbishops and TV evangelicals, who
13 promote a public morality that is grounded in denial and
14 results in death.

15 Confronted by a society that denies the
16 natural existence of homosexuals and bisexuals, and that
17 takes no responsibility to control the viruses that
18 afflict them, referring, instead, to blame the victims, it
19 is understandable that the gay community is terrified,
20 angry and demoralized. While community oases have been
21 discovered to do what they can to stop the spread of AIDS
22 and to care for those living with the disease, the public
23 panorama for all HIV-infected people, and especially for
24 gay men, is a desert of denial and resulting devastation.

25 What is needed is education not only about

1 HIV itself, and how it is spread and how it can be
2 detected and treated, but massive education about the
3 topics we've discussed today. We need to shock America
4 out of its state of denial. Whether they like it or not,
5 Americans need to know that men have sex with men, that
6 women have sex with women, that some men and women have
7 sex with both men and women, that teenagers have sex, and
8 that people will not stop having sex; but they can be
9 taught to have safe sex. Whether they like it or not,
10 America needs to wake up to the fact that intravenous drug
11 use is a fact of life in the United States, and that clean
12 needles are better than dirty needles. There are many
13 facts that Americans must know. Our enemy is ignorance,
14 and demagogues that thrive on ignorance and fear.

15 I, and the people I represent at the Human
16 Rights Campaign Fund, believe in education, change and
17 progress. I know that the Commissioners and your staff
18 do, as well. Americans are quick studies. They can learn
19 fast. Please, please, give them the facts about sexuality
20 and about AIDS and all of us, not just the gay, lesbian
21 and bisexual community, but all us, would be much better
22 off.

23 Thank you.

24 00000000000000MR. KESSLER: Thank you, Tim.

25 Carmen Vasquez.

1 MS. VASQUEZ: Thank you, Commissioners and
2 staff for arranging this day.

3 I am Carmen Vasquez, and I am the
4 coordinator of lesbian and gay health services in the City
5 and County of San Francisco.

6 Before I start, I'm going to promote a book.
7 It's by John Emilio and Estelle Friedman, "Intimate
8 Matters, a history of sexuality in America." Any policy
9 maker, any educator, anybody who cares about this topic,
10 needs to read this book. I brought it today because their
11 introduction includes -- has a quote from a song by Cole
12 Porter:

13 "In golden days, a glimpse of stocking was
14 looked on as something shocking, and now,
15 God knows!, anything goes."

16 That was 1934, and Cole was an optimistic
17 sort of guy.

18 (Laughter.)

19 Because, the fact of the matter is, that,
20 you know, the progression of sexual liberation, which a
21 lot of us wants to think is on this sort of line that goes
22 up, in fact, is not on a line that goes up; that it goes
23 up and down, and sometimes gets buried, depending on the
24 economic conditions of the country, the status of the
25 family, and a whole lot of other things that I don't need

1 to get into here.

2 There's a lot that's been addressed today
3 that I'm probably going to repeat. But, before I do that,
4 I want to try and summarize what I have heard, at least,
5 as two essential messages that most of the people on the
6 panels today have been trying to deliver.

7 One is, that the effective prevention,
8 surveillance and treatment for HIV is not possible; it is
9 not possible without an affirmative challenge to the
10 sexual mores of our society and broad, broad promotion of
11 education on human sexuality, all human sexuality.

12 The other thing that we've been saying is,
13 that, effective prevention, surveillance and treatment for
14 HIV is not possible without government policies that
15 affirm, facilitate and protect the empowerment and civil
16 rights of lesbians, gay men, bisexuals and communities of
17 color in this county.

18 Without those two pieces being in place, I
19 assure you that the possibility for this country to really
20 make an indent into the spread of HIV is going to be
21 significantly affected for the worse.

22 When I was invited to speak, I remarked to
23 -- and I'm sorry, I don't remember who it was that made
24 the actual invitation; but I said to him: Perhaps nothing
25 is more American than wanting sex, dreaming about sex,

1 commercializing sex, selling sex, idealizing sex, and
2 never, never, never talking about sex. And I really
3 believe that. It's not just in the Latino community of
4 the black community, or in communities of color, but it's
5 also true in white suburban communities.

6 I'm sure that there have been people before
7 you, or that you've been at hearings where folks have come
8 up and talked about the outrage of sex education in the
9 schools, talked about the outrage of erotic art of any
10 sexual orientation, against the distribution of condoms,
11 et cetera, et cetera. And, what I want to emphasize is
12 that, you know, American attitudes toward sexuality, such
13 as the host, they exist; but, at the same time as those
14 people are saying those kinds of things, their kids are at
15 home masturbating to Playboy or Penthouse, getting
16 pregnant at 15, and getting gonorrhoea at 16. There is an
17 enormous gulf between what people say that they want in
18 terms of a morality about sexuality, and what they really
19 do.

20 We have a very schizophrenic attitude about
21 sex. We say it's sacred, we say it's evil. We say it's
22 romantic, we say it's trash. Sex sells everything from
23 mouth wash to cars. You know, people tell their kids you
24 are not even to think about sexuality because it's bad, or
25 it will get you in trouble; and, then, you know, they have

1 their kids sit through the family hour and watch those
2 gorgeous bare chested men selling clothes, or terribly
3 sexy women that are stroking red cars. Sex is everywhere
4 and sex is taboo.

5 You know, I obviously don't have time to get
6 into why read the book, and I'm not going to get myself in
7 trouble by blaming the puritans or the Catholics; but
8 there is an historical basis to the sexual mores that
9 dominate our society and that rule government policy.
10 Some of it is not off the wall either. When a society,
11 ages and ages ago, didn't expect to live past 35 years, it
12 kind of made sense to promote reproduction. When we knew
13 of no way of curing syphilis, it made sense to kind of,
14 you know, tell people that they shouldn't be having sex
15 with anybody. And we might have kept Mozart around a lot
16 longer if we could treat syphilis.

17 But those material bases for the kind of
18 sexual mores that exist today, and that government policy
19 is still based on, don't exist anymore. A woman doesn't
20 have to get, you know, near 500 miles of man to get
21 pregnant anymore. People don't have to, you know, die of
22 syphilis. People don't have to die of gonorrhoea, and
23 people don't have to die of AIDS. That's just a fact.
24 The unfortunate reality is that our scientific and
25 technological progress is way, way, way, way ahead of our

1 social evolution and of the sexual mores that dominate our
2 society.

3 So, you say, well, why is it that we remain
4 so ambivalent, and why do we cling to values and myths
5 that have no logical basis in material reality? You know,
6 again, that's another lecture, and I haven't got the time
7 to deliver.

8 I think the important point about what I'm
9 trying to say in terms of sexual mores, government
10 policies, and historical basis for them, is: the
11 governments, our governments, ancient governments,
12 governments all over the world, different types of
13 societies, have always had an interest in regulating
14 sexuality and controlling reproduction, in codifying
15 sexual mores that will hopefully keep people from getting
16 diseases that will kill them. In our society, we haven't
17 reached the point where we have understood that the people
18 who make government policy, that the educators in our
19 country, that people who are parents, that just about
20 anybody in this country, is not immune, is not immune to
21 those sexual mores and to what they dictate to us about
22 our openness and sexuality.

23 In the case of -- you know, that's sad but
24 true. In the case of AIDS, that's tragic and true. That
25 we have had over 100,000, over 110,000 people die of a

1 disease that is entirely preventable is tragic. That
2 government policy makers bow to pressure from conservative
3 constituents, who don't want sex education in schools, who
4 don't want condoms distributed in jails or schools or
5 advertised on television, or even talked about -- for
6 God's sake! -- because government policy makers don't want
7 to deal with their own fears, with their own mads, with
8 their own outdated, irrelevant, useless and often
9 hypocritical sexual mores. I think that we should not
10 mince words, we should not mince words, when we advocate
11 for what will prevent AIDS.

12 These are the kinds of things that I think
13 we must be willing to on the record as saying. Get over,
14 get over sexual mores that don't work and have no meaning
15 in our society anymore, or be responsible for the
16 continuing death toll of HIV in our society. We can't
17 contain the spread of AIDS without talking about sex. We
18 can't talk about sex without understanding and confronting
19 those deeply embedded and contradictory messages that we
20 all have received about sex and sexuality.

21 I honestly believe that no one, no one, no
22 program in this country, should receive funding for AIDS
23 prevention without also receiving resources to address the
24 issue of sexuality as a central component of their
25 programs: Sex, in all its wonderful possibilities, and

1 sex, in all its sordid possibilities. But, before that
2 kind of policy can be created, government policy makers
3 need to stop being so squeamish about a human activity
4 that they engage in, and love to engage in. They need to
5 accept the reality of what has been repeated here many
6 times today: that there are men and women, in all
7 communities, who will never, never, never, never say I am
8 a homosexual. I am a lesbian, I'm gay, I'm bisexual,
9 because they fear the condemnation of society, because
10 they fear losing their jobs, because they fear losing
11 their kids. And, still, those people regularly,
12 sometimes, often engage in high-risk sexual activity with
13 other men, with other women.

14 They need to accept the reality that
15 adolescents are hormones on legs, and they want sex, look
16 for sex, will have sex, no matter what. The school board,
17 their parents, their teachers, their ministers, or anybody
18 else, has to say about it. They need to accept the
19 reality of bisexuality for both sexes, of lesbians who
20 sleep with men at high risk, of intravenous drug users who
21 will shoot up with any needle available and who also have
22 a sexual life.

23 The bottom line is: If we are interested in
24 saving lives, then, government policy on HIV has to be
25 guided by an awareness and an appreciation for the

1 centrality and significance of sex in all our lives, all
2 of our lives, no matter how tenacious our tendency may be
3 to want to silence it.

4 And, we need to understand that training --
5 I mean, training is not all that difficult. I do
6 training. I do training on human sexuality for health
7 department staff. There are African-Americans that come
8 to those trainings, Asians, Latinos, heterosexual people,
9 lesbian and gay people, bisexual people, clerks,
10 psychiatric social workers, M. D.s, nurses, all kinds of
11 people come to these trainings. The trainings are
12 explicit. I wish -- we should have shown some films we
13 here today. Because, if you want to convey the message
14 that sexuality is human, and that sexuality is something
15 that we all engage in, and that sexuality is fun and a
16 natural part of who we are, you've got to talk about it,
17 you've to show it.

18 I think that every health department in this
19 country has an obligation, if it's serious about
20 curtailing the spread of HIV disease, to have human
21 sexuality training for it's workers. You can't expect a
22 doctor, or a nurse, or a psychiatrist, or an ambulance
23 driver, whose only sense of what it is to be gay comes
24 from the kinds of scripted messages that we receive in our
25 society -- those schizophrenic kinds of mores I talked

1 about -- to be able to treat someone with AIDS in a humane
2 fashion if they've never had a chance to talk to a person
3 who is gay, if they've never had a chance to see what
4 human sexuality of different kinds looks like, if they've
5 never had a chance to read about, if they've never had a
6 chance to be in a room where all of those different kinds
7 of people can sit and have dialogue with each other, and
8 deal with each other as human beings.

9 There are models for training that exist.
10 They should be promoted. They should be promoted widely.

11 I want to just finish by saying that this
12 Commission, in my opinion, can make no greater
13 contribution to the struggle against HIV than to take a
14 strong, unequivocal position on the need for sex education
15 in the schools and in public health settings, and the need
16 for providing all human service workers, all educators,
17 and all policy makers with that kind of empowerment and
18 training.

19 I will end with that, and thank you again
20 for the time.

21 MR. KESSLER: Thank you.

22 Dan Bross.

23 MR. BROSS: Good afternoon.

24 My name is Dan Bross. I am the executive
25 director of the AIDS Action Council in Washington.

1 To coin, or to pick up on a phrase that
2 Commissioner Goldman used earlier, I think this morning,
3 we work on trying to affect behavior change among members
4 of the House and Senate in Washington. We represent in
5 Washington some 500 community-based AIDS service
6 organizations throughout the United States.

7 This is my second appearance before the
8 Commission. I was reminded this morning that really the
9 first time I appeared was actually before I started my
10 job. I have been in this job now for seven and a half
11 months, and I've come to the conclusion that, when you're
12 working at least for a national organization, I think,
13 probably, with a community-based organization, too, each
14 month probably equates into a year in sort of normal work,
15 if you will. But I appreciate having the opportunity to
16 come here today. I really appreciate the Commission and
17 the staff of the Commission for having the vision and the
18 foresight to hold this hearing, which I think addressed
19 many of the critical issues that our government continues
20 to wish to ignore.

21 When I was thinking about how to present my
22 comments today, I decided that probably a journey looking
23 back over some of the experiences I have had, since I
24 became involved in AIDS activities and in gay and lesbian
25 issues, would provide you with some insight on some of the

1 issues that we need to discuss.

2 I want to take you back to 1984. In 1984, I
3 was working in the private sector for an energy company in
4 Houston, Texas. I was manager of public affairs. While I
5 pinstripe suit on today, there were some differences
6 between today and 1984. In 1984, I was a gay man, but I
7 was safely hiding in my pinstripe suit and behind my white
8 shirt and tie. When, suddenly, in the corporate setting,
9 I was asked to work on a city ordinance in Houston that I
10 felt cut to the very heart of what I considered to be
11 basic human rights. And that ordinance was an ordinance
12 that prohibited discrimination in employment based on
13 sexual orientation. Unfortunately, the ordinance passed,
14 but it was certainly the best thing that happened to me,
15 because I came to terms with who I was and what I was, and
16 what I believed in, and what I felt was important.

17 Following that experience in 1984, I moved
18 quickly to remove some of the contradictions and
19 incongruities between my personal and professional life
20 and moved to California, where I had the opportunity in
21 1986, in July 1986, to work on the No on 64 Campaign, a
22 referendum that Paul Bonenberg referred to earlier. It
23 was a statewide campaign organized and funded and staffed,
24 in large part, by members of the gay and lesbian
25 community. It was a campaign to defeat a referendum

1 sponsored by supporters of Lyndon LaRouche that would have
2 required mandatory testing, reporting, and quarantine of
3 HIV-positive individuals.

4 I'm reminded, or sort of been reflecting
5 over the past few months to back in 1986, in that ballot
6 initiative, that referendum, we were talking then about
7 many of the same issued that we are still talking about
8 today in the context of the infected health care worker:
9 talking about mandatory reporting, mandatory testing.
10 It's sort of ironic that, while a number of years have
11 come between 1986 and 1981, we really are still focusing
12 on a lot of the fundamental issues that we were talking
13 about back then.

14 In 1987, I moved to Washington and worked
15 for the first time in my work in AIDS. I got to take a
16 proactive position, rather than a reactive position. I
17 went to work for Whitman Walker Clinic. Jerome was
18 talking about, on the last panel, where black gay men
19 don't go to the doctor, or black men don't go to the
20 doctor.

21 Whitman Walker Clinic, as some of you are
22 probably aware, was formed back in the early '70s. It was
23 formed before AIDS as a gay health clinic. I was
24 thinking, when Jerome was speaking, one of the reasons
25 Whitman Walker was formed was because I think a lot of gay

1 men had two doctors. They had a doctor that they went to
2 for colds and broken arms and poor eyesight, and that sort
3 of thing; but, then, they had the doctor that they sort of
4 went to for the unacceptable things, like sexually-
5 transmitted diseases. Whitman Walker Clinic, and a number
6 of other gay clinics, formed throughout the country in
7 response to that concern and that fear and that distrust
8 within the gay community of public health officials and of
9 the medical community.

10 And I hate to keep telling you where I went
11 to work next, but I joined David and Val, actually, at Gay
12 Men's Health Crisis in New York City. I mention that
13 because I think it's important to look at Gay Men's Health
14 Crisis and recognize the name. Gay Men's Health Crisis
15 was an organization, as the name implies, that was founded
16 to respond to a health crisis in the gay community. It
17 was founded by members of the gay community because
18 nothing else was being done to address a health crisis
19 that was killing their friends and their loved ones. It
20 was founded by a group of men who recognized and reacted
21 to a crisis long before the government was willing to
22 acknowledge it, or certainly act in responding to that
23 crisis.

24 In September of 1990, I became executive
25 director of AIDS Action Council. As some of you know,

1 that was formed back in 1984, again, by leaders in the gay
2 community who understood the importance of advocacy and
3 who experienced first hand the federal government's
4 unwillingness to address a national health epidemic.
5 That's all I'm going to bore you with sort of my personal
6 resume.

7 In reflecting on where the government is in
8 terms of responding to issues of sexuality and HIV
9 epidemic, I want to echo something that David said in the
10 last panel, and that is: We are ten years into an
11 epidemic and we still have a government which will not
12 discuss it openly. We are ten years into an epidemic
13 that has killed over a hundred thousand people in this
14 country, and we have a government that chooses to talk
15 about other issues that are safer to discuss. Because, in
16 this country, as Carmen just said, we have problems
17 talking about sexuality. Until our government is willing
18 to address head on a lot of the underlying issues
19 regarding HIV infection, we are going to have to continue
20 to face a difficult time in coming to terms and adequately
21 addressing the epidemic.

22 The second point I want to make is: the
23 government can't react to the AIDS epidemic, I feel, in
24 large part, because who is getting sick. First, it was
25 gay men; then, we moved to IV drug users. We are talking

1 about poor people. We are talking about disenfranchised
2 segments of society. I've often commented to friends:
3 Can any of us sit here and imagine or visualize for a
4 minute what would have happened, what our government
5 response would be, if AIDS would have first affected
6 junior leaguers? I'm sure we would not have a National
7 Commission on AIDS because the government would have
8 responded by this time and the work would have been done.
9 There would have been billions of dollars committed to
10 fighting the epidemic, but the disease didn't strike
11 junior leaguers. It struck first in this country gay men.

12 AIDS Action Council, while formed in 1984, I
13 think has really sort of come into its own over the past
14 few years. One of the reasons AIDS Action Counsel has
15 been successful is because an issue that I'd like to talk
16 about and refer to as inclusiveness.

17 AIDS Action Council, back in 1987, was
18 involved in a group in Washington called The Second Monday
19 Coalition, which has since become the NORA Coalition. It
20 is because of that coalition that our federal government
21 has been able to deal with some comfort with issues
22 surrounding AIDS and the HIV epidemic. The NORA Coalition
23 has brought together over a 150 national organizations,
24 including the Human Rights Campaign Fund, in addressing
25 the AIDS epidemic in a way that is less threatening to a

1 number of our elected officials.

2 You take the NORA coalition as sort of, if
3 you will, the mainstreaming of the AIDS epidemic, and add
4 on to that the very effective and fine advocacy work done
5 by ACT UP, and we are a powerful coalition that covers the
6 spectrum of sort of political ideology in this country.
7 And it's becoming increasingly difficult for elected
8 officials, both within the administration and on Capitol
9 Hill, to ignore us. They can't go out on the streets
10 because ACT UP will make sure their lives are miserable,
11 and they find some of us in the halls of Congress making
12 their life miserable.

13 A lot of people in Congress, who have been
14 our most vocal opponents, are people who look at the AIDS
15 epidemic as we against them. Bad people got AIDS; good
16 people don't get AIDS. The concept of otherness.

17 We have been successful -- "we," AIDS
18 advocates, and I include all of us in this room as AIDS
19 advocates -- we have been successful because we have
20 ignored that we-versus-them mind set, and, rather, have
21 fought that, combated that, with the issue or the idea of
22 inclusiveness. It is absolutely essential, if we are to
23 be successful in getting our government to devote the
24 resources that we need to fight this epidemic, that we
25 continue to broaden the coalition of groups who are

1 willing to speak out and become involved in the HIV
2 epidemic.

3 I will close with one comment. I was
4 talking to a Maureen during the last break, and I had
5 faxed from the office in Washington today an article that
6 appeared in The Washington Post. We were talking about --
7 the article talks about the amount of money that the
8 appropriations committees are going to be dealing with,
9 over a whole range of domestic issues.

10 I was thinking, I mean, we're talking about
11 dividing a very small pot of money across a range of
12 issues and the domestic agenda that deal with health,
13 education, housing. When is this country, when is our
14 government, going to understand that the domestic
15 infrastructure, the needs of our people are being ignored?
16 When are we, as advocates, as individuals, when are we
17 going to stand up and say we demand more money for the
18 domestic programs in this country? I think the AIDS
19 epidemic, it goes without saying we all agree, we need
20 more money to effectively fight the AIDS epidemic. But we
21 need more money to fight a whole range of domestic issues.
22 It is essential that, in addressing AIDS, we do not lose
23 sight of the other issues on the domestic agenda that
24 continue to be ignored. And while we have been successful
25 the past few months talking about the need for more money

1 for the domestic agenda, we cannot lose sight of the money
2 specifically within the domestic agenda, but we need to
3 fight the AIDS epidemic, also.

4 Thank you.

5 MR. KESSLER: Thank you, Dan.

6 Miguel Gomez.

7 MR. GOMEZ: Is there another commissioner
8 with us now?

9 MR. KESSLER: No.

10 MR. GOMEZ: It was just someone sitting in
11 someone else's seat, that's all. Sorry. Don't know all
12 the commissioners by face. I was hoping there was another
13 one.

14 (Laughter.)

15 Well, I've only had one other opportunity to
16 talk to all you, and I wanted as many as possible.

17 Actually, what I want to do, because I have
18 spoken to you before, is: I want to thank you. This is
19 landmark. Having this hearing on this issue is landmark.
20 You have also landmarked in, especially -- I come from the
21 Hispanic community, the Latino community, and your effort
22 to look at the issue of HIV disease in the Hispanic Latino
23 community, and in particular, how it impacts the Puerto
24 Rican community, has been a great deal of help to my
25 community.

1 I work with the National Council of LaRaza,
2 which is in Washington, D. C., which represents Hispanic
3 community-based organizations throughout the entire
4 country. The agency -- and I think it's important to know
5 about the agency. Actually, for about three years, I
6 worked at AIDS Action Council, and I actually worked at
7 the campaign fund. So, checkered past. I like the AIDS
8 business.

9 What is important about the NCLR is that two
10 and a half weeks ago, we were in the president of Mexico's
11 palace talking about free trade. But on Cinco de Mayo, we
12 were in the streets with the Salvadorian community, trying
13 to help negotiate the problems with the riots in
14 Washington. So, I come from an agency that I think is
15 very diverse and invested in the Hispanic community.

16 What I'm going to talk about in five minutes
17 is sexuality, HIV disease, and impact on policy. And I'll
18 try to come up with some ideas, or highlight some
19 solutions.

20 One of the things I think is absolutely
21 amazing is the harmony of this meeting. If you were to
22 take the transcript from this meeting, I'd swear it would
23 be a guide for the nongay community, to the gay community.
24 I mean -- and, then, of course, I'd ask the commissioners
25 to read it twice, reinforcement for that behavior change.

1 (Laughter.)

2 But, looking at the -- not to be flip; but
3 actually, it is real important.

4 We talked a lot about sexual identities.
5 Well, as a self-identified gay man, that is just part of
6 the spectrum, as many people told you this morning, in
7 the Hispanic community. But you must look at the
8 diversity, the full spectrum.

9 Pepper talked about a study of the farm
10 worker community that engaged in same-sex sexual activity,
11 but don't identify as bisexual. Many self-identified
12 Latino gay men live in three worlds: the Hispanic
13 community, the Latino gay community, and then the dominant
14 white culture. In the Hispanic community, there is
15 tremendous norms and pressures to not identify with the
16 gay lesbian community, and there is clearly the
17 differences. When it was talked about earlier this
18 morning about the difference between behaviors and
19 identifying -- and David, I thought it was wonderful when
20 you talked about having your lover's mother and your
21 mother talking about their support. In my family, I am
22 told constantly that they will pay for the wedding.

23 The Hispanic culture, the No. 1 problem in
24 the Hispanic Culture is gay identification. Lesbian
25 identification is a No. 1 negative. Homophobia, I

1 believe, from my experience, is our No. 1 curtails -- it
2 curtails us from contributing to the management of the HIV
3 disease. When I spoke to the Commission in March -- when
4 I spoke to the Commission in March -- we have staff
5 meetings at the National Council of La Raza, and there
6 about 5 people at a table like this. When I sit at the
7 staff meetings -- I'm going to speak on Hispanic issues in
8 March in Chicago. My office colleagues applauded. I was
9 stunned, but I was very proud.

10 When I -- last Monday at our staff meetings,
11 I said I was going to San Francisco and talk about gay and
12 lesbian issues. There was no applause, and I had to
13 document why I came here. I am also quite proud of my
14 agency for telling me that you should go. Homophobia is
15 rampant.

16 Also, there is an emerging change. The fact
17 that the largest national Hispanic organization did send
18 me. At our annual conference, we have receptions for the
19 lesbian and gay community. And there is an emerging
20 national Latino lesbian and gay organization called LLEGO,
21 which has been around, working with groups in the Latino
22 community for over ten years. I'll make sure you all get
23 flyers on this agency.

24 But, real, real important is the stigma is
25 damning to a my own community. Women have had to take the

1 lead, like Eunice. In the Hispanic community, because
2 they have not been stigmatized, that perhaps they may be
3 gay, or they have another reason for working on the
4 epidemic, a woman had to bear the brunt on setting policy.
5 And it is real, real important.

6 Health care workers in our community, our
7 doctors in LA -- we have many, many doctors: but very few
8 are willing to work on this epidemic because of the
9 stigma. They don't want to be identified with working
10 with that community.

11 HIV in our community -- Jerome, you said it
12 beautifully in Detroit -- it's an issue of economics and
13 access to help, No. 1. In the Hispanic community, we are
14 working for and we have economic issues. We don't have
15 two doctors. And the epidemic, as you know, is
16 disproportionately affecting our community. And that's
17 important when you are looking at policy. And the
18 education campaigns have to be looked at, because, for
19 many of us, we feel that they have failed, especially for
20 the Hispanic community. And education has to target both
21 partners, which has been talked about before. Also, the
22 lesbian Latino community, real important.

23 One thing that is also scary, which I know
24 goes into other realms, one of the things we've done in
25 the Hispanic community is, we've encouraged Latino women

1 to talk to their partners about safer sex. The CDC goes
2 around telling us that has caused increased violence
3 against women.

4 But, policies -- Okay? Miguel's solutions,
5 ideas and thoughts.

6 I said homophobia was the No. 1 problem.
7 The Latino community, they have to put self-identified gay
8 and women up front: but they also have policies against
9 discrimination, and they have to follow through on those
10 policies.

11 AIDS service organization, which primarily
12 are run by the Anglo community, have to look at issues of
13 racism. Valli, at an early panel, discussed this issue
14 when she said actually put them on call, I believe. But
15 the real important issues -- David talked about Gay Men's
16 Health Crisis. They did some very good things. They
17 looked at their policies about hiring minorities, and also
18 the way in which they trained to be effective. When
19 Dalton asked his question, how do we answer these
20 questions? Well, everyone can't serve everybody, but we
21 can share our resources. Gay Men's Health Crisis can help
22 support minority organizations, teach them how to work
23 that money game in both the private and public sector.
24 There are ways definitely to work together.

25 The PWAs, who end up being under utilized,

1 is astounding to me. In the Hispanic community, there is
2 a tremendous amount of discrimination. But I often find,
3 in my own community, saying: Is there anyone representing
4 the people living with AIDS? I will often get the
5 question, Why?

6 Also, when it comes to federal money, I
7 think, as Dan said, in NORA Coalition, which he was
8 referencing, was inclusive. I think it needs to expand
9 its inclusiveness and reevaluate that issue, real
10 important. Was really proud to see the coalition,
11 recently and actually with Don Goldman's help, and the
12 Commission staff, look at the issue of immigration and
13 HIV. But, for the Hispanic community and the Anglo-gay
14 community, we had two issues: one was immigrants trying
15 to seek residency in this county: the other was travelers.
16 And there were two issues, but we were able to work the
17 Hill together.

18 Other issues: We need to make sure we start
19 spending money on paying to evaluate what we're doing,
20 enforcing that to know what works and doesn't work. We've
21 said over and over again, we don't know who -- we know
22 that sex sells cars, but we don't know what sex -- how to
23 talk about behavior change within our own community and
24 evaluating what works and doesn't work. We have a lot of
25 research even in the Hispanic community, but it's

1 inadequate.

2 In addition, the Commission, which, again, I
3 would like to laud for your ability to outreach. You are
4 not like many other federally-identified entities. But I
5 also think -- you summoned, throughout this country, to
6 the territories, people to come and speak in front of you.
7 I think that you can also challenge us, when you put out
8 your report, to make sure that we carry the message that
9 you can say. I think it is definitely a two-way street.
10 I know that, in the future, you'll be putting out
11 comprehensive reports, or series of reports: and I am sure
12 that you will continue, when doing those reports, look at
13 the impact on the communities.

14 Thank you very much.

15 MR. KESSLER: Thank you, Miguel.

16 Tim Offutt.

17 MR. OFFUTT: Good afternoon, Commissioners.

18 My name is Tim Offutt. I am currently the
19 minority initiative coordinator for the Department of
20 Public Health AIDS Office here in San Francisco, and also
21 the assistant branch chief for prevention for San
22 Francisco. So, I am sitting in a very unique position in
23 terms of talking about public policy. Because not only
24 are we, as a local agency, or government agency, I should
25 say, victimized by federal policy: but we then have to

1 victimize, to some degree, our local CDOs in that we have
2 to interpret and implement those policies.

3 As everybody else seems to have said, the
4 fact that the HIV epidemic began in the gay/bisexual
5 community, and, to a lesser degree, the IV drug users, has
6 a profound impact in terms of how government policy makers
7 have responded to this epidemic, or not responded, as the
8 case may be. A decade ago, the medical community was very
9 slow to even consider the incidence of pneumocystis
10 pneumonia, and other rare diseases, in otherwise healthy
11 individuals as something to be alarmed about: and, if they
12 were concerned, it was from a purely scientific
13 perspective. Because, after all, these individuals were
14 "members of fringe populations." They were not perceived
15 as part of the mainstream, and, therefore, of little
16 consequence and concern. That perception and that feeling
17 has continued, to some degree, to shape how this country
18 has responded to this epidemic.

19 Having worked for a number of years as the
20 executive director of a community-based organization, I
21 know firsthand the difficulty of trying to do explicit
22 AIDS and sex education in communities using federal
23 dollars. We still have to deal with the Helms Amendment.
24 We still have to deal with community standards committee.
25 We still have to convince our funders to see that being

1 explicit, for example, in the gay and bisexual community
2 is the most effective and culturally competent approach to
3 providing education to that community.

4 So, the implications of how policy has been
5 formulated in response to this disease, as others have
6 said, have served to hamper and not to assist us in terms
7 of trying to educate targeted populations, at-risk
8 populations, and the general community, with regard to HIV
9 infection. This is not to say that there hasn't been some
10 level of progress in the past ten years; because, clearly,
11 there has been. There certainly has not been enough.

12 One has to wonder if, for example, a middle-
13 America young man named Ryan White hadn't been so publicly
14 seen as a symbol of the ravages of HIV, if we would have
15 seen the kind of legislation, such as the Kennedy Care
16 Bill coming out of Congress, if we would have seen the
17 kinds of money -- even though it hasn't been sufficient --
18 allocated to providing services, particularly in the
19 under-served communities. I think we need to be real
20 clear about the fact that those under-served communities
21 were under-served communities prior to the advent of HIV.
22 It has been the policy of this country not to provide
23 universal access to health care, particularly in poor
24 communities. HIV has simply impacted and compounded the
25 problem. So, the monies, which were made available as a

1 result of Ryan White, while they are greatly accepted,
2 still fall far short of what is needed in those
3 communities who have historically lacked the
4 infrastructure resourced to provide adequate health care.

5 I really don't want to be redundant in terms
6 of what other people have said because, you know, I've
7 written this wonderful speech and it's pretty much been
8 covered by about everybody else. But I do want to point
9 out that, if we want agencies to be effective, and I'm
10 speaking primarily of gay-sensitive, gay-dedicated
11 agencies, who are going to be providing AIDS education,
12 then, we need to look at those policies emanating out of
13 Washington, emanating out of Atlanta in the CDC, which
14 restrict the kinds of programs that these organizations
15 can provide to their target populations using federal
16 funds.

17 Thank you.

18 MR. KESSLER: Thank you all. We have about
19 five or ten minutes for comments from the commissioners or
20 others around the table.

21 Anybody -- Eunice.

22 MS. DIAZ: The last two panels have not
23 specifically addressed any efforts that your agencies may
24 have regarding the protection of civil rights related to
25 AIDS discrimination. I really would like to know -- I

1 certainly know GMHC has that, but I would like to ask any
2 of current panelists, and past panelists, if you could
3 tell us, specifically to communities of color, if your
4 agency has any effort or interest.

5 MR. BOYCE: I'm with Project Survival in
6 Detroit. From our very beginning, we started to work on
7 legal issues. I took it upon myself to go to Chicago to
8 address some legal issues and find out about a client that
9 I had, who needed an operation, and he couldn't get the
10 operation because of his blood. No doctor wanted to work
11 with him. So, he had a heart problem. This is something
12 that no one wanted to deal with so I knew that we had a
13 legal challenge. Out of that, we found a doctor, who was
14 able to treat him, and he didn't need the operation.

15 That taught me, right then, that the system
16 set up, the infrastructure for AIDS legal referrals, just
17 wasn't happening in the Midwest. So, we got a task force
18 together and we have a group now that addresses all legal
19 issues. This was a community response. We worked in
20 cooperation with a couple organizations that would be
21 called mainstream, and they wrote a few grants targeting
22 money for the development of that. It is all basically
23 volunteer.

24 So, I think the community has responded just
25 out of sheer necessity. Most of us have a civil rights

1 background. I grew up in the '60s. So, you know, we had
2 to do things about it. It was something that was a part
3 of our culture.

4 Legal issues are something that a lot of
5 poor people are very uncomfortable with, because we don't
6 have a lot of experience in hiring attorneys. I
7 personally went through problems with attorneys trying to
8 deal with tax problems and property tax. I was told that,
9 if I didn't have \$300 the attorney didn't want to deal
10 with me.

11 So, I knew, as a person living with HIV,
12 that legal issues are real important to your survival, and
13 it's a tool. I don't see a national commitment in people
14 of color to address that. It happened in Detroit. I'm
15 very happy about that. I would like to see it happen
16 nationally in all communities of color because we don't
17 have a legal remedy, often.

18 MS. WOLFE: Maybe I can say something about
19 two different things that we've worked on in ACT UP, and
20 with other groups in New York City that deal with
21 discrimination issues. One has to do with federal housing
22 projects.

23 The Brashee (phonetic) Decision, which
24 allowed coinhabitants to keep an apartment, though it
25 dealt with gay couples, as well as other people, does not

1 extend to housing run by the New York City Housing
2 Authority projects that were federally funded. We worked
3 with, our housing committee, worked on some actions, and
4 then with some people, to confront changing those rules,
5 using the particular case of two Latino gay men, one who
6 died and his lover was going to be thrown out -- very
7 often people forget that, you know, we are living in
8 housing projects, too. so that's one issue.

9 The other one that we've been working on has
10 been a lawsuit against Health and Human Services about the
11 definition of AIDS and the fact that poor people, women,
12 intravenous drug users, are being discriminated against,
13 by virtue of the way that AIDS has been defined and the
14 kinds of disability benefits that they've been able to get
15 or not get, depending on that. And that's a suit that's
16 being brought by Mobilization for Legal Services that
17 people in ACT UP have been working on, by giving
18 information about all these issues. They represent people
19 who cannot afford legal services and it runs the gamut;
20 and, of course, in New York City, because of the
21 relationship between institutional racism and poverty, a
22 lot of those people are people of color. They are also
23 gay people, they are intravenous drug users, they are
24 heterosexual women, lesbian women; it's quite broad.

25 So, there are a lot of discrimination issues

1 that we are still fighting everyday.

2 MS. VASQUEZ: There is one, for me, one of
3 the biggest discrimination questions has to do with
4 immigration status, and whether or not a person has an HIV
5 waiver. If you are not a documented legal, whatever it is
6 that people say, this country, the possibilities that, or
7 the likelihood that you are going to seek medical care,
8 are very, very, very, very low.

9 In San Francisco, there is not a whole lot
10 of work that I see that's proactive in terms of HIV and
11 immigration issues. But there are immigrant rights
12 organizations that are doing work on the issues, and they
13 are organizations that are terribly strapped in terms of
14 funding that will provide legal advice to people who are
15 HIV-positive and are not legal immigrants of this country.

16 MR. KESSLER: Dan, and then, Charles
17 Konigsberg.

18 MR. BROSS: Just two quick points.

19 As you will recall, last summer, Congress
20 passed and the president signed the Americans With
21 Disabilities Act. AIDS Action Council and MEAR and the
22 American Civil Liberties Union are involved in an
23 educational outreach program now, and working specifically
24 with targeted members of the minority communities,
25 educating both employees and employers, as to their rights

1 and responsibilities under that legislation.

2 Picking up on what Carmen was just saying
3 about immigration, again, coalitions is sort of a key in
4 Washington, and working on the immigration issue, the AIDS
5 community was part of the larger immigration coalition in
6 Washington, making sure that Health and Human Services got
7 the kind of input that they needed in looking at that
8 issue. We are continuing to work with them and see what
9 might happen on Capitol Hill in trying to address that
10 issue again.

11 MR. KESSLER: Charles.

12 DR. KONIGSBERG: This has been one session
13 where I've not been the only voice from the Midwest.
14 We've had several people refer to it. It's been very
15 reassuring.

16 DR. OSBORN: Charlie, I keep trying to tell
17 you Michigan is in the Middle West, too.

18 DR. KONIGSBERG: That's true, Jean. That's
19 true. You're absolutely right. I'm not sure what the
20 Middle West is. Maybe we're trying to think about
21 attitudes a little bit.

22 Let me try to broaden this title just a
23 little bit, sexuality, HIV and government policy, and try
24 to get this panel to thinking back, just a little bit, to
25 some of the testimony we had earlier on the larger

1 question of sexuality and government policy. Let me give
2 you a tale from Kansas, specifically, but it could be any
3 state, really.

4 There is an organization known as Right to
5 Life. It's an interesting title. And one thing I do not
6 want to do is broaden the conversation to the abortion
7 issue. But, when you talk about, when we talk about how
8 government policy on a sexually-related issues comes
9 about, in our state -- which is not a particularly mean-
10 spirited state, not a lot of really nasty things that
11 come out of there are the things we have to fight off --
12 we are a state that has made a fairly serious commitment
13 of state money to prenatal care; but no state dollars to
14 supplement the federal dollars for family planning. This
15 is a direct result not of the poverty of our state, or
16 inability to put some money in family planning; but, in
17 fact, is related to the political influence that the
18 right-to-life groups have on the elected officials. This
19 has not yet spilled over into AIDS. But it has spilled
20 over into attempts to get family planning services and
21 counseling to teens, and we watch this kind of play out in
22 the legislature. What happens is that, much of what is
23 done either is ineffective and very little is being done.
24 So, I think we need to kind of look at that broader issue
25 and how this relates to HIV.

1 MR. KESSLER: Scott.

2 REV. ALLEN: I've heard several people give
3 statistics on the hate crimes that happen across the
4 country, but I'm curious about how the bill is being
5 played out, that was passed, the Hate Crimes Bill, and the
6 enforcement level, and some of you folks may have some
7 information on that, the documentation. I just don't even
8 know what the status is of it. I thought maybe you all
9 would have a handle on something like that.

10 DR. HILL: Well, in terms of New York State,
11 the Hate Crimes Bill has not been passed. It passed in
12 the Assembly. In the State Senate, it has been tied up in
13 committee. We're active, in collaboration with a number
14 of community-based organizations, to try and lobby for it.
15 I'm very proud to say that the gay and lesbian community
16 has really taken the lead. Unfortunately, for some state
17 senators in New York, who view our community as being
18 dispensable, that has been problematic. I don't know in
19 terms of-- the Federal Hate Crimes Statistics Act does, in
20 fact, include violence against lesbians and gay men, and
21 it is basically documentation; and, at least in New York
22 City, the Bias Unit of the New York City Police Department
23 has adopted them in total, with some encouragement from
24 the lesbian and gay community. Basically, it broadens the
25 definition of bias so that, essentially what will happen

1 is that we will see a rising statistic in terms of bias
2 violence. But, just in terms of New York State, it has
3 not been passed.

4 REV. ALLEN: In other words, rather than
5 enforcement, the implementation, how is it being
6 implemented structurally through the country? Is it
7 accurate documentation or not?

8 MR. MC FEELEY: I can't really say that the
9 implementation has taken hold yet. I think the progress
10 is racial. It wasn't for the -- if it wasn't for,
11 frankly, the gay and lesbian community monitoring that,
12 specifically the National Gay and Lesbian Task Force and
13 their violence project, making sure that the Justice
14 Department, and various agencies, federal crime
15 enforcement agencies, were doing that, I think it would
16 just drop by the wayside. It is kicking in slowly. We do
17 know that various agencies reported and it is
18 statistically being documented now that the gay and
19 lesbian community is the most physically bashed community
20 in the United States.

21 To quantify that further, I mean, and then
22 to formulate some sort of prophylactic policies, or for
23 some source of education programs to try to prevent that,
24 I think is something that really has been left to the
25 local governments. In some places, it's good; in some

1 places, it's bad.

2 While I have the mic, I also wanted to make
3 one point. There is a piece of federal legislation
4 pending right now that we all need to weigh in on. It's
5 the Civil Rights Act of 1991, which broadens the remedies,
6 or at least takes the remedies back to where they were
7 before some very restrictive court decisions over the last
8 five years. The Human Rights Campaign Fund, along with
9 other civil rights organizations, has that on the top of
10 its agenda not only because it's the right thing for all
11 of us, in terms of civil rights, but specifically with
12 respect to the AIDS crisis. It would include people with
13 HIV disease, as disabled people, included now because of
14 the Americans With Disabilities Act, they would be covered
15 under the broader extension of the Civil Rights Act of
16 1991. That's something that is pending right now, and
17 opposed by the president of the United States, I should
18 add for the record, and needs everyone's support

19 MR. KESSLER: Any other --

20 MS. WOLFE: Could I suggest, say something,
21 just to put this into perspective, and I hope you will
22 take this constructively.

23 I think it is really great that we have a
24 Hate Crimes Statistics Act. But, anyone who has been the
25 subject of a hate crime knows it's been going on forever

1 and ever. The way we deter -- we don't pass hate crimes
2 bills. We go and we collect more and more statistics.
3 And, in a way, it's very parallel to the lesbian and gay
4 community. We've been collecting those statistics on our
5 own for years -- Okay? -- which nobody believes because,
6 somehow, we did it, you know. Is it true of other
7 communities? And, instead of implementing programs to
8 deal with it, so much of that is connected with the way
9 that HIV is dealt with, we get more research and more
10 research and more research; and, meanwhile, people are
11 getting bashed on the street and killed, and we still have
12 to prove that a crime was a biased crime. And I think it
13 tells you something about what the attitudes are in this
14 country towards the validity of our experience and what we
15 know about it.

16 And, in terms of New York, I want to say
17 that one of the most amazing things that the New York has
18 been -- the coalition that has been formed around that,
19 has been between the Black and Latino Caucus and lesbian
20 and gay, you know, and progressive people in the
21 legislature. That constantly, the opponents of that bill
22 have tried to convince the Black and Latin Caucus that
23 they should not support sexual orientations, that they can
24 get a hate crimes bill that deals with real hate. And to
25 their credit, the Black and Latin Caucus has consistently

1 supported the lesbian and gay community. And I think that
2 that is another issue of the way we've got to start
3 looking at what is going on.

4 You know, research is great, but we've got
5 to act to save lives, and we've also got to acknowledge
6 where the coalitions are and who is against that
7 coalitioning.

8 MR. KESSLER: Thank you all --

9 MR. BARR: Could we just implore you to take
10 this information and use it and put out a report on it?
11 It's just vital. A report on this would really be helpful
12 for us, and really is crucial.

13 MR. KESSLER: Report on the --

14 MR. BARR: A report on this hearing, and on
15 the issued that we've discussed today.

16 MR. KESSLER: Well, thank you all. We will
17 adjourn for the public part.

18 DR. OSBORN: Let me suggest that those of
19 you who have the time and want to stay comfortably where
20 you are among our panelists, and those who have pressured
21 schedules and knew that we were to finish at 4:30, please
22 don't feel pinned down. But there are four people who
23 have requested the opportunity to make comments. I would
24 ask them to keep their comments to two or three minutes a
25 piece. And, as I say, if you must go, we understand; but

1 I hope that those people will, too. Otherwise, if you
2 just want to just stay comfortably --

3 The first person who has requested the time
4 to speak is Louise Alvarez Martinez. Perhaps if you could
5 come to whichever of the microphones is most convenient
6 and make your brief comments.

7 Public Comment Period

8 MS. MARTINEZ: First, I would like to begin
9 by giving a very strong criticism of the outreach and
10 publicity that has not been done in letting the public
11 know about these hearings. I found out about it, because
12 I have an excellent network, just last Thursday. When I
13 started calling around to see who would be coming, no one
14 knew about it.

15 So, I really want to stress that we need to
16 know that these are happening. The communities affected
17 must be a part of these hearings. Our concerns must be
18 heard. It must be open process. The opportunity to
19 personally address the National Commission on AIDS is very
20 rare. I just really want to stress that.

21 I wasn't able to be here for most of the day
22 because of that. I had other commitments that I had to
23 keep. So, I may be repeating some things that have
24 already been brought up, but I don't think that's going to
25 hurt anything.

1 Latina women are being infected through
2 sexual transmission by Latino men. There needs to be more
3 reaching out and education of our community. Hidden
4 bisexuality of Mexican-American and Puerto Rican men is
5 common. Our communities collude in keeping this a secret
6 -- not only our communities; but, as has been pointed out,
7 all of the United States society. There is a tremendous
8 taboo against homosexuality and bisexuality in the Latino
9 culture. But this cannot be used as an excuse not to
10 reach into our community. We are not impenetrable.

11 Latina women need to be educated, supported
12 and empowered in protecting themselves from HIV infection.
13 Our men are at high risk due to the depressed economic,
14 social and racial climate. Unemployment is increasing and
15 so is drug use. Our migrant population is very much at
16 risk, and outreach needs to be directed to them.
17 Culturally and linguistically appropriate support services
18 need to be developed for women. There needs to be more
19 research on transmission, especially for lesbians. There
20 used to be a notion that lesbians did not transmit or
21 become infected.

22 The bisexually-identified communities AIDS
23 model does not address women's issues. We can no longer
24 be left out of the conduit. We must be the ones to
25 develop the services and outreach to our community. And

1 the bottom line is access to health care. We really don't
2 have that. Of the 37 million that are not insured,
3 Latinos and Latinas represent a large number of that.
4 That's my bottom line.

5 Thank you.

6 DR. OSBORN: Thank you very much, and thank
7 you for taking the extra effort to come.

8 In the context of others who may not have --
9 we did have public announcements, but it's difficult to be
10 as pervasive as we would like. And if there are others
11 that you know who would like to make comments, we would
12 welcome them to write them to us, and we will try and be
13 attentive to the input of that sort.

14 Thank you for coming.

15 The next person is Douglas Serano.

16 MR. SERANO: My name is Douglas Serano. I
17 am the cochair of Gay Asian Pacific Alliance, and the
18 former chair of its HIV Project. I want to thank the
19 Commission for having this hearing.

20 Before I get down to my comments, I want to
21 invite everybody in the room to the Asian and Pacific
22 Islander Hearing tomorrow. Because I really believe that
23 awareness leads to cultural competency and we are serious
24 about talking about cultural competency. We really need
25 to educate ourselves.

1 One of the first things I want to talk about
2 is collaborative efforts. During one of the panels, in
3 terms of the response to HIV, what was absent was the
4 collaborative efforts that are happening within the gay
5 men of color community.

6 In San Francisco, there is a Gay Men of
7 Color Consortium on AIDS that is comprised of four
8 ethnic groups, and they are gay organizations. The reason
9 for it forming is, well, one is, is what Tim McFeeley was
10 talking about: the hostility towards AIDS. But the
11 second reason is because the hostility, because of racial
12 hostility. So, when you combine those two, it really
13 forces gay men of color to support each other in
14 challenging those hostilities.

15 Just down the street, at 625 O'Farrell, is
16 the EACH Program, which is an acronym for Early Advocacy
17 for the Care of HIV. I would encourage the Commission
18 members, and anybody else in the room from out of town, to
19 maybe visit the offices. They are open until 6:00 p.m.
20 and sometimes longer. It's a few blocks down. It also
21 houses Bay Area HIV Support And Education Services, and
22 the National Task Force on AIDS Prevention of the National
23 Association of Black and White Men Together.

24 My point around this is, that, it is really
25 important to fund gay and bisexual community-based

1 organizations addressing AIDS. And I don't think there is
2 too many groups, CBOs, throughout the country, that are
3 gay and bisexual and are directly federally funded. So I
4 really believe that in dealing effectively with the target
5 population, it's important to have people from that target
6 population developing the programs, implementing the
7 programs; and, again, reemphasize funding sexually
8 explicit prevention and education materials.

9 I also want to underscore the necessity to
10 do research, and research which correlates pre-Colonial
11 sexual mores or norms, or indigenous and traditional
12 beliefs, which go hand in hand with western beliefs.
13 Because, in people of color communities, there is an
14 historical basis for why people are acting out the way
15 they do today based on their historical roots.
16 Oftentimes, the traditional and indigenous beliefs go hand
17 in hand or practiced simultaneously with the western
18 beliefs.

19 I want to underscore, also, the need for
20 outreach and preventable outreach programs, developed from
21 the perspective of the target populations. Particularly
22 outreach to gay and bisexual men. In San Francisco, we
23 don't have a program that does that on an ongoing and
24 consistent basis. And also for women and people of color.

25 I am working in AIDS as the California AIDS

1 Intervention Training Center. It was formerly YES, and
2 the City Consortium to Combat AIDS, which was the flagship
3 of NIDA, in terms of dealing with an outreach program, or
4 a model, targeting the IVDU, intravenous drug population.
5 But there really isn't a program like that targeting
6 outreach to gay and bisexual men, and we really, when you
7 look at the statistics, still gay and bisexual men are --
8 particularly on the West Coast -- are, you know, 80 or 900
9 percent of the cases. And, in terms of IDUs and HIV, I
10 think there needs to be more correlation between how
11 government branches dealing with like drug use, NIDA, and
12 dealing with HIV, they need to be more coordinated
13 programs.

14 Lastly, I think, in terms of lobby efforts,
15 we need to reshift our priorities and funding allocations.
16 I was participating in the Life Lobby Day, as well as AIDS
17 Lobby Day, we had in Sacramento May 6. There is a big
18 funding crisis in California. They are projecting a \$13.6
19 billion dollar deficit. And when we look at our
20 legislatures and they look at us, and we, together, we are
21 wondering where this money is coming from. It really
22 needs to come from our federal government, and we really
23 need to shift, reshift, our allocations and our domestic
24 needs.

25 Thank you.

1 DR. OSBORN: Thank you very much.

2 The next person who has asked to speak is
3 Bartholomew Casimir.

4 MR. CASIMIR: My name is Bartholomew
5 Casimir. I am a staff member, actually, I am community
6 liaison for the San Francisco Black Coalition on AIDS, and
7 I am the chair of the PWA San Francisco. I am also on the
8 national board of People With AIDS.

9 What I'd like to introduce to the Commission
10 is a report, a study -- actually it's study that we did.
11 We just finished it in February. How this report came
12 about is, that, a group of us gay black men got together
13 last year and looked at what services were available to us
14 out there. We began to look at agencies that are serving
15 our own colors, which is black gay men. And we looked at
16 the Baby Hunter's Point Foundation, which was the only
17 agency that was receiving money to do education and
18 outreach to men who have sex with men. And, of course, we
19 looked at that wasn't being done. So, we challenged
20 Shirley Gross, who is the executive director of Baby
21 Hunter's Point Foundation to this fact. She appointed,
22 asked us, to do a study or needs assessment. She
23 appointed me chair.

24 So, I'd like to present this to June. I'll
25 bring it over. But one thing I would like to point out in

1 the report that we did is -- which I think is a very, very
2 important component of this report -- the sexual behavior
3 of black men is not simply a predictable from stereotype.
4 Contrary to expectations, black men who identify as
5 heterosexuals and bisexuals, but who have sex with men,
6 are more likely to engage in high-risk sex with other men
7 than those who identify as homosexuals. Though the
8 behavior of hetero and bisexual black men, who have sex
9 with men, is more dangerous, they may perceive themselves
10 to be at lower risk than homosexual black men.

11 A similar misconception is reflected in the
12 belief among Black San Franciscans that gays are clearly
13 at risk for AIDS infection, but they are not sure whether
14 bisexuals are. This is a report done by -- a research
15 done by Polaris, which is headed by Noel Day.

16 Some black people seem to believe that the
17 person's sexual identity is what creates the risk when, in
18 fact, the risk comes from the person's behavior. Clearly,
19 the lives and health and habits of black gay men are
20 inextricably linked to the entire black community. The
21 success or failure of the black community AIDS agenda rest
22 on its ability to serve all black communities.

23 What I would like to do is challenge the
24 Commission today to promote the health and welfare of
25 homosexuality, as I promote myself to you that I am proud

1 to be a black gay man, and I've always been. I am 50-
2 years old, and I don't think I'm ever going to change.
3 I've always had very successful relationships with men and
4 women. My successful relationships have been intimately
5 with men. And this is the way my life has been and I feel
6 I'm very healthy.

7 Each time I do something like this -- I was
8 just thinking the other day that living with HIV infection
9 has been a very, very drastic change in my life. In 1987,
10 when I went to the march in Washington, and when I came
11 back -- I think before I went, my T-cell counts were
12 somewhere around 400; but, since '87, they have been
13 climbing steadily. My last T-cell count was well in the
14 '90s. So, I think, when I do things like this, I increase
15 my T-cell counts at least by one.

16 (Laughter and applause.)

17 Thank you.

18 DR. OSBORN: Thank you very much.

19 And the fourth person who has asked to speak
20 is Lei Chou. I'm sorry if I don't pronounce that
21 properly.

22 MR. CHOU: I just want to make an
23 observation in terms of the event that happened to day.
24 I think this is a room full of group of really cynical
25 people, both presenters and the commissioners, in view of

1 the situation that we have to deal with.

2 I just kept looking at the things that kept
3 us talking, instead of just shutting up. That's why I am
4 presenting tomorrow as one of the presenters, but I
5 thought I would do something on Asian today and impose on
6 you for a few more minutes. Because, AIDS and HIV is
7 something that I devoted my life to and I really think
8 that I'm worth more than five minutes.

9 I will switch into my two-person mode, which
10 I'm very used to doing. I'll be gay today and I'll be
11 Asian tomorrow.

12 To illustrate -- I'm from New York City --
13 to illustrate the crisis that we have in New York City, 80
14 percent of the Asian cases, full-blown AIDS-reported Asian
15 cases, are from men-to-men transmission. And 78 percent
16 of that are people who are first generation immigrants.
17 People who were born in other countries, other than the
18 United States. However, all we have at the Department of
19 Health, one person who does, well, he says, outreach to
20 the Asian Pacific Islander communities. He's Chinese. He
21 name is Kei Fong, which in Cantonese is Fong Kei.
22 Unfortunately, also, means a crazy homosexual. Therefore,
23 every time he goes to a public forum, he feels compelled
24 to mention his girlfriend every chance he gets, and he
25 gets this nervous twitch where he shows off his engagement

1 ring. He's the only person we have.

2 I want also to make a comment about -- I
3 didn't want anybody to walk out of this room and think
4 that there are no gay Asians, with all due respect to
5 Valli. I feel the necessity to identify myself as person
6 of color and almost always use that term. But, three
7 speakers today, when you went down the list, you neglected
8 to mention Asian Pacific Islanders. I don't know what.
9 It might just be self-conscious, but whatever that means.

10 The term "Silence = Death," I think that, to
11 be able to say that, and use that as a slogan, is a
12 privilege, a privilege that I have, a privilege that a lot
13 of immigrant Asian gay men, or men who sleeps with men,
14 don't have. For a lot of us, silence equals survival.
15 Because of the intense family structure that we have, that
16 is completely tied to socioeconomic reasons. If we ever
17 dare to come out as a gay man, he ever even dared to come
18 out as person with AIDS, we will be shut out. We will
19 have no means of making a living. We will have no support
20 system.

21 Therefore, it's been tremendously difficult
22 to organize the gay Asian community, per se, in the New
23 York City area because, for the most part, it's a very
24 recent immigrant area. We have had so much trouble that,
25 for me, personally, I can -- I have a very radical

1 political agenda, and I can say that I chose not to sleep
2 with any white people because the intense racism that I
3 must face. But, when I say that, I am alienating a huge
4 population of people who should be -- who I should be a
5 community with. I don't have the luxury to say what I
6 think should be said and should be done.

7 As a result of that, with Silence =
8 Survival, at the same time, if we don't even have a
9 community, we cannot compete with well-established
10 organizations for the limited funding that we have to deal
11 with, that we have to work with. I just want to like put
12 that point out and for underlining all the other gay men
13 of color have said in terms of privileges, in terms of
14 what you can and cannot do.

15 Thanks.

16 DR. OSBORN: Thank you very much.

17 (Applause.)

18 DR. OSBORN: My thanks and all the thanks of
19 all the commissioners to the people who have just spoken
20 to us, and a very special thanks to the thoughtful input
21 from the panelists who have been working with us all day.
22 I hope we will be able to take good advantage of the
23 insights you have given to us.

24 MS. HYDE: I really have something burning
25 in me to say. So, Dr. Osborn, I appreciate your just

1 letting me have a moment.

2 I hope that, when the Commission sits down
3 to consider what you've heard today, and as you begin to
4 deliberate how you might craft recommendations from
5 today's testimony, you will not allow yourselves to be
6 limited by the policies that have been, and that you will
7 not be limited by what we might call the politics of
8 possibility on Capitol Hill; but, rather, you will sift
9 through and, in good faith, come up with some truth that
10 you want to speak. And, as Miguel said, it will be then
11 other people's jobs to try to take your recommendations
12 and see them through a political process. But that -- I
13 really implore you to be as persistent and persuasive as
14 you can be. And we will, all together, I think, be able
15 to prevail.

16 I also want to thank you for your
17 attentiveness today.

18 DR. OSBORN: I'm going to ask you to make
19 the last comment very quickly, Randy.

20 MR. KLOSE: Welcome to San Francisco, the
21 heartbeat of gay and lesbian America. I would really like
22 to encourage you -- we've talked a lot about sex all day
23 long -- Oh, my God! -- but I would encourage you, as
24 commissioners, to go down to Castro and 18th Street
25 tonight and just walk around. You will see gay and

1 lesbian America. Like you will see book stores, you will
2 see restaurants, you will see bars, you will see theatres,
3 you will see barber shops, just go and -- you like talked
4 about us all day, just go and look at us.

5 So, here are ten copies of the Sentinel, and
6 Castro and 18th is only \$2.65 cab ride.

7 Thank you.

8 DR. OSBORN: Thank you for your welcome.

9 We are adjourned until tomorrow morning.

10 (Whereupon, at 4:50 p.m., the hearing in the
11 above-entitled matter was adjourned, to reconvene at
12 8:30 a.m., Friday, May 17, 1991.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25